

Department of Finance

Honorable Bernard P. Carvalho, Jr.
Honorable Felicia Cowden
Honorable Bill DeCosta
Honorable KipuKai Kuali'i
Honorable Ross Kagawa
Honorable Mel Rapozo

Excused: Honorable Addison Bulosan

The Committee reconvened on April 3, 2023 at 9:00 a.m., and proceeded as follows:

Council Chair Rapozo: Good morning, everyone. We will call the April 3, 2023 budget meeting back to order. We will start off with public testimony. Does anyone in the audience wish to testify?

There being no one present to provide testimony, the meeting proceeded as follows:

Council Chair Rapozo: We will start with the Department of Finance, Kaua'i Humane Society. State your names for the record and give us an overview. I see you have a presentation.

DAN GIOVANNI, Board Chair, Kaua'i Humane Society: Good morning, Councilmembers. I am Dan Giovanni. I am the chairman or president of the board with the Kaua'i Humane Society, and with me today is Nicole Schaefer Crane, and she is our executive director. I would like to thank the Finance Department and the budget team for working with us to pull together the budget presentation for this year. The Humane Society has, what I consider to be a very transparent, open, working relationship with the County. We provide a full service. We also want to thank the Kaua'i Police Department for working with us to get to a scope of work where we can work collaboratively with them to do investigations and enforcement. As you will see from our presentation that it is overwhelmingly, about ¾ of it is for animal care and welfare, about 20% of it is for investigations and enforcement, and the remaining small percentage is for licensing the animals. I am going to turn it over to Nicole.

NICOLE SCHAEFER CRANE, Executive Director, Kaua'i Humane Society: Good morning. If you are reviewing our Fiscal Year (FY) Budget, we can see our sources of funding for our operation and the County gives about 29% in contributions towards it. We are primarily off fundraising, which is our donations, grants, and special events, which I will touch upon a little later. The last two (2) pieces are our program revenue, of which a good portion is our veterinarian services and I will go over that as well, and then our retail revenue, so that is our thrift store, as well as the retail we sell within the shelter.

Here are some of the grants we got for the current FY. They are quite diverse. We have the Orphan Kitten Club, which focuses strictly on neonate kittens, those are eight (8) weeks and under. They have contributed to creating a kitten nursery and also individual medical grants for kittens. We also have Laurence H. Dorcy, which is \$15,000 for operations,

so that covers all lifesaving, and then we get some more specific ones like PetFinder, which is for harnesses that we use for our field trip program, and Petco, PetSmart Access to Care, these are clearly very animal-oriented companies that donate to us, and PetSmart has given us a grant that allowed us to open up the community care center, which I will touch on. We also got the Hawai'i Grant-In-Aid, which is a fairly significant grant from the state and it is strictly for spay and neutering animals to help decrease our pet crisis over population.

Mr. Giovanni: Let me interject. On that one, years passed, we had approached the County for a shot in the arm on spay and neuter of about \$200,000 and it was always tough to bring that in. The state has stepped in and is helping us, so that is the one that we have wanted for about five (5) years.

Ms. Schaefer Crane: We were also very honored that we were the only Humane Society that received the money for spay and neutering this year. In review, this is the only slide that is calendar year and not FY. Our intake is slowly decreasing little by little and we attribute a lot of that to spay and neuter. For instance, our neonate population was about 200 animals less. Our adoptions are staying steady and we give a lot of that effort to our Mission Mainland. Last year we were able to do a private jet that sent quite a few animals to the mainland for adopters and rescues. We were not able to do that this year just due to the financial crush that was needed for that. It was quite more expensive, so we instead did it through just our commercial airlines where you could adopt and then we would send them. We were able to send 131 animals through Mission Mainland II and eighty (80) animals through 2.5. Our spay and neuter surgeries, we are doing over 2,500 a year and that is public and in-house, and so we are constantly every year building more and more on those efforts to decrease unwanted litters, which we are seeing in our neonate kitten populations. Those are kittens that were born that year. Like I said, there is a 200-kitten difference between this year and last year. We were able to open our Community Care Center and this is a service that is strictly for pet owners. Just in the five months we were able to help over 434 pet owners with their over 526 pets, that is a huge effort that we started adding on to our services. We could not do this without our volunteers and fosters who have contributed quite a lot. Our big news, especially from last year was that we were able to purchase the land that our shelter resides on, so we can continue to grow and develop, and we are doing all this while maintaining our live release rate of over 90% allowing us to use the tagline that we are "no kill."

We have been investing a lot in our medical services, like I said we are constantly looking at our spay and neutering efforts, but as well as that Community Care Center. Thanks to the grants and our efforts to promote medical services, we brought on a director of medical operations, which is one of the reasons we were able to grow, because now we have a vet on-site seven (7) days a week, whereas before we were about five (5), so two (2) days without one. When SOS departed our shelter, we were able to reconfigure some of those areas, we created a hospital space, we created an exam area, a waiting room for pet owners, and investing significantly surgical equipment now that we have space for it, as well as items for animals and for pet owners like blood analyzer machine, dental machine, and so much more. Thanks to the PetSmart Charities grants, we were able to add one veterinarian (vet) technician. We are losing that technician as that grant is starting to close, but on the upside

the Grant-In-Aid that Hawai'i offered to assist with spay and neuter is funding a vet technician, so we have been able to increase our staff by one vet technician at no cost. Our Community Care Center is walk-in, no appointments necessary. We are open twice a week, that is Tuesdays and Sundays, and we offer a lot of preventative care primarily which is vaccines, dewormer, tests like heartworm and FIV. We have blood work, ear diagnosis, exams, we do X-rays, we do nail trimmings, and other parts of grooming that are kind of hard to access here on the island. Besides even increasing infrastructure in our medical area, we have been increasing it throughout, so we have been upgrading the transitional housing for community cats, we have updated our alarm system in response to our break. In last year, we have improved our food storage, and our public dog park fencing to make it safer for people who want to bring their dogs to us. We have updated our databases to make reporting more accurate. As mentioned before, we had kitten nursery funding and all this was done through donations and grants, at no cost to the County, and this is in addition to the \$400,000 in upgrades we did last year.

What we are looking for, moving forward is, we are doing a lot with enforcement, so our humane officers responded to over 2,500 calls. Just in the first two (2) quarters of this FY, we resolved over 260 cases, and our livestock cases that we took on this year were significantly higher than expected. The way our livestock enforcement works is we respond to cruelty and neglect cases, we investigate it, and if it does indeed appear to be a cruelty and neglect case, we pass it over to KPD to do the citation and we act as a witness to provide testimony and any evidence collected. On licensing, we licensed almost 1,000 animals so far, and we were able to return 181 animals. We have one of the highest return to owner rates nationwide for our shelter.

With this information, how are we planning our next FY? What we are seeing is, even if our population is decreasing, the length of stay for animals is increasing, which is...puts us still in the same situation as if there were more animals. We are trying to increase our transfers, but there are hurdles to that due to airline restrictions and embargos, so sometimes the places where we send to have winter embargos—it is too cold to send animals and then there are heat embargos, where it is too hot to send animals, so we have a small window to ship animals to the mainland. In addition to this, animal length of stay is becoming a national trend, so shelters across the U.S. are seeing a longer stay, especially for dogs. We have not been able to pinpoint it, we just think it is a culmination of things—an economy that is not sure where it is headed, there are a lot of people that are moving, we are still getting over the pandemic, and some people are changing their lifestyles a lot, so animals are being returned to shelters. We are not seeing a very large return rate, but we do see high owner surrender rates.

Mr. Giovanni: One thing that is troubling to us and not sure what we can do about it is finding...we know housing is difficult for residents here, special rental housing, and pet-friendly rental housing is almost impossible. In fact, in some cases where families have been in rental situations for a while, the rules are changing and they say you must get rid of your pets and they show up on our doorstep. We are seeing this trend. We participated in the forum last Friday, which was for landlords and tried to get the

message out, and we got a pretty good response, but it just seems like a really difficult problem to solve.

Ms. Schaefer Crane: Those same hurdles that we are seeing for pet owners are also what we are seeing for animal care staff. We have quite a bit of turnover and it must do a lot with housing issues and just finding work for more than one individual. It is hard for a person on their own to find housing here and so if they have a family, it can be even more difficult. We have added a part-time Animal Care Technician (ACT) through a grant to just sort of help some consistency while we do have staff turnover. We have significantly increased our employee benefits to try to get staff to work with us and we are seeing some benefits to that, but there are things just outside of our control that make that difficult. We are seeing an increase in danger dogs and livestock cases, but there has been that which requires a greater deal of time to handle on our officers and we are only budgeted for two (2) officers and then one (1) dispatcher. Therefore, what we did is we brought on a part-time officer to assist us with that, and that person primarily does all the after-hours calls, so anything that comes in after 6:00 p.m. and then helps on the weekend too. That helps to keep our officers from burning out and is allowing this part-time officer to have a much more flexible job, she has 3 children at home and she wants to be with them, but she also wants to help the community, so we are working with our staff, too, to meet their needs as well as our own.

Moving into the next FY, we would like to maintain this part-time ACT, the grant funding is running out. It really does help with our staff turnover and it allows a little bit of flexibility, so right now we have a high population in dogs, so we can put that person working with them a little bit later, while the high population in cats, so we can shift them over and they can meet the needs of what our shelter population is. We would also like to maintain this part-time Humane Officer as well. Once again, it is offering a lot of benefits to our new officers coming on. It is hard to fill this position because it is a very niche role, so we do have a vacancy, currently for a full-time position. It is helping and our part-time officer is very knowledgeable, so we really like to keep her onboard. Going on, we are going to continue what we have done this current FY. We are going to do full service, including animal care and welfare, taking care of all the animals that come to us, investigations, and enforcement, and of course our licensing via microchipping. We are going to continue our emphasis on medical operations. We are open admission, which means we take any animal no matter what their breed, size, health condition, our only exception is feral cats and that is for their welfare. With the State grant, we are really pushing spay and neutering this year. It is really the one thing we can do to decrease our cat overpopulation crisis, decrease the quantity of feral cats on our landscape, improve the health of the animals that reside here in Kaua'i, and decrease the strain on the shelter and on pet owners as well, with unwanted litters. Thanks to that grant, we get to maintain that additional vet technician at no cost to the County and will maintain our Community Care Center on Tuesdays and Sundays.

Mr. Giovanni: One thing about the Community Care Center, it is not in competition with private vets, it is a compliment to them and they encourage it. Together, we are after-hours and are here on weekends and pet owners who do not have anywhere else to go come to us, and that is a relief to vets as well. Let me speak about the

unique framework of our county contract. Going back a few years, it was always a struggle at budget time to come to terms and arrive at a scope and place for a county contract. The situation was that going back about five (5) years was we did not even understand our costs that well, and so the County did not understand our costs that well. We thought we were offering services at below our actual cost and many people in the County felt they were overpaying. We committed ourselves to an open book, full transparency. We are a nonprofit organization and it is not our intent to make a profit off of the County, it is providing the services on a nonprofit basis. The first thing we did, working with the Finance Department is a full, open, transparent, let us figure this thing out together, and we did. Guess what, we found out that the right prices are about in the middle. Our actual costs were less than we thought they were and they were a little bit more than the County thought they were. On that basis, we were able to put together a contract that was trusted by both the County and by our operational folks and our finance folks. The second thing we did, and I think it is unique for county contracts, is we built in a "true up" mechanism. For example, every year, we figure out what it is going to take to do the full scope of work and how many people it is going to take, and it is really about positions and vacancies, as Nicole said a moment ago, we suffer with turnover. We have a lot of low-income people that work for us and they are always searching for new jobs and situations, so we do have turnover, we do have vacancies, but it is not our intent to profit from those vacancies. Basically, the way the contract works and we did put in place a 5-year contract three years ago, so this would be the third year of the 5-year contract, all the terms and conditions are already in the contract, but we try to figure out what is the right scope and what is the right price on an annual basis. Depending on now the year unfolds, we tally it all up, we report it all back to the County, and if it turned out we did not require or spend as much money, there is a reimbursement back to the County. The first two (2) years, we reimbursed about \$125,000 back to the County, so the numbers you see at the bottom of the slide are for FY 2021-2022 was the actual cost to do the County contract and that was the actual cost they paid. We do not profit from vacancies. The current year, we are expected to reimburse the County, again, about \$75,000 due to the vacancies and turnovers that we had. Next slide. Looking forward to this, the budget we put forth for FY 2024 is consistent with what the Office of the Mayor has put forth to the Council. As I said in my opening remarks, most of the costs is for animal care. The second column is for the investigations and enforcement. If it involves the animal, we take the lead. If it involves criminality, public health and safety, KPD takes the lead. We do work collaboratively with them. The big difference, in the last two years we have added large livestock to the investigations and as Nicole said, we do the front-end investigation looking for cruelty and neglect. If it looks like it is more involved than that, we bring KPD, but we do not have facilities, unfortunately, to house large livestock animals, so basically, we are cats, dogs, and small animals.

In the third column, it is licensing. If you recall about eighteen (18) months ago, we went from metal tags for licensing to microchipping. Microchipping is a lifetime license as opposed to having to bring your dog or cat back every one (1) or two (2) years. We found that when we were doing the metal licensing, less than 20% of our pets were actually licensed. We are hoping that over time with microchipping that percentage will increase and we are starting to see that already. Just imagine now we do not have to go through that trauma, it is a lower cost and we get better results. The microchipping commitment to licensing is really

paying off and the net cost of that for us to implement looks to be about \$20,000 or less per year. We think in time (inaudible) zero out as we get more and more animals microchipped. That is it.

