

COUNTY OF KAUA'I
Minutes of Meeting
OPEN SESSION

Board/Commission:	Kaua'i Historic Preservation Review Commission	Meeting Date	November 17, 2022
Location	Mo'ikeha 2A/2B with remote access by Zoom Teleconference and Audio Connection	Start of Meeting: 1:30 p.m.	End of Meeting: 2:58 p.m.
Present	Chair Carolyn Larson. Vice Chair Stephen Long (<i>attended by Zoom</i>). Commissioners: James Guerber, Susan Remoaldo and Aubrey Summers (<i>attended by Zoom</i>). Deputy County Attorney Stephen Hall. Planning Department Staff: Director Ka'āina Hull, Planner Marisa Valenciano, Commission Support Clerk Duke Nakamatsu and Commission Support Clerk Kristen Romuar-Cabico (<i>attended by Zoom</i>). Office of Boards and Commissions: Administrator Ellen Ching, and Commission Support Clerk Sandra Muragin.		
Excused	Commissioner Gerald Ida.		
Absent			

SUBJECT	DISCUSSION	ACTION
A. Call To Order	Chair Larson called the meeting to order at 1:30 p.m.	
B. Roll Call	Director Ka'āina Hull verified attendance by roll call and requested a verbal response; Commissioner Guerber replied here. Commissioner Ida was excused. Commissioner Remoaldo replied here. Commissioner Summers replied here. Vice Chair Long replied here. Chair Larson replied present.	Quorum was established with five commissioners present.
C. Approval of the Agenda	Planner Marisa Valenciano requested to move G. Unfinished Business 1. SMK Inc. (ABC Stores) Sueoka Market before E. General Business. Mr. Hull inquired if the amended agenda should be approved. Deputy County Attorney Stephen Hall replied it was not necessary to approve an amended agenda since they were just taking the agenda out of order.	Ms. Remoaldo moved to approve the November 17, 2022 agenda. Ms. Summers seconded the motion. Motion carried 5:0.

SUBJECT	DISCUSSION	ACTION
D. Approval of the Minutes	No minutes to approve.	
F. Communications	No communications.	
G. Unfinished Business	<p>G.1. SMK Inc. (ABC Stores) Sueoka Market Demolition of Accessory Structure and Expansion of the Retail Store Property Address: 5392 Kōloa Road Tax Map Key: (4) 2-8-008:020; (4) 2-8-008:022; (4) 2-8-008:023; (4) 2-8-008:024; (4) 2-8-008:025; (4) 2-8-008:026; (4) 2-8-008:027; (4) 2-8-008:028; (4) 2-8-008:029; (4) 2-8-008:034; (4) 2-8-008:035, Yamada Road and River Road Kōloa, Hawai'i</p> <p>Consider of a Class I Zoning Permit for the proposed demolition of accessory structures and the proposed expansion of the retail store.</p> <p>Mr. Hull announced if anyone in the audience wanted to testify to come forward to the microphone, seeing none he asked if anyone virtually wanted to testify to raise their virtual hand. Ms. Romuar-Cabico verified and confirmed no virtual hand raised.</p> <p>Planner Marisa Valenciano presented a timeline:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • In April the commission approved the proposed precrash condition improvements to the storefront. • In June the second phase focused on demolition of accessory structures and expansion of the retail store. • In October they met at the Kōloa Neighborhood Center and had a site visit and walk through of the property with the architect. They heard public testimony and deferred action on the item. • In October 20, special meeting the applicant transmitted a revised plan set. <p>Ms. Valenciano explained the commission's action for the project was consideration of a Class I</p>	