Ms. Schaefer Crane: To add to that, when we initially passed the microchipping bill, when we were discussing the budget, we said it would decrease each year. We have been holding steady and the only reason we have been doing that is because of the increase in medical services, we are seeing more animals, which is wonderful, but that is why we have not seen that decline yet. With the grants-in-aid that came through with so much benefits with spaying and neutering, each one of those animals has a microchip included in that spay and neuter, if they do not have one. We are actually going to cover the cost this year for any animals that are not fixed. The grants will cover that. Therefore, that will not be a charge for pet owners, if they spay and neuter their animals this year, but that is another reason the budgetary item stayed the same instead of decreasing because we are hoping to see an influx of animals one more time before you will probably start seeing that decrease the year after.

Mr. Giovanni: One more comment on the budget numbers. I mentioned that we have a 5-year contract in place, that has not to exceed value of \$5,500,000. That does not mean we automatically get one-fifth of that every year, so each year we come back with a budget proposal to the Office of the Mayor and to the County Council, and it has been averaging less than \$1,100,000 per year, but this year our target is \$1,100,000. Again, that is prior to any "true up" or reimbursement in the end. With that, we are happy to take any questions.

Council Chair Rapozo: Thank you. Councilmember Kagawa.

Councilmember Kagawa: What is our strategy to help the community with the feral cat overpopulation?

Ms. Schaefer Crane: Since we do not take them in, what we are able to offer the community is spay and neutering to ensure the population does not grow. We can assist with some food allowances to decrease feral cat straying even further, and we put them in contact with other organizations that do focus a little bit more on that, like the Kaua'i Community Cat Project (KCCP).

Mr. Giovanni: Let me add, just this week we signed an agreement with the Kaua'i Community Cat Project who tries to take in feral cats and socialize them. We have a housing that we put on our property, it can house up to 150 cats, so they are going to start bringing...they have already started bringing in their cats that were feral. Our hope is that we can get them into this transitional housing and over time we can socialize with them, and put them back into the adoption program. One thing that we are not doing and we do not feel right for us to do is to be an exterminator, to trap and kill feral cats.

Councilmember Kagawa: If there is a population of people that want to take in feral cats as pets, I think...I was born and raised here for generations, over 90% of our pet

owners are dog owners, in my experiences. There are a few cat owners around. Some of the cat owners who have cats have fifty (50) cats, which becomes a nuisance to your neighbors when you have that many.

Mr. Giovanni:

Yes.

Councilmember Kagawa: Do you know what I mean? People who have dogs and love dogs, maybe they have four (4) or five (5), but I see extremes. I do not see enough feral cat adoption owners on Kaua'i, so why would we spay and neuter when there is no future for them? Then, you have the Shearwaters, right, and those native birds that are being eaten by cats, that do not have pet owners to feed them, and then now we must shut down high school football games at night, because of that. All other types of things that occur, because of a feral cat problem. Why would we spay and neuter, we are going to spend our money for spay and neuter, release them back, and no one will take them in? Even if they do not reproduce, I do not see the value. They are not native, they are not the Nēnē goose, there is no prohibition for putting them to sleep. I mean, no animal should go to sleep, but if they are doing more damage and harm to the human population, I think there is a time and place to put them to sleep.

Ms. Schaefer Crane: I will say that the people that are bringing us feral cats do care about the feral cats that they are looking after, which is why they are spending the money to bring them in to us. What we are seeing is the population that does care about them. At the same time, I agree with where you are at. I think most feral cat advocates or even animal advocates do not want to see necessarily feral cats in areas that put birds at risk. They do understand, and there have been some that have been looking at removing them and placing them in different colonies and trying to assist with that. You all operate with the Predator Control operation and we work closely with them as well, taking in microchipped and friendly cats to find them an opportunity, but you are correct. There are not a lot of people that want a feral cat in their home because feral cats do not want to be with people. The transitional housing allows us an opportunity to see if they are willing to socialize and become adoptable cats and then we are assisting those who are caring for their feral cats and limiting the population from growing, which is...yes, they are not going to clear out the feral cat community in two (2) years, but we will see a decrease in the quantity of cats.

Councilmember Kagawa: The County is giving you \$1,100,000 and I appreciate that we have an animal organization on Kaua'i established, but we are giving you \$1,100,000...in the old days when my dad was the Deputy County Engineer, we had our own cat catcher, and they would bring them to the Humane Society who would put them to sleep. They would leave the cat there for two to three (2-3) days, if no one claimed them, they would put the cat to sleep. That is how we controlled our feral cat population back in the '70s. This is no joke. It was an issue back then in the '70s. Feral cats were ripping folks' garbage open and it became a concern to where we had county dog and cat catchers catch dogs and cats that were a nuisance to the community. They would have a system where after they caught the dog or cat, if you are missing your pet, go to the Hanapēpē Salt Pond Humane Society, check if your pet is there. If they were not there, that would mean the pet is loose someplace

else. There was a process to handle nuisance animals in the community that are not native. I am just thinking why is that service to the community with \$1,100,000 not existent, that we cannot have you folks help with feral cats, you folks cannot help us with feral dogs? What now? We just spay and neuter and we sell pets.

Ms. Schaefer Crane: We do take in all dogs, feral and non-feral. The dogs are always coming to the shelter. Feral cats are the exception and a shelter is also not a place for them to do well. As a welfare society, our job is to ensure that what is happening to animals is in their best interests and in their best welfare. It is nationally known that shelters are places where feral cats deteriorate to the point where they get sick and then must be euthanized over a certain amount of time, and that is not a good standard practice for cats. When we get calls, for example, from people that are having issues with feral cats, there are multiple small businesses here that can assist with that. We are not promoting businesses, but we are allowing people to know of other options that are available on Kaua'i to take care of some of the issues they might be having.

Councilmember Kagawa: I will just close with feral chickens are a big problem too. We must have an animal agency that controls nuisance populations of chickens, and especially cats. Thank you.

Mr. Giovanni: I want to make one comment. It is a very complicated controversial topic and I appreciate where you come from, we hear stories and concerns like this all the time. We try to take a close look at science because last year at the State level there was an effort to put a similar extermination type of a bill forward and it was quite controversial. In the process of doing that, there were a lot of scientific studies that came forward. The question was, what does it take to exterminate or remove the feral cat population versus other ways of doing it? It turns out that you must be 100% removal. You just cannot go to an area and say, "There are one hundred (100) feral cats here, I am going to take twenty-five (25), fifty (50), or seventy-five (75)," you must get all one hundred (100). If you do not get one hundred (100), the ones left will go crazy populating and you are right back to where you started. Why do spay and neutering scientifically look better? It does not give you a solution overnight, but over time, it does stifle the population. That is where we are going.

Councilmember Kagawa: If I can respond, I have seen the spay and neuter theory and I have seen it just get worse, so I do not know. Maybe it is worse either way.

Mr. Giovanni: It is difficult.

Council Chair Rapozo: I have a follow-up. I remember the Humane Society telling us years ago that once a feral is always a feral, you cannot domesticate a feral cat, is that not true?

Ms. Schaefer Crane: What we believe is that every animal has its own personality, as I think if you are a pet owner, you can tell just within your own home that one dog acts differently than another dog and so on and so forth.

Council Chair Rapozo: What does science say?

Ms. Schaefer Crane: The science says that typically if they are under 4 months of age, they have a much higher rate of socialization. As they get older that decreases, so it can become harder to socialize, take more time, or they will reach the point of not being able to socialize.

Council Chair Rapozo: In your transitional housing program, what happens to those feral cats that are brought in that you determine are not...

Ms. Schaefer Crane: That is ultimately a question for the Kaua'i Community Cat project, it is not our program, it is their program, we are just leasing the housing to them. Ultimately, they have checking—in points that they are looking at and looking at the deterioration of animals or the success of the animal in the transitional housing, but you would have to get with them for more specific operations.

Council Chair Rapozo: So, you folks do not have anything to do with that, other than leasing the place?

Mr. Giovanni: We have a little bit to do with it. Let me be really frank about it, it is called transitional housing for a reason, and the reason it is called transitional housing is we did not want that to be a sanctuary for feral cats forever, that could not be domesticated.

Council Chair Rapozo: Okay.

Mr. Giovanni: So, we built into the relationship, into the transactional relationship with them, that on a periodic basis they have to review and evaluate that status of the individual cats. If a cat, to your question Council Chair, is feral, remains feral, and has no hopes of going otherwise, it is incumbent on the Kaua'i Community Cat project to find an outcome for that cat. If they cannot transfer it, euthanasia is on the table, but it is their decision to make.

Council Chair Rapozo: So, the feral cat that cannot be socialized will go into a colony or would it...

Mr. Giovanni: It would either go into a sanctuary, not on our premises, it would either go into a sanctuary or it will have to find some other outcome. Within the scope of outcomes to be considered would be euthanasia.

Council Chair Rapozo: Who makes the decision?

Mr. Giovanni: They do.

Council Chair Rapozo: Okay, so if they say these cats cannot be socialized and they asked the Humane Society...do they perform the euthanasia?

Mr. Giovanni: We can perform it for them.

Council Chair Rapozo: Okay. The grants for the spay and neuter, does that include feral cats?

Ms. Schaefer Crane: It includes any dogs and cats.

Council Chair Rapozo: So, feral as well?

Ms. Schaefer Crane: Yes.

Council Chair Rapozo: Do you charge for that service?

Ms. Schaefer Crane: With this grant, what it allowed us to do is drop the fee, so any animal, dog, or cat, is \$35 to be spayed and neutered. It includes a microchip if they do not have one.

Council Chair Rapozo: Okay. I received an email, he said, "Please reconsider your Council's stand on supporting the treatment of feral cats and your lack of support for the Kaua'i Humane Society." I responded and said, "I did not get the budget yet," I was upset, because we did not receive the budget yet. This Council has never made a statement one way or the other, but I asked him, "Where did you get this information," and he says, "I was told by the Kaua'i Humane Society people that funding was reduced so they are not able to neuter feral cats unless a citizen pays \$50 to have it done."

Ms. Schaefer Crane: Our fee is not based on if it is feral or if it is not. Before the GIA grant went into effect, which was March 1st, our fee for a cat, male or female, was \$50 flat rate. We do not ask people when they make their appointment, everything is done online, they make their own appointments, we do not ask if it is feral or if it is not. We are there just to fix cats and decrease the population, so there is no way we would have known if it was a feral cat or not, but yes, it was a \$50 flat rate fee. I understand that \$50 is a lot, which is why we offer the Spay and Neuter Assistance Program (SNAP) to decrease that cost if they cannot afford it, but I would also say that \$50 does not cover our cost to fix a cat.

Council Chair Rapozo: Hence the grant.

Ms. Schaefer Crane: Yes.

Council Chair Rapozo: That is why we get grants.

Ms. Schaefer Crane: Yes, to supplement...

Council Chair Rapozo: To make sure we can provide this service to the public and make sure we get our objectives met.

Ms. Schaefer Crane: Exactly.

Council Chair Rapozo: Councilmember Cowden.

Councilmember Cowden: I remember the past couple of years, there was a barn cat program, but some of these half feral cats were being shipped to the Midwest, I remember being told about that?

Mr. Giovanni: Remember that?

Councilmember Cowden: Cat die pretty easy there and so these half-feral cats were actually pretty good for that.

Ms. Schaefer Crane: That must have been before my time. During my time we worked with one in California to send barn cats, but ultimately everyone has a lot of feral cats everywhere that they live, and once again, transfer costs are going up, so it is much easier to pull locally than for us to ship a cat all the way to them. We do have certain partners, just currently right now, they do not have the need for us because of their local populations.

Councilmember Cowden: The Kaua'i Community Cat project, they do a free spay and neuter, is that correct?

Ms. Schaefer Crane: They have a spay and neuter bus and I believe they asked for a \$60 donation, but if you do not have the \$60, they work with you on that. They do take some at no-cost, but I believe they make a request for \$60.

Councilmember Cowden: Just following up on the comment you made, at current, I have three (3) world wild cats, one (1) who is eighteen (18) years old, I had him for seven (7) years and he is as calm, friendly cat. When I have cat hair on me, that is him demanding as I am leaving, but that cat was extremely wild and was an adult and is very friendly now, so he was socialized at probably ten (10) or eleven (11) years old, but not when he was born. That cat did socialize and then these two (2) kittens, I do not need new cats, but we found on two (2) different nights. The Kaua'i Community Cat people have been so on it, calling me constantly making sure that those cats are going to get fixed and are they going to go to the Humane Society, and they said you are out of baby inventory. Do you have kittens?

Ms. Schaefer Crane: We do. We took in nineteen (19) on Saturday.

Councilmember Cowden: But you do not have a lot.

Council Chair Rapozo: That is a lot.

Councilmember Cowden: That is a lot of kittens, but how many do you have in your inventory?

Ms. Schaefer Crane: You are correct, we do have a lot less because we were expecting a kitten season, that has been delayed for about a month, so we did a big transfer, send as many cats to the mainland as possible, so we had a little bit of a reprieve, but yes, we took in multiple neonates last week and the nineteen (19) kittens, just over the weekend. We are working our way back up quite quickly.

Councilmember Cowden: I will say that KCCP, I asked them for help in the trapping, there was one I could not get, but I get regular calls making sure I am being a responsible home and that they want to make sure they cannot get out, so they are very committed to not having feral cats out.

Ms. Schaefer Crane: No, and I think that is a really good point to make is our goal is to... we would like all cat pets to be indoor pets. We are working right now with Pacific Birds on a campaign for the last half year working into that. We are working with the National Oceanic and Atmospheric Administration (NOAA), we are trying to decrease outdoor cats, we are trying to decrease abandonment of cats, which leads to this increase of population, and keep them from reproducing. We are trying to work together and it is always difficult, because we alone cannot offer the solutions to everything, so that is why we partner with other organizations. KCCP has their niche, so we can work together, and then we work with the conservation groups too. I think sometimes we get pinned against each other, there are dog and cat people and then there are bird people, and we are actually all working together. We do not dislike each other, no one wants to see a Nēnē or Shearwater get taken before their time, so we all have the same goals, we are just going through different avenues to get to it.

Mr. Giovanni: I think you heard it in the discussion but consistent with your experience, Councilmember, is that we do accept feral kittens, because they have a great chance of being socialized. The difference is feral kittens versus feral wild cats that are already out there. If it is a feral kitten, we take it in and we got a good chance of getting it socialized.

Council Chair Rapozo: Councilmember Kualii, do you have a follow-up?

Councilmember Kualii: When you were talking about the options for feral cats with the cat project folks, you mentioned sanctuary as well, but there is no sanctuary on Kauai, right?

Mr. Giovanni: There is the beginnings of a sanctuary that we are aware of up in Kapa'a. There is a very large sanctuary on Lanai and there are relationships that we are aware of between the two.

Councilmember Kualii: So, some of our feral cats might actually need to be sent to Lanai?

Mr. Giovanni: That is the intention of KCCP is to find homes wherever they can find them and they are developing a relationship with the sanctuary on Lānaʻi, which has about 1,000 cats in the sanctuary that I am aware of.

Council Chair Rapozo: It is about 400 acres, I heard.

Mr. Giovanni: It is interesting...we had Malama Lānaʻi come before the Land Use Commission not too long ago and we learned that Larry Ellison himself signs a big check every month to financially make the sanctuary viable. It is not self-supported.

Councilmember Kualīʻi: When you say you believe they are at a beginning of one, would the Humane Society want to be connected with them, partner with them, and maybe even figure out a way to support them, so that it would happen and come along? Should there be a small line item for this?

Ms. Schaefer Crane: They are still in the developmental stages, I mean we have close interactions with them, we have talked to the same people, they are fully aware that we are a source that they can always talk to and plan things out for operations. When they finally reach the point, yes, if we start moving some of our cats over there, we of course will assist whether it is financial or some other way, with that, if that is the decision that is made.

Councilmember Kualīʻi: My other question is on another item.

Councilmember Cowden: I have a follow-up. About a year ago when we had this cat piece with the Department of Parks & Recreation, I tried really hard to get that sanctuary, so you heard all about it. I had them speak, the Department of Land and Natural Resources (DLNR) was willing to help, and we were profoundly shut down on this floor, some of you were here, about anything in development of that idea. I actually tried really hard and was working with a benefactor that is deeply involved with the Humane Society that was going to pay for all of the materials to put up a predator fence. There was a strong reaction from our Council to not really be supportive of that idea. That was pretty hard for me.

Council Chair Rapozo: I have absolutely no idea what you folks are talking about, but Councilmember Carvalho has a follow-up.

Councilmember Kualīʻi: Not you folks, just her.

Councilmember Carvalho: Just a quick follow-up with the Kauaʻi Cat project, what is your role again, budget-wise?

Mr. Giovanni: Kauaʻi Community Cat Project is an independent project.

Councilmember Carvalho: Totally independent.

Mr. Giovanni: Totally independent, however, we have signed a lease agreement with them to allow them to use the housing that is on our property for transitional housing. That is their program. Their volunteers operate the program. We provide medical services for a fee for those cats, so if it needs spay/neuter, vaccine, or some type of investigation, we will provide the medical services. If they decide they want to euthanize one of their cats, we will do that as well.

Council Chair Rapozo: Councilmember Kagawa, follow-up?

Councilmember Kagawa: I will give you an example of a cat problem. I am camping at 'Anini, I get up to use the bathroom, cats ravaging through all our food on our tables like over thirty (30) or so. The other campers asked me, "What can we do about this," so who do I tell them to call when we know these types of things are happening? There are herds of cats just terrorizing our camping grounds. Who do we call? How do we control this? Is there no way to control? Will we just spay and neuter and let them back at 'Anini?

Ms. Schaefer Crane: We do not have jurisdiction on County property unless we are invited in.

Councilmember Kagawa: Oh.

Ms. Schaefer Crane: And then once again, our County contract does not permit us to take in feral cats, so in these types of situations, I would call one of the local businesses that does that or the predator control organization that is contracted under the County.

Councilmember Kagawa: That is...

Mr. Giovanni: That is County property.

Councilmember Kagawa: Yes.

Mr. Giovanni: Our understanding is that the County has a contract with a different organization to do exactly what you want.

Councilmember Kagawa: In the 1970s it was the County working in partnership with the Kaua'i Humane Society, but I guess...

Council Chair Rapozo: Can we get someone from the Administration up?

Councilmember Kagawa: The '70s and now 2020s is a big difference, I guess.
We were partners before.

Mr. Giovanni: The predator management on County property was a competitive solicitation. The Humane Society attempted to...we put in a proposal, but we lost.

Councilmember Kagawa: Okay.

Mr. Giovanni: So, to ask us to do it when we tried and lost, someone else has it.

Council Chair Rapozo: Okay. Reiko, who has that contract? I do not need to know who has that contract, but I want an answer to Councilmember Kagawa's question, who does the public call when...I have heard the complaint, so I know it is happening, but who do we call?

Ms. Matsuyama: The contract is housed in the Department of Parks & Recreation and it is part of the KHCP, the Seabird Habitat Plan, and they do have someone that...I do not know if they do "rounds," but they do focus on County properties and it will be killed.

Council Chair Rapozo: Well, I do not need to know what happens to the cat, I just like know who they call? Right now, for the public watching...

Ms. Matsuyama: The Department of Parks & Recreation.

Council Chair Rapozo: Just call the Department of Parks & Recreation?

Ms. Matsuyama: I mean, without mentioning the name of the contractor, yes, the Department of Parks & Recreation.

Council Chair Rapozo: No, no, I just want to know, who would Councilmember Kagawa call at 1:00 a.m. when he gets up and there are cats all over the food? Over the weekend?

Ms. Matsuyama: I would say the Department of Parks & Recreation can direct the contractor on where to go.

Council Chair Rapozo: On a weekend? Who would they call?

Ms. Matsuyama: I would say the Department of Parks & Recreation.

Council Chair Rapozo: That is a real problem. I thought it was "calling the Humane Society," honestly, and I am not mad at it, I am just saying it is an issue that we have to deal with, who do we call and we will make sure we get that information out, so we can inform and educate the public.

Councilmember Cowden: When we had this conversation about the potential creation for a sanctuary or strengthening the sanctuary that was there, we had a bill on the floor about cats in parks, and cats in public places, and so we passed an ordinance that cat feeding in parks is a crime and I was bringing up the fact of, "what if they are eating someone else's dinner," are they the criminals? I did not think that was the best way to go at it, but it is the case and there was a lot of emotion in here, that for cats in parks, and I will not name the predator control company, we have a predator control company whose job is to go in and so I would say, "You are not going to get your cats out on Saturday, but if you were calling, on Monday, it can be that the predator control goes down there." It is a tough thing for the rangers to be the ones who are responsible for calling the predator control or arresting, generally speaking, senior citizens for being compassionate to the cats, because that is who it typically is. The seniors say that they are going to feed the cats one hundred (100) yards away or whatever, it was a very difficult one, so I was trying really hard to find the sanctuary situation so it is not quite so...

Council Chair Rapozo: Okay, let us wind it back to the Humane Society.

Councilmember Cowden: Okay.

Council Chair Rapozo: Because we can have that discussion later.

Councilmember Cowden: Here is what my point is, we came up with a different solution and we knew it was not on the Humane Society's piece, because the problem that we have had in the past, is people do not want to take their animals to the Humane Society because there are feral cats that come in and the cats who are ahead of the line are the ones that get killed. We are killing socialized cats, because there were so many feral cats coming in, is that correct? That was basically the problem and so...

Mr. Giovanni: You are correct, there was a time in which, I hate to say it, more than 60% of the animals brought to us were euthanized, but no longer.

Councilmember Cowden: So, now people will bring their cats in as opposed to doing it.

Council Chair Rapozo: Alright, any further follow-up questions?

Councilmember DeCosta: Mine is still on the spay and neuter. All sympathetic to animal lovers and the people who are concerned, we are trying to help you balance your budget to take care of dogs and cats. We, ourselves, cannot balance our budget to take care of the homeless that are right outside of our building, so please be sympathetic to this Council, because we have plenty of problems we are trying to solve with this budget. My spay and neuter question is, I do not mind the neutering of the dogs, but I have brought this to your attention many times and you must hear me, because I represent the hunting community. Hunters provide a very good service for keeping the native *pua'a* under control and when their hunting dogs get lost, they end up a valley or a mountain away from where the hunter was, tourists can pick them up easily, other people can pick the dogs up and bring

them in. The hunters need time to figure out if their dog is at the Humane Society, because they are back in the mountains looking for their dogs. Sometimes the global positioning system (GPS) collar battery dies in twelve (12) or sixteen (16) hours, so they do not have that GPS anymore. I do not want to see their hunting dog neuter if they did not have a certain time. I would ask you folks, about a certain day period that you have, and I am not sure if you extended a little bit to accommodate these hunters. As a hunter myself, the spay and neuter of my hunting dog is not something I want, and why, it is because I use that as my bloodline to breed. I make these hunting dogs. Dogs do not last their entire life, right, the pigs kill them, they die. Did you make accommodation to the hunting community on your spay and neuter program on the days that the dogs come in and how many before you are going to neuter them, and put them up for adoption?

Ms. Schaefer Crane: I do not know if I would say specifically for hunting dogs, just because it is very general.

Councilmember DeCosta: But what I am telling you there is a category called "hunters."

Ms. Schaefer Crane: Right.

Councilmember DeCosta: So, there is a dog that comes in and there is a possibility that...you can tell what a small little Chihuahua, do you folks have a program, because I brought it to your attention before.

Ms. Schaefer Crane: Yes.

Councilmember DeCosta: ...maybe an extra three (3) to five (5) days for the hunters to...

Ms. Schaefer Crane: Our local ordinance says that if there is no form of identification, an animal becomes Kaua'i Humane Society's property after forty-eight (48) hours. If there is a form of identification and it specifically says, "Licensing" in the local ordinance, it says 9-days. What we have done...because it is difficult, I would say probably 90% of my dog population appears to be hunting dogs.

Councilmember DeCosta: 90%?

Ms. Schaefer Crane: Yes. It may even be a little more than that, I am being generous of that percentage. We understand that, as much as it is a legal requirement to microchip your animal that that is not always performed, right? That is just an understanding of human, so if it comes in with any form of identification, if it has a collar on, if it has a GIS collar, we actually purchased the plugs, so we can keep it going, so hunters can know the dog is at the shelter, so the battery does not die. It is also an expensive piece of equipment, I am sure they would like that back as well. If they have tattoos, then we would put the dog as a 9-day hold. There are certain things that we look at to identify that if it was recently groomed and it smells like a bath, then we would put it as a 9-day. We do not want

to take people's pets away from them. That is not our business. Our business is to make sure the pets go back into good homes. That is what we are accommodating, so if they are not microchipped, we are looking for other forms or appearances of ownership. Do we sometimes have nothing and we make that wrong guess, I am sure we do, but at the same time, our length of stay for dogs is not typically forty-eight (48) hours and they are out the door. We have puppies that I thought would be that way, that are residing with us for two (2) to three (3) weeks. We have small dogs that do that too, so the turnaround for adoption is not a 48-hour timeframe. There is time to redeem your animal. We just need to keep reminding people we need to check if they have the animal, that is really your first step. They do not even need to come in, they can look on our website. The animals are uploaded, the photos are in real-time, as soon as it walks in the door, the photo is on the website.

Councilmember DeCosta: I understand. You answered my question. I know when the dog stays in the shelter, you folks have to pay a fee...that spay and neuter, you folks used to offer certain weekends for the hunters to come in and get their dog microchipped for a cheaper price. I am not ashamed to add that I can load up eight (8) to nine (9) hunting dogs and then I probably have another five (5) to six (6) at home, so if it is a \$50 charge, that could be a large bill to a hunter that does not make that type of revenue that I am making with my job. Do you offer a percentage discount?

Ms. Schaefer Crane: Yes. However, your practice makes no difference to us, we are not a financial wall. If you cannot afford a service that benefits your animal, we will meet you at the need. That was the whole point of us opening the Community Care Center, which you can microchip through. It is our whole premise that, if you cannot afford to do something that benefits your animal, we are not going to tell you no. That is why we try so hard to fundraise and get grants.

Councilmember DeCosta: They can call the number and this Community Care Center would accommodate the hunters on a certain time of the month?

Mr. Giovanni: Tuesdays and Sundays.

Ms. Schaefer Crane: Tuesdays and Sundays is a walk-in, you do not need to make a call, 12:30 p.m. – 5:30 p.m.

Mr. Giovanni: The simple answer to your inquiry, Councilmember DeCosta, the message to the hunter, I think, is get your dogs microchipped, then you have nine (9) days to recover them instead of forty-eight (48) hours. We will help you get them microchipped at a cost you can afford. That is the message to the hunters.

Councilmember DeCosta: Thank you.

Council Chair Rapozo: If they are microchipped, though, you would contact the owner, right?

Ms. Schaefer Crane: Yes. That is one of the things we did when we updated our database. The company that runs our database will also contact you as well. Now, there are two (2) organizations that are trying to reunite you.

Council Chair Rapozo: So, just microchip the dogs...

Mr. Giovanni: That is the answer.

Council Chair Rapozo: Did you have a new question?

Mr. Giovanni: It is a lifetime license.

Council Chair Rapozo: Yes.

Mr. Giovanni: You do not have to go back every year.

Councilmember DeCosta: That part-time officer you want to hire, that apparently will cost us more revenue that you will return at the end of your \$1,100,000—that part-time officer, you made a comment that he or she would assist with the livestock damage that happens. Do we call DLNR enforcement or KPD if there is livestock damage happening? I think the landowner, or the owner of the livestock, I believe their first call is 9-1-1, it is not to the Kaua'i Humane Society. When would you get that call?

Ms. Schaefer Crane: Can you clarify damage? Do you mean if a dog attacks it or someone else attacks it?