SUBJECT	DISCUSSION	ACTION
	<p>Zoning Permit for the proposed demolition of accessory structures and expansion of the retail store. The department recommended support of the project as represented with the following recommendations listed on a handout titled Sueoka Recommendations dated November 17, 2022, that listed five recommended conditions of approval. Ms. Valenciano said she consolidated recommendations from previous Director Reports and comments from HHF (Hawai'i Historic Foundation).</p> <p>Architect Grant Sumile and Architect Robyn Pila of ADM Architects presented a power point titled Sueoka Store Preservation & Expansion.</p> <p>After the October site visit Architect Grant Sumile said he met with the owners and addressed the publics and commissions concerns and questions regarding existing storage, new storage, height of the two-story storage structure and lanai. The owners were receptive and cooperative to the changes. He shared the following architectural changes that addressed those concerns;</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Displayed Existing/Demolition Site plan with Existing Photographs: Existing storage labeled 1 to 5 totaled 4,400 square feet. • Displayed Proposed First Floor Plan: New two-story storage 5,700 square feet with an increase of 1,300 square feet in storage or 30% more storage place. <p>Mr. Sumile added that the square footage for the new storage calculations did not include the meat department and deli, which were part of the store interior when they compared the 5,700 square feet of new storage to the 4,400 square feet of existing storage.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Displayed Proposed Site Plan-TMK Map: Existing front and back parking stalls estimated at 53. New parking stalls would total 68, 70 with the two loading stalls. This was an extra 15 customer parking stalls. Architect Robyn Pila said the ordinance required 43 parking stalls. • Displayed Proposed First Floor Plan: First change was removal of deli bump out which was 4 feet 4 inches. Second change was to relocate the lanai seating area against the two-story storage structure to conceal the large wall. • Displayed Proposed Site Plan & First Floor Plan: Third change was relocating the ADA 	

SUBJECT	DISCUSSION	ACTION
	<p>parking stalls to face the lanai and storage structure. This addressed concerns about reversing blindly onto Makai Road. With those changes they were able to add more landscaped areas.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Displayed Three-Dimensional Colored Rendering of the property: Fourth change was to lower the two-story structure roof from a gable roof to a flat roof. The height was now 22 feet 9 inches from 28 feet 7 inches. The first-floor interior ceiling height in the two-story structure was 10 feet 6 inches and the second floor was 9 feet. • Displayed Three-Dimensional Colored Rendering of the property: To address the comment about the lanai structure being too fancy they removed the top louvered windows above the lanai area and replaced with a plain flat roof. This lowered the lanai ceiling height to 9 feet. <p>Mr. Sumile said planners from Bowers + Kubota Consulting were present if the commission wanted to ask them questions, hearing none, Chair Larson asked if the commission had any questions.</p> <p>Questions:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Ms. Remoaldo asked about the back entrance ramp stairs for the ADA parking. Mr. Sumile shared a three-dimensional colored photo and explained that the back entrance to the lanai were not stairs but a gentle slope. • Ms. Remoaldo stated that the path to the entrance would require the ADA person to go around the back of their vehicle onto the main entrance driveway before being able to access the back entrance ramp. She asked if there was sufficient room in front of the ADA parking. Mr. Sumile understood and displayed the Proposed Site Plan-TMK. The ADA parking stalls had a landscaped area in front of the three stalls which they wanted to keep. He could shorten the lanai by removing the benches on the lanai area and create a larger front access area for the ADA stalls. <p>Mr. Guerber suggested creating a sidewalk area in front of the ADA parking stalls. He said Mr. Sumile addressed most of the concerns and asked about the residential home. Mr. Sumile said it was addressed with the owner and they have interested contractors and other entities.</p>	

SUBJECT	DISCUSSION	ACTION
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Chair Larson asked if the green space was grass level to the road and would there be a curb. Mr. Sumile replied the grass would be the same level as the road and there would be no curb. He said during the preparation of the historic application they felt new curbs would contrast with the historic feel of the store and surrounding area. Chair Larson continued a lengthy discussion on why the green space needed to be preserved and suggested a rock wall surrounding all green spaces to preserve it from being ruined by cars and foot traffic. She asked if the other commissioners had any suggestions, no one responded. Mr. Sumile suggested just the grass area at the front of the store to place the rock wall to which Mr. Hull replied that the front area was the recognized historic character, and the Department of Interior Standards would not approve because the rock wall would affect the historical significance and cautioned the commission with its suggestions. He had no concerns with a rock wall in the back area. • Ms. Summers recalled that there would be different landscaping and not just grass. Mr. Sumile showed a conceptual landscape photo of shrubbery along the edge of the grass area in the front with benches. Chair Larson suggested planting bushes to alleviate foot traffic and wear and tear to the grass area. Ms. Remoaldo said there was a low u-shaped rock wall behind building three that they could utilize elsewhere. • Chair Larson started a lengthy conversation on preserving trees that were not part of the property but on privately owned land and to keep as many of the existing trees and plant new trees on the property. Mr. Sumile said the intention was to create a green space with bench seating in the back area and keep the existing greenery that was already there. <p>With no further questions from the commission, Chair Larson asked for assistance on the motion. Ms. Valenciano said the department recommended to support the project as represented with the recommended conditions of approval as provided and any other conditions discussed today. She suggested a motion supporting the project as represented with the following conditions as stated and amended by the department and any other conditions.</p> <p>Deputy County Attorney Stephen Hall said some of the additional conditions were to keep all existing trees, plant new trees, and short rock wall to protect landscaping. Ms. Remoaldo added</p>	