Councilmember DeCosta: You folks recently dealt with something like that, up in the east side, some sheep dogs got roughed up...

Ms. Schaefer Crane: Yes.

Councilmember DeCosta: I believe that the owner of that livestock, his or her first call goes to KPD or DLNR enforcement, it does not go to the Kaua'i Humane Society's part-time officer.

Ms. Schaefer Crane: If a dangerous dog attack is happening now, you should call KPD, and it is only because they have emergency vehicles. My trucks have to go the same speed limit as everyone else, cannot go around traffic, so if you have an active attack happening, you should call KPD, because they can get to you faster. Now, when they arrive, KPD has the option of handing the case over to us or continuing with the case. That is their decision to make. If it is livestock and it is a dangerous animal attack, we can both work that case. We tend to take first calls for cruelty and neglect to livestock before handing that over to KPD, if it is necessary. If there is an active attack happening that involves animals, you should call KPD because they are just going to get to you faster than we would be able to.

Councilmember DeCosta: I was just trying to help you, I was trying to figure out how you are going to manage your budget, anytime you hire a new employee, that is money you have to follow every year after that. That is not something that you are going to front temporarily, it will get absorbed in a grant.

Ms. Schaefer Crane: Right. It is included in the budget that we presented, that part-time person. Once again, it is a bit of a response to the fact that we have a vacancy. Right now, it is taking us a long amount of time, so you are going to get that money back even though we are paying this additional person.

Mr. Giovanni: We added the livestock last year for the first time and we just guessed at how many cases we would be called in and it turned out we got called into 50% more than we anticipated. It is a real need in the community.

Councilmember Kualif'i: On page 7 of your PowerPoint, you talked about a humane officer's investigation over livestock cases, and now you are talking about this position. Is it one position that does cats and dogs as well as livestock? Is that how it works?

Ms. Schaefer Crane: For our enforcement officers?

Councilmember Kualif'i: For answering the call.

Ms. Schaefer Crane: We have two (2) openings for humane officers and then we have a dispatcher, and like I said we added on this part-time assistant humane officer. So, they do not respond by species, they respond by priority calls. If there is a dangerous dog attack, that is priority one (1), so whichever officer is working that day, that is where they respond, then they will respond to those of less priority, so a confined stray or a loose dog. Yes, they are not breed specific, they all respond to where is needed and by priority.

Councilmember Kualif'i: When I look at the budget and you get to the \$1,100,000, there is the column on investigation and enforcement, is that included in there the livestock...

Ms. Schaefer Crane: Yes.

Councilmember Kualif'i: When I look at the budget in the Finance Department, under the line-item Special Projects, there are the three (3) items: Humane Society, Animal Care, Investigation Enforcement, and Licensing, and they are the same totals, as what you show us in your chart on page 11, so that all gets us to the \$1,100,000. However, on the next page, on page 40, there is another separate line item, Investigation/Livestock for \$40,170, can you tell me about that?

Mr. Giovanni: Can we get help on that, Reiko?

Ms. Matsuyama: You found our error. \$40,000 on the next page is included in the livestock line, so that is something that will...

Councilmember Kuali'i: So it is included, that \$40,000 is a mistake line item and it will be deleted.

Ms. Matsuyama: Yes.

Council Chair Rapozo: It is not a tip.

Mr. Giovanni: You folks are good.

Councilmember Cowden: On page 11, I struggle with acronyms. What is G&A?

Mr. Giovanni: What is what?

Councilmember Cowden: G&A—it says “Allocated G&A (inaudible) cost, allocated...”

Mr. Giovanni: General & Administrative cost.

Councilmember Cowden: General and Administrative.

Mr. Giovanni: So, what we adopted is a form of accounting, when I said we went “open book,” in which we have direct cost and indirect cost, and it is a standard accounting methodology for the federal government. Basically what happens is we accumulate all of our general and administrative costs, and then portion those back to the different programs that we have. If you go back, about 30% of our general and administrative cost is portioned back to the county, and 70% to other things.

Councilmember Cowden: Would that be interest and insurance and overhead for what was rented and is a purchased cost, like a mortgage?

Mr. Giovanni: Yes. Internet, phones, etcetera.

Councilmember Cowden: Is the Humane Society the only location for chipping or do other nonprofits and private vets do the chipping as well?

Ms. Schaefer Crane: Any vet can microchip.

Councilmember Cowden: Okay. And when people are taking these kittens to be spayed through KCCP, do they get chipped?

Ms. Schaefer Crane: They also are, yes.

Councilmember Cowden: And then you said the length of stay is extending, so what is the typical length of stay for...you said the dogs are your biggest ones, but what is the typical length of stay?

Ms. Schaefer Crane: Typically, adult cats have a longer length of stay than dogs, on average. Right now, we are in a little bit of a scenario, but I would say we are looking at somewhere between sixty (60) to ninety (90) days for dogs and up to 120 days for adult cats.

Councilmember Cowden: If most of these dogs are thought to be hunting dogs, they are probably not easy to put out as well as house pets?

Ms. Schaefer Crane: There are pros and cons. The one thing I can say about hunting dogs is they are great with other dogs, so they are easy to kennel with other dogs, they tend to be very social with other dogs, so that is a plus. The downside is that the dogs are a bit prey-driven, so we do not necessarily recommend putting them in homes with cats. Just like every animal, everyone has their personality, their likes and dislikes, so it is like matching.

Councilmember Cowden: Okay, they might be harder to place for families with small children. I am trying to understand the length of stay and then...

Mr. Giovanni: One financial comment is that when we put together the proposal for the County, the length of stay is normally thirty (30) days, so anything above thirty (30) days, the County does not pay for it. We would have to find other ways to get food and care for those animals that are more than thirty (30) days. It is also an incentive for us to find other homes for them, even with that justification and in some cases to rent an airplane and send them to the mainland.

Ms. Schaefer Crane: The one thing we are reviewing is we are noticing that our adoptions on-island are slowing down, which we look at how long the Humane Society has been operating, what the population is, what the current housing hurdles are, we will reach a point where we are probably going to saturate our markets. This year, I think is going to be a hurdle on us because lots of shelters are not taking animals and because of their increase length of stays as well, so we are looking at how are we going to get to respond to a high population of animals this year, if we cannot find a place for them to go.

Councilmember Cowden: I want to acknowledge our County's contribution has shrunk down to 29%, so it is less than even a third—I want to express gratitude to the individuals and organizations in the State that are part of this other donation. Great job in the past 4 years. If I can just acknowledge that sometimes you folks do things that are probably unfunded like that recent hospitality that you extended to the dogs from the houseless community that helped me to be able to help the Department of Parks & Recreation move those people, because they were not going to move if they could not somehow take care of the dogs. You had them there for three (3) weeks, thank you so much for that, because they did not pay for that storage and it helped the County in other ways.

Ms. Schaefer Crane: Our pleasure.

Councilmember Cowden: I want to extend gratitude to the flexibility that you have for assisting in other challenges.

Council Chair Rapozo: Are there further questions for the Kaua'i Humane Society?

Councilmember DeCosta: My question leads to that "90% of your dogs are hunting dogs." Those are dogs that come in that the hunters put up for adoption or those are dogs that you caught that were roaming around and then the hunter is trying to find them? Can you put the correlation to that percentage, then I can do my follow-up question? I did not know how to address my question because I did not know what category you were talking about.

Ms. Schaefer Crane: To clarify, the 90% is the appearance of a hunting dog. If they are a stray or they never get reclaimed, I do not necessarily know the history. So, the appearance of hound features, an animal that might have the opportunity to hunt. I would say it is a combination. We do take in a fair amount of dogs that are left up in the Kōke'e kennels. Now, with that, once again, we are trying to assist our hunting population and we do not tend to pick up the first day they are in there. We have volunteers that feed them overnight, one (1) to two (2) nights, depending on it, because we are hoping the hunters will come and reclaim their animals. If they are not reclaimed, then we take them into the shelter.

Councilmember DeCosta: You have that microchip tool that you can scan over the dog.

Ms. Schaefer Crane: Yes, we scan them in the field, because if they have a microchip, then we would just drive them to your house, they will not come into the shelter.

Councilmember DeCosta: I know how to craft my question. The question I want to craft is you folks seem to have a cat sanctuary to have cats meet human beings, so they can spark a relationship. I would like to see a puppy sanctuary, and it does not mean that you need to create anymore funding for this...just hear me out. You have a group of hunting society on Kaua'i who have picked up dogs at the Humane Society. A hunter normally likes a dog between two (2) to three (3) months old to about 1-year old, follow me now, I am going to help you put good pets into good homes. They want a hunting dog, they do not want a pet. It is a pet, but it is a working dog.

Ms. Schaefer Crane: Yes.

Councilmember DeCosta: Why not create a sanctuary where they can take this puppy, whether it is two (2) to three (3) months old, six (6) months to a year, and have

them in a sanctuary where they get to see a goat, maybe a feral pig someplace, and they can see their reaction; how they act, whether they show enthusiasm towards an animal that they may catch for the hunter or maybe they might be really shy, that they might not work. I am telling you a hunter, he or she will want a dog that has the potential to catch them food to bring home, not a dog that is going to run under the truck when they see a feral pig. Have we thought about that? Like a small little sanctuary where the feral pig can be on the other side of the fence and hunters can go take their six (6) month old dog for you, right on the leash, they will play with them for ten (10) minutes, take them by the fence, see if the dog barks at the pig, "Eh, I like this dog," and then maybe they would be more excited to pay your fee. Do you have something like that?

Council Chair Rapozo: Let me ask the question before you answer that question, because this is what I heard. If I went to the Humane Society today and said, "I want to adopt a dog to be my hunting dog," are you folks going to allow that?

Ms. Schaefer Crane: Yes.

Council Chair Rapozo: You allow that?

Ms. Schaefer Crane: 100%.

Council Chair Rapozo: Okay.

Ms. Schaefer Crane: I will equally give you your percentage, I would say at least 50% if not more of my staff are hunters as well, and we provide medical care for their animals and assist them. I have the luxury of living in Waimea, all of my neighbors are hunters, they are more than happy to show me the "wins" from their hunts and I have had them show me how to butcher a pig, so we have only good feelings towards our hunting animals. If anything, we spend a good portion of our time explaining to our visitors that the dogs that they are seeing are not starved dogs, they are lean because they are hunting dogs and they get regular exercise and this is a dog that is in good shape; we have a lot of Whippet breeds, so we defend our animals and the care that is provided by our hunting community quite frequently. We very rarely have puppies. I know I just said we have a bunch now and that is kind of a unicorn for us this year. We do not really have a way of testing them with another live animals, just because if we had a feral pig, we would have to keep changing it over. We do not have a place to house one and I am sure it will get big enough and become enough of a nuisance for us that we would need to remove it from our property, as many people need to remove pigs from theirs. We do work with groups that do other tests, so Kaua'i Search and Rescue comes through looking for these high-drive dogs as well, and so we use tennis balls, big quick motions, see what they are enticed with. We have definitely seen dogs that come in with a high prey-drive, so if someone is looking for that, we can direct them to that dog. We do not get a lot of people come in asking for hunting dogs, and I think it is just because the community is so closeknit, and Councilmember DeCosta, you would know more than I do because how involved you are. They tend to go to friends and family first to add to their hunting lives before they come to us.

Councilmember DeCosta: I think the price of your adoption fee, can you tell me the price?

Ms. Schaefer Crane: Yes. If you were looking for that 6-month to 1-year old dog, it is \$50.

Councilmember DeCosta: Correct. So, if someone is going to spend \$50, think about this now, I am giving you a good idea, and you can chuckle all you like, Mr. Giovanni, but I am trying to help you.

Mr. Giovanni: I know, I am appreciative of it.

Councilmember DeCosta: I am telling you folks...the money you are going to spend to feed a 60-pound pig in a small little area, you are going to save when you get that dog adopted and you are not feeding that puppy for the next three (3) months. You will move a lot of puppies, six (6) months to a year, who got to see that pig, bark a couple times, the hunter will get excited, and they will buy that dog. They are not going take a chance buying a dog while they cannot see what that dog does. I am done. Thank you very much. Take it with a grain of salt.

Mr. Giovanni: Councilmember, I am not amused at your comments, I am fascinated, because I am all about creative ideas. We welcome that.

Councilmember DeCosta: If you had a Border Collie mix, right, you have a sheep in the area, someone wants a herding dog, he takes the Border Collie out and the Border Collie barks and chases the sheep, he is like, "Wow, I might be able to make this dog into a herding dog." They just have to go there and look at the dog and not test it...it is like going to Vegas and throwing \$50 in the slot machine. People put \$0.25, they do not put \$50, not me anyway.

Ms. Schaefer Crane: I definitely see that there are other options that we can promote adoptions.

Council Chair Rapozo: I think he is volunteering to run that program.

Councilmember DeCosta: No, I just know a lot about this kind of thing. I wanted to share my *mana'o*.

Ms. Schaefer Crane: We do not have a return fee, so there is the option that you can take the animal and we do this even with those who have another dog in their house, that they are not sure if the new pet will get along with, but you can either foster the animal for a short amount of time to see if it gets along or performs how you would like it to perform, and if it does not work out, you bring it back and there is no cost for that.

Councilmember DeCosta: Thank you.

Council Chair Rapozo: Just a follow-up because you mentioned if you have another dog at home. I had received a call awhile back, maybe 2 years ago from a dog owner that lost 2 dogs in a short period of time due to old age. They were just really old, these people really took good care of these dogs. They went to the Humane Society, they still had a couple old dogs that were still alive, and they were told that they had to bring their dogs into the Humane Society to see if the dogs could socialize with the dog they were attempting to adopt. Is that true?

Ms. Schaefer Crane: I think this is kind of one of those interesting...we are sort of trying to get all of the staff on the same page. We have some staff that really think that is the best way to do it, and there are certain benefits...