SUBJECT	DISCUSSION	ACTION
	<p>to also include a dedicated space to preserve the history of Sueoka Store. DCA Hall said the commission could motion to support the plan with revised changes and the recommended conditions of approval provided from the director reports, consider a short rock wall in the back area to separate landscaping, keep as many trees as possible and dedicate a space in the building to preserve the history of Sueoka Store.</p> <p>Chair Larson thanked Mr. Sumile and the owners for paying attention to the concerns of the</p>	<p>Mr. Guerber moved to support the SMK Inc. (ABC Stores) Sueoka Market, Demolition of Accessory Structure and Expansion of the Retail Store Property Address: 5392 Kōloa Road, Tax Map Key: (4) 2-8-008:020; (4) 2-8-008:022; (4) 2-8-008:023; (4) 2-8-008:024; (4) 2-8-008:025; (4) 2-8-008:026; (4) 2-8-008:027; (4) 2-8-008:028; (4) 2-8-008:029; (4) 2-8-008:034; (4) 2-8-008:035, Yamada Road and River Road, Kōloa, Hawai'i, with the revised changes and the five recommended conditions of approval from the Director's Report and HHF and consider separating the back landscaped area with a short rock wall, keep as many existing trees on property as possible and dedicate a space in the building to preserve the history of Sueoka Store. Ms. Remoaldo seconded the motion. Motion carried 5:0.</p>

SUBJECT	DISCUSSION	ACTION
	<p>commission and the public.</p> <p>Mr. Long acknowledged and thanked Mr. Sumile's professionalism and sensitivity to the historic nature of Sueoka store and appreciation to the owners for listening to the commission, public and historic foundation.</p> <p>DCA Hall apologized but a motion should have been done earlier to amend the agenda but since that opportunity passed, he said no further action was required.</p>	
<p>E. General Business</p>	<p>1. Discussion of Powers, Duties, and Responsibilities of the Kaua'i Historic Preservation Review Commission</p> <p>Mr. Hull announced if anyone in the audience wanted to testify to come forward to the microphone, seeing none he asked if anyone virtually wanted to testify to raise their virtual hand. Ms. Romuar-Cabico verified no raised virtual hands.</p> <p>DCA Hall presented a power point created last year for training purposes;</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Talked of the history and start of the preservation act of 1966. • Established the Historic Preservation Review Commission • Powers and Duties of the Kaua'i HPRC defined in the Ordinances, Title II, Chapter 2, Article 2-2.9 • Title IV- County Planning and Land Development, Chapter 8, Comprehensive Zoning Ordinance, Sections 8-14.1 through 8.14.5 • 8-14.3 Powers and Duties defined. • 8-14.4 Obligations of meetings <p>DCA Hall recalled last year that then Chair Ida said Kaua'i was the first Certified Local Government in Hawai'i. He explained that KHPRC was an advisory committee and did not have the final say nor any contested case hearings. He said they have a larger role in Federally funded projects that require KHPRC's comments and state projects that request their comments for planning commission. He wanted to discuss Boards and Commissions concept of prejudging which was the practice of some commissioners previewing a building or evaluating a building on</p>	