Council Chair Rapozo: Well, in that case they opted not to adopt.

Councilmember Cowden: Yes.

Council Chair Rapozo: And I agree with them. I think that is kind of too much...what triggered that is when you said, "If you took it home and it did not get along with your dog, you bring it back," but that was not an option for them.

Mr. Giovanni: Councilmember, going back three (3) or four (4) years, there were a number of those types of...

Council Chair Rapozo: So, that is not the case today?

Ms. Schaefer Crane: No, no.

Mr. Giovanni: We have cleared those out.

Council Chair Rapozo: That is all I needed to know.

Mr. Giovanni: We made it a lot easier to adopt and if it does not work, you return.

Council Chair Rapozo: That is reasonable.

Councilmember Kualii: We mainly heard about cats, dogs, and livestock, but then I know you used the word "species" at one point and Councilmember Kagawa talked about chickens. Is it because you do not put any resources or time into animals other than cats, dogs, and livestock?

Ms. Schaefer Crane: We do pocket pets, so things like gerbils, rabbits, guinea pigs, hamsters, and chinchillas come to us, and ultimately what we have done is we have just built a relationship with Kaua'i Animal Welfare Farm, I believe is what they are called, that we will fix the animal and transfer it to them, because they have much more robust adoption and housing. Our facility just is not built to really do more than just dogs

and cats, and ultimately our facility was not built for cats. One of our cat rooms is covered puppy cages, it just was not in the plans at the time. Besides that, most of the other animals require different permits that we do not have once we get into wild animals and things like that.

Councilmember Kualii: On the investigation and enforcement side, if there is an issue and KPD gets called, KPD will only involve you if it is cats, dogs, and livestock?

Ms. Schaefer Crane: Ultimately. I think if there is endangered animals, they would have to go through DLNR, and I do not think anyone is working on chickens right now.

Councilmember Kualii: I have an odd example. My hula sister was attacked by a rooster in Kukuilono Park, I guess it was a big violent rooster and it injured her severely. She ended up falling and was out of commission for quite a while. I do not know what had happened, would that be something they would call KPD and the Humane Society would address?

Ms. Schaefer Crane: I do not want to make any promises about that, because I am not 100% sure. I will say people have brought us roosters and chickens to euthanize whether due to aggression or illness, we have done that before, but in an attack by a fowl, I do not want to mislead you, so I am not really sure who you would call for that.

Councilmember Kualii: If someone brought you an animal to euthanize, what is the charge?

Ms. Schaefer Crane: I believe it is \$50.

Council Chair Rapozo: Are there further questions for the Humane Society?

Councilmember Kagawa: I just want to thank you folks, I know I gave you a little hard time, and I am almost willing to add to the budget if you folks can help us...along with that group that is already helping us, because I just think at some point, we need to control nuisance animals. Not only nuisance, but I also feel bad for these cats that are in herds at the golf course or at the Kaua'i Beach Villas, because if we do not have certain people feeding them, then they will starve and they will be unhappy. I do not know what they will eat. At some point, I think it is incumbent upon the government, for the taxpayer's sake, to control some of these populations, as long as they are not on the native list or the endangered species list, you know...

Mr. Giovanni: Thank you for that very much. From our point of view, we are interested in getting involved with predator management, but not as an exterminator, but rather to trap, health check them, and then find homes for them, but not

to return them from where they came from. We are interested in working that area and I appreciate your support.

Councilmember DeCosta: A light bulb just popped in because of Councilmember Kagawa. You talked partnership with different agencies, have you thought about partnering with the realtor agencies here on Kaua'i? I think it would be perfect where if people want to buy a home, if they are not a resident on Kaua'i or Hawai'i, but you want to buy a home, you need to contribute to the Humane Society and then you can qualify to buy a home.

Mr. Giovanni: I am smiling again, because...

Ms. Schaefer Crane: Done.

Mr. Giovanni: I appreciate your creativity.

Councilmember DeCosta: If you sell our homes to someone from the mainland, they need to pay a fee for our wild cats and dogs at the Humane Society.

Mr. Giovanni: There you go.

Councilmember DeCosta: Bless you folks. That was sort of a joke.

Council Chair Rapozo: Yes, I am glad you clarified that. I think extortion is against the law.

Councilmember DeCosta: Yes, I know.

Councilmember Kualii: Just to preface with a little bit of a comment before I ask my question. I am a total animal lover and I am really happy that you folks are no-kill and that the most of what you do is in the interest of the welfare of the animal and all of that. I would never kill an animal myself unless it was trying to kill me or my loved ones. Can you get your board or time and energy behind the entire idea of the cat sanctuary, because I think it has been talked about for a while and it is only in the development stage, we need it like yesterday, right? If the Humane Society puts its energy and resources behind it, I would imagine that it would already have been in place by now.

Mr. Giovanni: Let me take that from the board's perspective. Yes, the simple answer is yes. This agenda item, but with everything else has not risen and has a big cost to it. As you probably know it is not the subject of our meeting today, but we are doing some very significant strategic planning for our future, including a significant investment and a lot of fundraising, now that we own the land there. We are looking at workforce housing, we are looking at a community clinic that is full-time. Ideas like the sanctuary is one that does rise up and our board is interested in pursuing, especially some of our members are pushing that.

Councilmember Kualii: You said on Lānaʻi there is a wealthy person who puts a lot of money towards it?

Mr. Giovanni: Yes, the gentleman that owns 98% of Lānaʻi, Larry Ellison, he is one of the richest people in the world, he lives there. It came to our attention that he personally funds the sanctuary.

Councilmember Kualii: Did the Humane Society approach our wealthy people?

Mr. Giovanni: Approached him?

Councilmember Kualii: We have our own billionaires, right?

Council Chair Rapozo: Zuckerberg. For them to give a chunk of their land and invest in a sanctuary would be the right thing to do. They do not watch this show, but I know someone that knows them does. It is a simple ask. You are coming here making this your Disneyland, your paradise...

Mr. Giovanni: We are out there asking. We are not shy.

Councilmember Kualii: How much land does it take for a sanctuary?

Mr. Giovanni: About three (3) to four (4) acres.

Councilmember Kualii: That little? On Lānaʻi, how many acres was that?
You said 400 acres.

Council Chair Rapozo: 400 acres, but that is because he owns the island, right.

Ms. Schaefer Crane: The facility is significantly smaller.

Council Chair Rapozo: I am thinking ten (10) to fifteen (15).

Councilmember Kualii: Can we send them all of our cats? They have four hundred (400) acres. Thank you.

Councilmember Cowden: We went through all of this about a year ago.

Councilmember Kualii: Yes, we keep saying that.

Council Chair Rapozo: Yes, I do not want to go back.

Councilmember Cowden: The land is there. What we do not have is the maintenance, paying for it, and we cannot make it be public, because we have to put in like

a left-hand turn lane and all that. We actually looked at all of this and we had some generosity, but there were some concessions that the County is not willing to make.

Council Chair Rapozo: Again, that is the rearview mirror, there is a whole new Council and this is a new time.

Councilmember Cowden: We have already asked them all of this.

Council Chair Rapozo: I think the question from Councilmember Kualii was, "Would you all support..."

Councilmember Kualii: Yes, my interest is as a policymaker, right.

Council Chair Rapozo: Right.

Councilmember Kualii: I am not going to say "We" because I am asking you and how the County can play our small part when it comes to the budget, and I agree with Councilmember Kagawa that I may be willing to put more money behind it, maybe for a different purpose than he is interested in, but that is just me that is putting that forward. I think accelerating a cat sanctuary would help the problem.

Ms. Schaefer Crane: I think the acreage the Dan presented is a decent start, but...

Council Chair Rapozo: That is why we asked for what we need for the long-term.

Ms. Schaefer Crane: Right. The one thing that we do not have is we do not actually know how many cats there are on Kauai, so for us to really think long-term or how much it would grow or what the actual needs are at the end of it, I think a population study would be very beneficial.

Councilmember Kualii: Population study.

Mr. Giovanni: I am going to have to excuse myself, I have a plane to catch, but I want to thank you.

Councilmember Carvalho: Fast question. The "true up" part of it, that is a big thing, so we want to clarify that, again, one more time, so we are on the same page.

Mr. Giovanni: Yes, it is part of the nuts and bolts of the 5-year contract and it works. Basically, the \$1,100,000 is paid out in twelve (12) installments and at the end of the year, we "true up" the actual cost and actually do a cash reimbursement back to the County.

Council Chair Rapozo: Thank you. Before you go, I just want to say I was labeled the animal hater years ago, because I did question the budget, I was one of the people on this Council that thought we were paying too much, because it was never explained to us properly, as you said. I appreciate you recognizing that. I love the new style where the costs are figured out and you reimburse the county. I think you will all agree if you go back and look at the budgets of the past and the explanations, it did not pencil out.

Mr. Giovanni: And we both thought each other were wrong.

Council Chair Rapozo: Right, and that is fine. If we had an accurate...and the only comment I wanted to make, as far as the investigations, we talked about KPD turning over...I was at the Office of the Prosecuting Attorney when there was a case where some sheep got attacked and the KPD responded, obviously, and turned it over to the Humane Society, and your investigator...what is her name?

Ms. Schaefer Crane: It was probably Officer Kawehi Harris at the time.

Council Chair Rapozo: Was there another one?

Ms. Schaefer Crane: We also had a Tony Miller and a Danial Madera.

Council Chair Rapozo: I guess I do not remember the name, but my comment was that investigation was a thorough, well done investigation that actually went to court and got a conviction, but I just wanted to thank you folks for that. That system works, if it is used properly.

Councilmember Kualii: I have one quick question.

Council Chair Rapozo: He needs to leave. Go ahead, Councilmember DeCosta.

Councilmember DeCosta: The whole feral cat training and whether the statistics say you can tame a feral cat, I have to say that you almost cannot, unless you have them as a kitten. I told you our success story, but I want people to know if you take a feral cat into your home, in seven (7) to ten (10) days you are not going to see them. Eventually, it will come out of the couch and scratch you when you walk by, and eventually you can tame it. I wanted you to know I tried it and it took us ten (10) days to tame our feral cat—it is a challenge.

Ms. Schaefer Crane: It is a labor of love.

Councilmember DeCosta: I was almost going to throw it outside and let my hunting dogs chase it around, but I did not, I took the time with my wife and now we have a tamed feral cat.

Council Chair Rapozo: Get a feral goldfish, you do not have to worry about it.

Councilmember Kualii: When you talk about the \$1,100,000, that is just a part of the rest of your expenditures, budget, and what you do. You had mentioned a population study being helpful to know the size of...what sanctuary would work long-term, right? Are you planning to do a population study and what does that cost and can you fund that from your other side of funding?

Ms. Schaefer Crane: We very much support having a population study done. Currently, right now we are not in a position to afford it on our own. I believe O'ahu had theirs done, and I think Maui might have just finished or they are in the process, but my understanding is that it costs around \$100,000 to have a really good survey done.

Councilmember Kualii: Thank you.

Council Chair Rapozo: Thank you. That would be a discussion we will have at a later time, with all of the stakeholders and how Councilmember Kagawa and Councilmember Kualii is asking and then we can figure out where we go to address that situation.

Ms. Schaefer Crane: Yes, absolutely.

Council Chair Rapozo: Are there further questions? If not, thank you very much. Next up, is the Office of Economic Development (OED).

Ms. Matsuyama: You did not even do the Finance Department yet.

Council Chair Rapozo: What am I thinking?

Councilmember Kagawa: I am okay with that.

Council Chair Rapozo: I was wrong. We are going to the Planning Department now. The Finance Department—Administration.

Ms. Matsuyama: Good morning, Councilmembers.

Councilmember Carvalho: Good morning.

(Council Chair Rapozo, the presiding officer, relinquished Chairmanship to Councilmember Kualii.)

(Council Chair Rapozo was noted as not present.)

Ms. Matsuyama: We are going to the rest of the Finance Department, starting with overview, and then getting into all the divisions. The Finance

Department is requesting a budget of \$21,900,000, which is \$6,700,000 or 44% over last year. Just to clarify, \$5,000,000 of the increase is an estimated placeholder for us to administer Ordinance No. 1146, which is the Residential Investor tax credit. Other than that, the largest increase relates to salaries and benefits, most of which are due to collective bargaining increases. We do have six (6) new positions asks and we will go through those when we get to those respective divisions. In addition to salaries and wages, operations is also increasing by about 35% and that is spread across all the divisions, and we can go through those individually, but in general, the increases are dominated by new software, and an increase in IT licensing cost.

Our budget contains some expenditures that are not just Finance-related, but they are really for the benefit of the entire County. The Humane Society is one of those, but in addition to that, we have insurance premiums, claims, IT subscriptions that cover everyone, and those are big costs that are housed in our budget. We do have some increases in those and we can go through those separately. As with every other department, we are struggling with vacancies. I think the thirteen (13) vacancies that we have listed for you folks now is the highest that we have ever had when we came at a budget cycle. I can go into each of those as we go through each division, but I just want to be clear with you folks, our approach to vacancies is we see all of them as imminent. I am intimately involved in the HR recruiting process and I am one of HR's favorite customers, I think Janine will agree. In addition, either Michelle or myself sit on every single interview panel. From bottom up, we sit on every single one. We are committed to securing the best candidates as quickly as possible and we do analyze each vacancy to see if it fits across the Finance Department, if it should remain where it is and remain classified as to where it is. With that, maybe I will open up to questions on the overview.

Councilmember Kuali'i: Members, are there any questions?

Councilmember DeCosta: You do not need to say how thorough you and Michelle are, because I know where you worked privately before you came to the County and you are excellent. We are so honored that you both are a part of our team. The six (6) new positions, are those positions to assist with our new satellite operation in Kapa'a?

Ms. Matsuyama: Five (5) of them are for the new satellite, yes.