SUBJECT	DISCUSSION	ACTION
	<p>their own time before the meeting. DCA Hall stated there was nothing wrong with viewing an area for context and to formulate questions if they withheld preference and decision making until after the applicant presented because there was a difference between considering for context and prejudging.</p> <p>DCA Hall asked if the commission had any questions, there was no response.</p> <p>Chair Larson appreciated the training and recommended to develop a series of required basic training modules for new members that would be available online. Mr. Guerber agreed and added they should also have a list of requirements for applicants. Mr. Hull replied the planning department treated each applicant differently and it depended if they had architects and designers or if they were smaller mom and pop buildings with limited resources. Mr. Hull stated their website had a planning level 101 video that explained to the public how planning department worked, how zoning worked and how a setback worked. They have discussed starting a series of videos on several topics for KHPRC and the general public for the website. DCA Hall stated he would work with Ms. Valenciano and Boards and Commissions.</p>	
<p>G. Unfinished Business</p>	<p>G.2. Comment and Hearing on Amendments to the Rules of Practice and Procedure of the Kaua'i Historic Preservation Review Commission (2017) pertaining to Rule 2.17 (a)</p> <p>Mr. Hull asked if anyone from the public wanted to testify on this agenda item, seeing none, he asked if anyone attending online to raise their virtual hand. Ms. Romuar-Cabico verified no raised virtual hands.</p> <p>DCA Hall reminded the commission that six-months ago they initiated a rule change to clean up the language on the disclosure of conflict of interest. The goal was to bring the language in line with the Charter. The commission motioned to move the process forward, but in the interim they added one sentence to the last line, "Any such conflict shall be disclosed to the Board of Ethics in compliance with its rules." The last sentence was to comply with the Charter and Board of Ethics.</p>	<p>Ms. Summers moved to accept the amendment to Rule 2.17 (a) as published, with the addition of one sentence "Any such conflict shall be disclosed</p>

SUBJECT	DISCUSSION	ACTION
		to the Board of Ethics in compliance with its rules.” Mr. Guerber seconded the motion. Motion carried 5:0.
H. New Business	No new business.	
I. Executive Session	<p>I.1. SMK Inc. (ABC Stores) Sueoka Market Demolition of Accessory Structure and Expansion of the Retail Store Property Address: 5392 Kōloa Road Tax Map Key: (4) 2-8-008:020; (4) 2-8-008:022; (4) 2-8-008:023; (4) 2-8-008:024; (4) 2-8-008:025; (4) 2-8-008:026; (4) 2-8-008:027; (4) 2-8-008:028; (4) 2-8-008:029; (4) 2-8-008:034; (4) 2-8-008:035, Yamada Road and River Road Kōloa, Hawai‘i</p> <p>Consider of a Class I Zoning Permit for the proposed demolition of accessory structures and the proposed expansion of the retail store.</p> <p>I.2. Comment and Hearing on Amendments to the Rules of Practice and Procedure of the Kaua‘i Historic Preservation Review Commission (2017) pertaining to Rule 2.17 (a)</p> <p>Mr. Hull stated both agenda items were completed and there was no need for any further discussion in executive session.</p>	
J. Announcements	<p>Ms. Valenciano announced the following;</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. No meeting was planned in December. 2. Emailed information on the National Historic Foundation virtual conference called Fast Forward and sent link. She said to contact her with any questions and to view the link at their own convenience. 3. Welcomed back Commission Support Clerk Sandra Muragin and Deputy County Attorney Stephen Hall’s first in-person meeting. 4. Introduced new Commission Lee Gately who was in the audience. 	

SUBJECT	DISCUSSION	ACTION
	<p>Mr. Gately came forward and had a lengthy discussion with the commissioners and planning department staff.</p> <p>Mr. Hull reminded the commission they would be selecting new officers at next year's meeting.</p>	
K. Selection of Next Meeting Date and Agenda Topics	Next meeting was scheduled for 1:30 p.m. Thursday, January 19, 2023, Regular Meeting	
L. Adjournment	With no further business to conduct, Chair Larson called for a motion to adjourn.	<p>Ms. Remoaldo moved to adjourn the meeting. Mr. Guerber seconded the motion. Motion carried 5:0.</p> <p>Chair Larson adjourned the meeting at 2:58 p.m.</p>

Submitted by: Sandra Muragin
 Sandra M. Muragin, Commission Support Clerk

Reviewed and Approved by: _____
 Carolyn Larson, Chair

- (X) Approved as circulated. 11/16/23
 () Approved with amendments. See minutes of _____ meeting.