Councilmember DeCosta: Will this be able to offset some of the influx of people we have at the Lihu'e office, which makes it a little bit of a lag when you are in there, trying to get your number and get to the window, a lot of people. Kapa'a is a big community-based, so I am thinking out loud, we got an outreach in Kapa'a satellite going on, less people at the Lihu'e, which would have a better movement through our Lihu'e office, is that correct?

(Council Chair Rapozo was noted as present.)

(Councilmember Kuali'i returned Chairmanship duties to Council Chair Rapozo.)

Ms. Matsuyama: That is the goal. Our hope is with the Kapa'a satellite Department of Motor Vehicles (DMV), the North Shore and eastside customers would use that facility instead.

Councilmember DeCosta: Okay. Thank you. I know recently we had an upward mobility with one of our licensees in the Vehicle Registration area move to CDL and he was looking for more money, I am a little worried. I do not want to see us lose really good employees if we cannot give them the type of pay they deserve. Have you been working with Janine in HR? Every other department has told us, the Department of Public Works told us, the Department of Parks & Recreation—Beautification realm that it is hard to keep good employees when the price cannot be matched. Are you able to work with Janine and can we help you?

Ms. Matsuyama: The CDL program has been a challenge, because of exactly what you said. People can get paid more driving the truck than giving the truck drivers' their licenses. What we get is...we do not have any succession right now. We are working with HR trying to build redundancy, so we do not just have one person doing CDL.

Councilmember DeCosta: Before I finish, I just wanted to make a comment, I left out a couple names, I see Mike Hubbard and Kalawai'a Lee, and I know them a little bit, but I hear the community is in an outcry of how great they are and what they do for our community, so I want to thank both of those gentlemen.

Ms. Matsuyama: They will be here for their respective divisions, so we can pump them up.

Councilmember DeCosta: Thank you.

Council Chair Rapozo: Councilmember Cowden.

Councilmember Cowden: Well, he asked my question about the CDL, because that is something that is definitely has come to my attention and even when we are looking at economic development, being able to have CDL workers that is really important, people are flying drivers over right now from O'ahu and we are training people over there and they stay. Operational challenges, when you had the state classification system has not changed in years while the employment market has evolved significantly, is it alright if I have Janine join us for a moment, because that is really her *kuleana*. I think this is really an important point that you are making. It could be either one of you to answer this, but I have been really surprised when we are responsible for the budget that we have nothing to do with the bargaining agreements. You go to the bargaining agreements, is that correct?

JANINE M.Z. RAPOZO, HR Manager III: Actually, our Director Annette Anderson and myself go to negotiations.

Councilmember Cowden: Right, so how can our Council have more input in that? When we are looking at our budget everywhere here, our openings are a very big issue,

and I see every division is going up, it is largely because of the increase that we paid in salaries, but we have to do it. How can we break out these sections? When I look at for the County in both the Engineering and the Planning Department, it is almost like internship for their real job, because once they get the County knowledge, then they are really valuable for the private sector. Help me understand, because I appreciate that you said the State classifications has not changed in years, while the market has evolved, this is what you are talking about, right?

Ms. Matsuyama: Yes, it is hard for us to recruit and retain.

Councilmember Cowden: But because the State classification system has not changed, so I am trying to address the very issue that you are highlighting here. What can we do? You have years of experience, how can we change this bargaining situation, because that is where it needs to happen, right?

Ms. Rapozo: After going to negotiations for many years, the unions are the ones putting their demands on the table and as a State, we are bargaining for those raises or whatever they want to do. Some of the issues with some of the Unit 3 clerical staff is that there is a salary schedule that spans many steps. When they bargain, they must look at paying for the different steps, and so you will look at a Unit 3, blue collar type of contract where it is one-step for each particular job classification. They can put more of their percentage in their across-the-board, that way, because they do not have steps, versus a Unit 3 that has to put it across-the-board. We have, as a state, tried to negotiate and ask the union to compress that scale, so that we can provide more of an incentive for new hires to come in. We have not been successful as an employer. There are many different things and when you look at the classification system, you have to realize that every position that is classified affects every other one. While we may want to look at the beginning steps for some of the classified senior clerks, the low staff, if we move that, we are going to have to move everyone else. I am not saying that is a wrong thing, I think maybe we need to do that, but it is going to be very costly because everyone will have to move.

Councilmember Cowden: Forgive me for having always been in the private sector. I have never worked in a union and I have never had union, so I do not have the depth of understanding that maybe a handful of my colleagues have that have years of experience with union. I am fresh eyes. It seems to me that we need more classifications, so you do not have to get everyone all at the same time, but maybe that is the whole point of the union, I do not know. It seems like it feels a little powerless in this budget process, when you see the critical needs, I am looking at real property tax, you folks are like right in the crosshairs of the target, we need them to want their jobs. We need to compensate them for their jobs. That is who my eyes are on right at the moment. I do not know if we can have a Committee meeting where we can give you better feedback because it seems like this is...I like how you framed it, it is failing our effectiveness as a county, because we cannot appropriately compensate our people so we have volunteers. Even just this weekend, I was at some event and who were the hotel staff feeding us at the banquets, are people who work full-time in really key positions, and I am not putting down banquet work, it just does not seem like people should be doing their full-time job and then they are taking my plate. Absolute respect

to the people taking my plate, but we are somehow not meeting the needs. The Finance Department brings home the bacon. We need to bring it home right, in a way that does not get rid of everything, the people that we need. I am saying something is not working. I want to see how Council can have a little bit more impact, because for four (4) years I have felt helpless in this role and we have no choice and we just said, "Yes," but we say yes to something that is not going to solve the situation.

Ms. Rapozo: Besides the classification system that Reiko may have alluded to being outdated, we need to remember total compensation for our government workers includes benefits, and that is huge. Eighty (80) something percent that we add to the cost of every person.

Councilmember Cowden: How many people?

Ms. Rapozo: I would need to check.

Councilmember Cowden: So, if we paid someone \$20,000 we are having \$100,000 total.

Councilmember Kualifii: No, 80% of twenty-five (25).

Councilmember DeCosta: Percentage, not a number.

Ms. Rapozo: So, let us say it was 100%, if you are paying someone \$20,000, the cost to us would actually be \$40,000.

Councilmember Cowden: Okay.

Ms. Rapozo: It is total compensation—some of those things need to be looked at. Our benefits are a lot. I think employees right now, are they looking at retirement, are they looking at their leave days, are they looking at holidays, no. They need the money. They need the money in-hand, but that has already been bargained for, so those are all of the things, to me, that we need to put on the table to the unions and say, "Okay, if we are going to give more money in-hand, are we going to look at the benefits?" It is a lot that has been bargained for in the past. It is not a popular thing to take away, but it is something that "is that the way we want to go"?

Councilmember Cowden: Yesterday, we have spoken to us that it is not worth staying once they hit their retirement level, even if it is at their 10-year vesting, they are better off leaving. Somehow something is not working. I appreciate that Director Matsuyama put that, "When we do not change to accommodate the market, we lose any competitive advantage with the private sector." I would say for the Finance Department, as well as the Planning Department, our number one economy is not the visitor industry, it is the land development industry. Pulling people from the Finance Department and the Planning Department, which is so critical to our bread and butter. This is where our problem is. I think I said enough, but I just really want to make the emphasis strong.

Council Chair Rapozo: Unfortunately, that is way beyond this Council's—she brings up a good point, you bring up a good point, as far as the ripple effect of when you move one classification, but at the end of the day it needs to be done. We talked about the County and State benefits, I always thought we had the best, and my wife works for the State, and until you figure out your retirement calculation, then you realize, “I cannot...” unless you are in some high-level position, but the majority of the workforce in the County and the State are not in that 6-figure. If you look at our budget, it is not the County's fault, it is the civil service. When my wife went to check and saw what she had, she cannot retire, simply cannot retire. When I worked at the hotel, the benefits at the hotel was much better than in the county. We had holiday pay, we had paid time off (PTO)—the ability to stay home and get paid, we had a 401(k) option where the employer paid in up to 3% of what I put in, which is much better than what the county offers, seriously. In the old days, you could not touch government benefits, but in today's world...because of the competitiveness, private sector has matched or even improved the benefits. If you are in the hotel industry, you do not have a medical payment, we pay for medical here, yes, the County pays a big chunk of it, but the employee still pays. Again, this is not directed to the County, this is the system. The ripple effect is so bad, when the minimum wages get increased, when we get to the \$18 an hour mandatory minimum wage, how do you think the County will look trying to attract people? When anywhere out here and no matter what you do, no matter what entry level that position is, you are going to get \$18 an hour, and we are still paying people \$16/\$17 an hour here. Now, that is going to have to go up, which means the classifications all will have to go up. I guess what I am suggesting is not a Council discussion, it is a statewide discussion with all of the counties, the Civil Service Commission, and the unions—now is the time because when \$18 hit, we have employees that get paid less than that in this County. A couple of our women were, so we are going to have to move everyone up to at least \$18, which means everyone will have to go up. That is inevitable. I guess taking up on what Councilmember Cowden said, the discussions need to start now with the State, all of the counties, and...Councilmember Kualii.

Councilmember Kualii: You said the classification has not changed in years and negotiations happen every few years, in the past negotiations has it even been talked about? Should it not be a part of every negotiation going forward at this point?

Ms. Matsuyama: What I was referring to there is more like the State classification system, and Janine knows more than me and I struggle with this as well, but what the minimum requirements are to meet certain jobs that are just \$16/\$17 an hour. That is what we struggle with, like in the Real Property Tax Division and the Department of Motor Vehicles (DMV), we have to start from the very bottom while we recruit. We cannot get anyone with any type of experience, because we do not pay them enough for their experience level that they have. The trade-off does not work when we are trying to recruit.

Councilmember Kualii: So, you are also saying it is not about the cost of raising the pay for those positions, but it is also about the State people who are in charge of this classification system to look at the qualifications, because they may not be...everything included now may be at a higher level than is necessary.

Ms. Matsuyama: Yes, kind of. It just does not jive. For what we are requiring them to have as experience, we are not compensating them to that level as compared to the private sector. There is no balance.

Councilmember Kualif'i: So, no one has gotten us to the point...because like what Ms. Rapozo said, it would be very costly. Unless you see the numbers, then you cannot say, "Yes, that costs a lot," but we have to do it, it is a priority, and relatively speaking, it is an expense that needs to be...

Ms. Rapozo: All I was saying is that if we start to fiddle with the classification system of the lower level positions, it is going to affect the entire scale of classifications and we have people classified from an SR-4, we do not have any in this County, but they have some in the State and City, all the way and beyond SR-26. If you move these folks up, everyone's scale is going up, because they have already been determined that this is the level of the benchmarked class and where do you fall within that particular benchmark? Do you go two (2) more steps up or two (2) less? It is a salary rating.

Councilmember Kualif'i: And ultimately that only happens at the bargaining table, with negotiations.

Ms. Rapozo: Classification is no longer part of bargaining; it is part of repricing whether or not a particular position would get moved. If we are looking to move something higher, like a Senior Clerk we feel should be more than an SR-10, we would have to look at the entire State and get feedback. If we move someone up, then they know they will have to move their people up because it is the same classification or the same type of requirements. That is how it keeps "in check," that someone cannot just go rogue and just do their own classification system on their own. Everyone is looking out for each other and figuring out, well if you move that, you are going to have to move this and that, that is how it works.

Councilmember Kualif'i: I would imagine that most of the employees, especially when they are initially hired, they do not see the value of...you say that is 80%, that is super high. Obviously, it has gone up over the years because of the cost of benefits have gone up, but does the County, when we are hiring new people, make it very clear to them what they are being compensated and what everything costs, and what they are really getting, so they know that there is a value.

Ms. Rapozo: In the recent postings, those have all been added, what your benefits are, the twenty-one (21) days of sick leave, the twenty-one (21) days of vacation, your medical, your thirteen (13) or fourteen (14) holidays...

Councilmember Kualif'i: Is there a dollar-value attached to it?

Ms. Rapozo: It would be different for each person because it would have to be...

Councilmember Kualiti: Can the computer do that function?

Ms. Rapozo: Depending, right, if you are a higher paid employee, the value is going to be higher versus someone at a lower level.

Councilmember Kualiti: Because you hire people with ranges, right? I am talking about the new hires. I think that is part of that too, and Council Chair Rapozo might be right in saying that the benefits are not as good, but I think the value you put to the benefits was different. Young people care less about retirement and things like that.

Ms. Rapozo: Exactly. One of the things we have to remember is that the State gives us a defined retirement system, no matter what, you are going to get your retirement, if you reach that vesting, which is unlike some other places. It is different and that is where people are having to contribute more and more. When I started, it was noncontributory, we did not have to put anything in and then it changed to 6% and now, it is 8%. Just imagine coming in at that level and you have to also put in 8% of your pay towards retirement, it is hard. It is because our retirement system is at a point where they needed to fund their retirement system. They have people who are retirees who are longer collecting from retirement than worked in the system, especially schoolteachers, and we are all in the same system. KPD and KFD can all retire at twenty-five (25), now it is a little bit longer, but twenty-five (25) years and they can go out. This group has expanded to the point where...us working people are supporting these people and we are going to be there at one-point, but right now, that is where it is at.

Councilmember Cowden: I know we are probably going to have to take a break in a moment, but I will just state it and then maybe we can talk about it when we get back. I am looking at the operational highlights on the process automation, and I still want to keep Ms. Rapozo in here for this. When we have a chance, I want to talk about where you find that this has impacted the budget positively and then layering into so you can think about it on our break is, artificial intelligence is replacing many jobs. When we look at what is going on in the future, I sent you a video, I do not know if you watched it last week, and just how far ahead it is moving. I think that there might be some jobs to squeeze out, but what it is not replacing is some of our lowest classifications of team members. A person who actually is wrenching or cleaning or using their hands, those are irreplaceable people and it is unnerving how much replacement there is, so I want to think about...just learning what you are doing and how we streamline to keep our people from repetitive tasks, but inspired. We want to be an organization of human beings. How we do our mass analysis of...

Ms. Matsuyama: Mass appraisal?

Councilmember Cowden: Mass appraisal, yes. You know, human beings maybe still would be doing a better job of how we have our people to be able to go in and look and still adjust and adapt what those things are. 11:00 a.m. we have to break.

Council Chair Rapozo: Yes, we have to take a caption break. I want to have these questions specific for the Finance Department and not for HR, HR already had theirs...we want to keep it to the Finance Department.

Councilmember Cowden: Okay, well it is the Finance Department, so we cannot have her, but it is like...I want to know what we have gotten done with our automation and then which jobs maybe that have been streamlined or enhanced, because you are saying that there is this efficiency and so ultimately that is going to end up influencing how many people we need to hire and who is in the employment pieces or how that works.

Council Chair Rapozo: We will get that response after the caption break, because it is already after 11:00 a.m. We will also go through each division, so each division can talk about the efficiencies and what is replacing humans.

Councilmember Cowden: Yes, just an overview, just a thought.

Council Chair Rapozo: Okay, ten (10) minutes.

There being no objections, the meeting recessed at 11:02 a.m.

The Committee reconvened at 11:15 a.m., and proceeded as follows:

(Councilmember Kagawa was noted as not present.)

Committee Chair Rapozo: I will call the meeting back to order. Councilmember Cowden's—you have an overview response to that?

Ms. Matsuyama: In my highlights, I was trying to talk about the efficiencies that we have implemented throughout the Finance Department, a lot of it has to do with the use of Laserfiche, that is a program that we use. Basically, instead of passing this paper from one person to another, there is a workflow that happens in the system, so all I do is sign off and it automatically goes to the next person. The workflow is already imbedded in the work product and so it really is not taking away from someone's job duties, they still have to do the same thing, but instead of paper and pen signing it, they would click the button and it would automatically route.

Councilmember Cowden: Okay.

Council Chair Rapozo: But I think county-wide, and this is not just this year, I mean every year we buy things to be more efficient and I think that is what Councilmember Cowden was talking about is that...for as long as I have been around, every budget we get items to purchase, typically software or maybe it is a piece of equipment that will make us more efficient and I think the question is, "When we go down that direction, are we cognizant of what we will be replacing?" Every budget, we also include more positions, so we get more positions and we get more programs or projects that make us more efficient and how does that balance out?

Ms. Matsuyama: In our experience at the Finance Department, every employee would be super-receptive to more efficient technology, because they are just overburdened and overworked. I do not think that it is necessarily reducing people, but having them explore other alternatives to making things more efficient, reviewing more processes to see how we can better work. It is always about improvement, we are trying to not just “put your head down and grind” but inevitably that is what happens, but overall we would like to focus on processes and improvements as much as we can.

Council Chair Rapozo: Go ahead.

Councilmember Cowden: A very simple example is the car registration kiosks in the grocery stores, that makes life easier for DMV and it makes life easier for the people getting their car registered. The fact that we are paying directly to the bank now, the checks go in and there is a lot of things that...when I first started working, you were counting all the money every night, literally, but we are seeing improvements all over the place. Now, you have more people get in online. Do you find that your productivity has increased? Do we have more people get their things answered and less people at the counter waiting? I know we just hired a new counter help.

Ms. Matsuyama: That depends on the division. For Treasury, we still do cash counts every single day, that is part of someone’s daily work, so we prep the bag that gets transported to the bank. Having the kiosks and basically decentralizing really does help our process.

Councilmember Cowden: You were counting the checks too?

Ms. Matsuyama: Yes.

Councilmember Cowden: The checks go directly to the bank and there is online...but we are still needing more people. Is that because the volume has gone up?

Ms. Matsuyama: For DMV, yes. I do not have the kiosks’ data on-hand, but we do get pretty good usage, mainly for the Lihu’e and Kapa’a Safeway kiosks, but we have 85,000 vehicles on-island, if you divide that by twelve (12), and say what monthly foot traffic would potentially need to go into DMV, it is significant.

Council Chair Rapozo: Councilmember DeCosta.

Councilmember DeCosta: I know we do not normally talk about it, but it was brought up in other departments, about people retiring and what are we doing for retention? I noticed that you have excellent camaraderie, only because I walked into your division and I have been there many times. How do you do it? How do you bring that camaraderie into your division? I think that is an understatement when you talk about...when we cannot meet the pay scale of the union, it is set, we cannot give incentive bonuses because it is part of the union, it is set, but how do you do such a great job with camaraderie? I see your leaders in

here and spoke with them on the break and they both are not looking to go to the private sector, so you must be doing something right, Ms. Matsuyama. Would you like to share a little bit?

Ms. Matsuyama: I mean, thank you. I feel like I can always do more, we could always do more, but it is really connecting with the employees on a personal basis and not just on a work scale.

Councilmember Cowden: Because you know you could always work for another company for an extra \$1 or \$2 an hour, but you have to deal with that boss who is very disrespectful, authoritative, and micromanaging, you would give up that extra \$2 an hour. Thank you for that.

Council Chair Rapozo: Are there further questions on the overview? If not, we will go right into the division, the first division is the Administration.

Councilmember Kualii: On page 2 in the overview, you talked about the insurance and then in the budget's master page 38, it has the liability insurance.

(Councilmember Kagawa was noted as present.)

Councilmember Kualii: Your total of the \$317,000 on the narrative is both the liability insurance and the property insurance?

Ms. Matsuyama: That is correct. Basically, the insurance...it has been going up every single year. What we are requesting is a 10% increase over our prior year renewals and the renewals come up November 1st of every year, so it is kind of hard to budget, but our broker recommends that type of cushion in the budget. Two years ago, we had to come for a money bill because our insurance was way over what we had budgeted, we were able to absorb it this year, but it weighs heavily on us.

Councilmember Kualii: Thank you.

Council Chair Rapozo: We have to work hard in reducing claims and that is not...I am just saying. We talked with the County Attorney on ways that we can reduce claims and when we have claims, that there is some remedial training or something to that effect, so we are not having these repeat claims all the time. That is just a necessary evil, insurance. Are there further questions for the Administration? I think the insurance was the only big increase. The Humane Society is in there as well.

Councilmember Kualii: We did that.

Council Chair Rapozo: Okay. Moving on to Accounting, page 43. IT?

Ms. Matsuyama: She wanted a question.

Council Chair Rapozo: Oh, I can go back.

Councilmember Cowden: Yes, I thought we were just settling down into it.

Council Chair Rapozo: No, if you have a question, I am just going by division and if you look at our plus and minus sheet, it gives you...

Councilmember Cowden: So, we are at Accounting.

Councilmember Kagawa: Yes.

Councilmember Cowden: Are you all staffed up for that?

Ms. Matsuyama: Yes, we have no vacancies in Accounting.

Councilmember Cowden: How is it going?

RENEE YADAO, Accounting Systems Administrator: Good morning, Council Chair Rapozo, Vice Chair Kualii, and Members of the Council. Well, it is going. We constantly have a lot of volume in our division.

Councilmember Cowden: A lot of what?

Ms. Yadao: Volume, transactional volume. So, financial transactions, everything flows through the Accounting Division. As best as we can, with the resources we have, we do our best every day and I thank my team every day.

Councilmember Cowden: What help do you need? Is there something on this budget here that you do not have, but you need? It sounds like it is difficult. Is there something you need that you do not have?

Ms. Yadao: Thank you for asking that, Councilmember Cowden. I have been in discussion with Director Matsuyama regarding my needs and my resources, so we are in discussion. However, if I can share that it is challenging year-over-year because there are vacancies that happen, normal attrition, retirement happens, and we do have a lot of volume in our office. As much as possible, we cross-train and cross-function, so we can manage the County and our constituents. We do our best, again, and I thank my team every day for coming to work.

Councilmember Cowden: Is your software...I know four (4) years ago, it actually looked like greenscreen, where are you at? I know we were funding money for upgrades for the accounting software, has that happened and are you happy with it?

Ms. Yadao: Thank you for asking the question. We are currently in the process of brainstorming if we are going to indeed replace our current ARP or upgrade.

Councilmember Cowden: Are you still on greenscreens?

Ms. Yadao: To get back to that, yes, some are on the greenscreen, however, we use NaviLine, that is a software, we can utilize the attachment features in the software functionality. With the purchasing cards (P-Cards), we have thousands and thousands of P-Card transactions every year, so we utilize NaviLine so the individual can upload their documents and it becomes 100%...we do not have paper. It is easier for us to review.

Councilmember Cowden: It sounds like you are doing okay, but I am hearing stress in all of this, so is there something you are not getting?

Ms. Yadao: As you know we prepare the ACFR in the Accounting Division.

Councilmember Cowden: Yes.

Ms. Yadao: Yes.

Councilmember Cowden: Yes, and thank you for the work you do on that.

Ms. Yadao: Thank you so much, it is appreciated.

Council Chair Rapozo: What do you prepare?

Ms. Yadao: The Annual Comprehensive Financial Report, the document that is this thick. So, yes, seven (7) months of the year is dedicated to the ACFR for the County. It is produced in the Accounting Division. It is a collaborative effort amongst the entire County and I am the liaison between the County and the external auditors. It is a production, but I am at the end of the baton, I am the last to receive it, so it is hard, because I just recently finished at the end of January. I go through my peaks and valleys, yes.

Ms. Matsuyama: But in the seven (7) months that they are managing the ACFR process, like they still have to keep up with the volume, the work. Like I told you earlier, every division—they are one of the major users of Laserfiche and they got that right in the nick of time, really. Thanks to them, the workflows in Laserfiche and behind the scenes, it is really intense. To get that up and running was crucial, but again, like she tells us, they are grinding. As we evolve and create efficiencies, it is not necessarily reducing staffing amongst us, because there is still a need for all of them.

Councilmember Cowden: If I can make a comment on ACFR.

Ms. Matsuyama: Yes.

Councilmember Cowden: I am someone who reads the entire document and the summary of last year was just extraordinary, helpful, and easy—I appreciated that, so I am sure part of it is my learning curve that I get what I am getting, but really good job. Is that you who writes that?

Ms. Yadao: Thank you. I do take a lot of pride in my work and I do appreciate you reading it. It does...it takes a lot.

Councilmember Cowden: It takes a lot to read it. I can only imagine what it takes to write and compose that entire big document, but that opening really helps; the quality of job that you do helps me process that responsibility far more effectively, so thank you so much.

Ms. Yadao: Thank you. I appreciate that.

Council Chair Rapozo: You said you have no vacancies; all your positions are full?

Ms. Yadao: Currently, no. We have no vacancies.

Council Chair Rapozo: The County has always...I do not want to say short-staff, but just you never had a lot...I think from my recollection, you have probably more positions than you did four (4) or six (6) years ago, so I remember one year, I think the Council put in a position. That has not grown and yet I keep hearing that the work is growing, everything is getting more and more, I hate asking this of department heads or division heads because the boss is sitting right next to you, but is that sufficient? If it was Christmas and I was Santa Claus, would another accountant be helpful?

Ms. Yadao: I appreciate that, and yes. Honestly, I look to help my staff, my team, because they help me do my job. It is increasingly difficult for me at my level because I am the only one who implements the Governmental Accounting Standards Board (GASB) for the County and year-over-year, we continue to increase our GASB because of increasing accountability. GASB oversees local governments. We need to implement these pronouncements based on how it impacts the County, so yes, it does cause strain for me because I am at the tail end of the baton and I am working towards the deadline to get it done.

Council Chair Rapozo: We cannot count you in on the day-to-day, but you are saying you “do” day-to-day to help the workload?

Ms. Yadao: Yes.

Council Chair Rapozo: I see Reiko nodding, that is a good sign.

Ms. Matsuyama: I would say, if you ask any department head or division head, they are all going to tell you the same thing, they are all short-staffed and maybe a lot of it has to do with vacancies, in Ms. Yadao's case, that is not the case.

Council Chair Rapozo: That is the difference between this one and the rest. Every other division has vacancies, this division does not and I can only imagine. A lot of the discussion we have throughout the budget is the increase in work. Everything funnels through Accounting, so if we get increases in work all over the place, I would assume Accounting gets stuck with...

Ms. Matsuyama: I think that is the same as like IT, Purchasing...we got the administrative functions in Finance, and while everyone else gets new computers, new P-Card, all of that work gets piled on the Finance Department. We are the division that gets left behind because it is the administrative work that a lot of times goes unseen and we are not public facing...DMV and Real Property aside, but these folks are not necessarily dealing with the public. Their customers are internal to the County.

Council Chair Rapozo: Councilmember DeCosta.

Councilmember DeCosta: I worked for a few large union companies, I worked for a company for ten (10) years, I worked for the Department of Education, which is one of the largest teachers union, and I know one thing, when I was a salaried worker, we had no compensation, whether you work six (6) hours or ten (10) hours. When I was on the union side and where I got paid hourly, you can slow that operation down, so you can make your 7 ½ hours of regular time, your two (2) hours of overtime and your hazardous pay. What I am looking at is a lady, and I heard many good things about you, running a division that has to cram everything into a certain period to get things out. Do we have enough in our overtime budget, because I notice the budget is very low compared to a lot of the other departments and sometime overtime is a little way to compensate your employees who are head down in the books, getting things done. I am not encouraging overtime, but I am telling you that is a little tool you can use. Are you able to use that tool to help with your employees, so they do not feel like they are trying to cram ten (10) hours of work into an 8-hour day? We are here to help you.

Ms. Yadao: Yes, I do approve overtime, when it is needed and when it is warranted.

Councilmember DeCosta: Let the Council know if you need a little more in that budget. We do not want to see your personnel leave.

Ms. Yadao: I do not either.

Council Chair Rapozo: Councilmember Cowden.

Councilmember Cowden: Forgive me, I have a hard time with acronyms, what does GASB mean?

Ms. Yadao: Government Accounting Standards Board.

Councilmember Cowden: Okay. I just wanted to ask a little bit about physical office space, like even if we had another person; is the Treasury Division still in the basement?

Ms. Yadao: Yes.

Councilmember Cowden: When I look at the Treasury Division and the Office of the County Attorney, I rather work upstairs than in the basement. Is it a problem that people are sitting in a dark room counting numbers all day long?

Ms. Yadao: I am sorry, let me clarify, it is not the Treasury Division in the basement, it is our IT Division.

Councilmember Cowden: IT is in there, but the Treasury Division was in there too.

Ms. Matsuyama: The Treasury Division is currently right behind the DMV.

Councilmember Cowden: Okay, so they moved upstairs, because they were down there.

Ms. Matsuyama: They were always close to the DMV because that is where the money transactions are.

Councilmember Cowden: I know that IT is in the basement...but you have enough space for people to be there, you are not too crowded?

Ms. Yadao: In my office, yes.

Councilmember Cowden: Okay.

Council Chair Rapozo: Are there any more questions for the Accounting Division? If not, thank you. The Accounting Division is one that I want to really support.

Ms. Matsuyama: Okay.

Council Chair Rapozo: Not that I do not support the rest, but when I look at the list of positions in the other departments, I am like, "Oh, my gosh," they have a lot. This one is just a very critical function. Next up, is IT.

Councilmember Kualii: Just the 2-vacant positions, I know you used the word imminent when you gave your overview, but starting with Position No. 266 on page 48,

Administrative Support Assistant, just newly vacant, a month ago. The status on the recruitment says, "Continuous," but it is something other than that, right? Where is that?

Ms. Matsuyama: Yes, so for the Administrative Support Assistant, we are still trying to figure out what we are going to post it as. It is probably going to be the Project Manager series, which is different from what it was before, so we are redescribing that position to make it into something that can best serve our needs. That position is being redescribed and we are going to post it probably by the end of the month for a Project Manager.

Councilmember Kualii: And you can get that filled and working by July 1st?

Ms. Matsuyama: That is the goal. We will post it by the end of this month, interviews in May, and then hopefully get someone on July 1st.

Councilmember Kualii: The other position is Position No. 293—Information Technology Specialist V. That one has been vacant for quite a while, 257 days. The description is "list referred."

Ms. Matsuyama: We have gone through multiple rounds of recruitment for that position and that is the Cyber Specialist that you folks approved in the FY 2023 Budget, so the number of days that it has been vacant, has been since July 1, 2022. We have gone out two (2) or three (3) times, interviewed a bunch of people, but no one seems to have that specialized cyber experience that we are looking for, so what we are doing right now is revamping the PD, looking to the other counties to see what they have in their PDs, so that we can get someone more specialized.

Councilmember Cowden: "PD"?

Ms. Matsuyama: Position Description.

Councilmember Kualii: Thank you. Not relating to the positions, but I have another question. On our (inaudible), it shows "Dues and Descriptions" went down drastically by \$1,700,000 and then IT Arrangement SBITA went up by \$1,900,000, so I am guessing that one has something to do with the other?

Ms. Matsuyama: That is correct. Because of the GASB pronouncements that Renee folks have to deal with, there are software leases that have to be accounted for differently in this upcoming fiscal year. What we did was we created this new 3101 account, so you will probably see it throughout the county, but we moved anything that requires review of an annual subscription reclassified from wherever it was to this new 3101 account. Most of the change is due to that, but not all. We did increase some, so we did an across-the-board 4% increase to some of the software licenses and then the Microsoft one, we actually increased by 12%, but that is because we added some cyber benefits on to the Microsoft contract. It was required through our cyber liability coverage, from the insurance.

Councilmember Kualii: But this represents a lot of the expense for across the county, but we see it also in some other places.

Ms. Matsuyama: For most of those, like the Microsoft, the Laserfiche, those are used Countywide, but most of them are housed in IT.

Councilmember Kualii: Because I thought I saw that SBITA in some other places.

Ms. Matsuyama: Oh, yes, so the 3101 account number, that you are going to see across...every single one of my divisions and then basically across all departments, so anyone that has a software lease would be in this new...

Councilmember Kualii: Is that all the different areas across the county sharing the cost of the system?

Ms. Matsuyama: No, it is just a new account number, so we just had to reclassify...so for example, HR has Workday, Workday is one of those that require this new accounting treatment, so it moved from wherever it was before to this new 3101 account, but all of the work is housed in HR and then all of the ones that you see here are housed in IT.

Council Chair Rapozo: I think even Fire...

Ms. Matsuyama: Yes.

Council Chair Rapozo: I saw that in pretty much all of the departments.

Ms. Matsuyama: Yes.

Council Chair Rapozo: But they are responsible for their own licenses and renewals?

Ms. Matsuyama: That is correct.

Council Chair Rapozo: Councilmember Carvalho.

Councilmember Carvalho: I wanted to follow-up on the status of the LIMS program, page 50.

DEL SHERMAN, Information Technology Manager: As far as the LIMS program, we have gone into a maintenance phase for LIMS right now where we have moved the funds to continue LIMS into operating expenses, previously, it was a CIP item. We continue to develop the LIMS program by nature of adding enhancements and new functionality to the software that we procured to support LIMS. LIMS being, for those who may not know, Land

Information Management System, but it involves so much more than that. It is more of an asset management system, land just being one of many assets that the County processes. We use LIMS to manage functions within the Transportation Agency, for example, when it comes to maintaining their infrastructure, buses and such. That program continues to grow and I think it has really...got some momentum behind it at this point where a lot of County departments are taking advantage of that software and using it to automate different tasks, so I feel pretty good about where we are at with it and where we are headed.

Councilmember Carvalho: It evolved from where it started...reaching out more from what I see and understand, so I just wanted to point that out.

Mr. Sherman: Very much so. For anyone who would like a deeper dive into LIMS, we can arrange that—a one-on-one discussion so you can see some of the projects that we have tackled and the progress that we have made.

Council Chair Rapozo: What is Barracuda?

Mr. Sherman: Barracuda is a software company that is being presently used for archiving emails and for filtering spam and protecting us against email fishing.

Council Chair Rapozo: Are we still actively using PowerDMS? I go on my PowerDMS and there is no courses, there is nothing...I thought we were going to put up courses for the employees to go learn. Is it just department-specific?

Mr. Sherman: PowerDMS really was procured more so to provide an online operation manual, Standard Operating Procedures and not as much for training, although it can serve that function. There are some training courses out there that are available. PowerDMS also has become a repository for some of the operations guides for Workday, "how to" guides to do different tasks within Workday, so you can find those within PowerDMS.

Council Chair Rapozo: Got it. Councilmember Cowden.

Councilmember Cowden: When I am looking at all these different software packages that we have, I do not see Workday here on this part of the budget, is it somewhere else?

Mr. Sherman: Workday is supported by HR.

Councilmember Cowden: So, all of it is in...

Ms. Matsuyama: HR's budget.

Mr. Sherman: Yes. The costs for Workday are in the HR budget.

Councilmember Cowden: Okay. I will just say I would like a deeper dive on the LIMS systems, so I will set that one up. How are you feeling on where we are coming...like 4 years ago, we were moving into a lot of these new software programs and we have really come along way, Workday, Mama, etcetera. I am very happy with (inaudible) and Granicus. How have you felt the growth is? Are we on track for what our goals were at the beginning of Mayor Kawakami's budget? How are we doing?

Mr. Sherman: I think we are nicely on track. I would say in the past, maybe five (5) to six (6) years, we have made more progress with modernizing our computer systems and software than we probably have in the last three (3) decades. It has been phenomenal, it has been a tremendous amount of work, but well worth it, and I think that we have made great strides in those areas and will continue to do so. It is a never-ending task; technology will always be a little bit ahead of where you are and you will never catch up. Nor, will you probably want to, because then you will start making expensive mistakes when you are on the cutting edge of technology, but I think we are doing quite well.

Councilmember Cowden: Would you say that most of our efforts right now is still in development and bringing on new technologies or are we starting to hit a maintenance phase.

Mr. Sherman: With certain systems, we are getting close to a maintenance phase. But we are also tackling some new projects, for example this Enterprise Resource Planning and it is a little more than that, but it would involve potential replacements to the County's entire accounting system, that is just getting started. It will be many years before we were to reach a maintenance phase with that.

Councilmember Cowden: I asked about the Treasury Division being in the basement and IT is in the basement, but that probably makes sense for the protection and the temperature of the equipment, is that why we have IT in the basement? Are you alright in the basement?

Mr. Sherman: I think we are pretty happy in the basement.

Councilmember Cowden: Okay.

Mr. Sherman: It sounds bad—"basement," like dungeon...

Councilmember Cowden: There is no light.

Mr. Sherman: But it is pretty well lit, it is accessible, it is near the loading dock, so we can receive shipments and bring those into the building easily. The space is newly renovated, so the AC down there is probably the most modern that we have in the county, with UV filtering and all types of protections in place, so it is a good work environment.

Councilmember Cowden: If you are in development, I would think for your staff you are able to recruit inspired workers, because usually people want to work in the development phase more than the maintenance phase, is your team happy enough?

Mr. Sherman: I think we have done quite well. We recently hired an individual. I can share details on that with you, maybe outside of this venue, but we were really fortunate to get some good talent there and we got a good base that we were able to build on already. We are really happy with where we are at with that. I think we have been fortunate to be able to get people to come work for the county that are probably being paid well below their level of expertise, but they like it here, this is their home and so they are willing to work for the County. We have been fortunate.

Councilmember Cowden: Okay, and you are able to do some of the remote work, is that still happening? I know during COVID-19 there were some people who were working remotely, is that still happening? Is everyone back in the building?

Mr. Sherman: We still allow remote work in IT. We have some requirements where I want staff to be in the office several days a week, but we will continue to support remote work, because I feel it is just a matter of time before the next crisis is on us and we will be required to support, it will become a necessity. I do not want to lose that skill. We are maintaining that option for IT workers to work remotely.

Councilmember Cowden: It sounds like in general, you are happy and you are happy with the budget as it pertains to you.

Mr. Sherman: I am happy.

Council Chair Rapozo: Do you have someone in the office that will answer your phone if someone calls for IT assistance?

Mr. Sherman: Yes.

Council Chair Rapozo: Or are all of your workers remote?

Mr. Sherman: The bulk of our workers that are remote are just the development folks.

Council Chair Rapozo: Okay.

Mr. Sherman: The staff that is supporting end-users, there is really no remote work for those.

Council Chair Rapozo: Okay.

Mr. Sherman: We can support it if needed, but generally they are all in the office and they are staffing that IT Help Desk phone number or that there is someone always there to pick up when you need help.

Council Chair Rapozo: I have had excellent service from your service people for the last many years.

Mr. Sherman: I am glad to hear it.

Council Chair Rapozo: Councilmember DeCosta.

Councilmember DeCosta: I had a couple of questions, we talked about page 48, Councilmember Kualii brought up 293-SR-24, that is a tough position to fill based on the lack of cyber experience. I noticed on page 49, you folks have some training, some funding amount, but you spent very little money on training. Are we able to train a qualified applicant that might lack the cyber...is some of this funding available to use for that or is this only used for a group training for all of our employees? Can we target that certain candidate that is coming onboard that might not fit that criteria or we know everything else is in place with that employee, but we want them and we can cyber train them? Can we use that funding? That is my first question.

Mr. Sherman: The moneys that we have identified in our training budget would be available potentially for that, however, for someone to come in and fill that position and be a benefit to the County, we are going to want them to have some pretty good skills in the cyber security arena already. It would be challenging to train them up to a level where we would really get full benefit from that position.

Councilmember DeCosta: You answered the question. Second question, and only because Councilmember Kagawa is an accounting major, I am an economics major, so we are number-crunching men. You made a comment, and I want to ask you to clarify your comment, about your accounting phase and you might be phasing them out. You have some new IT things coming in, but are you cross-referencing with your accounting manager that is in the back, because a lot of accounting is done "old school," and it is like teaching new math. I am a math teacher in building and construction and the "new math" does not always beat the old math. The new accounting IT software you folks have might not out do the number crunching with paper and pencil, so are you correlating and conversating pieces with your accounting manager in the back to make sure her people are going to be trained and are going to be up in the technology that you might think the county needs to be?

Mr. Sherman: When we reach the point of when we are actually making a selection of a product, it would be our Accounting department that would likely be driving that project, and not IT, because they are the experts. Even if we are calling it "accounting software," an Enterprise Resource Planning (ERP) software solution takes in even much more than accounting, so it can take in work orders and it could take in potentially asset management as well, all kinds of different workflows over and above just accounting,

but there will be a key player. We are really in the infancy of that project right now. I would say we are a year and one half away even from being able to make any selection.

Councilmember DeCosta: You answered my question when you said key player. You said you are working in collaboration with each other to make the best outcome.

Mr. Sherman: Absolutely.

Council Chair Rapozo: Are there further questions from IT? I have one. This is not just for you, because I see a lot of new vehicles being purchased from different departments. Do we not have the motor pool anymore? I thought the vehicles went one place and then different departments would go sign out, do we still do that?

Ms. Matsuyama: Yes, we still do the motor pool. IT does have a designated van for their transport needs, so they do not use the...

Council Chair Rapozo: They do not use the motor pool.

Ms. Matsuyama: They have one vehicle.

Council Chair Rapozo: Like the County Council.

Mr. Sherman: We do occasionally use the pool as well. We do have the one dedicated vehicle, but there are times when we need two (2) or three (3) vehicles, because we are headed off in other directions.

Council Chair Rapozo: Is this under your control?

Ms. Matsuyama: Yes.

Council Chair Rapozo: Okay, thank you.

Councilmember DeCosta: I have one question on page 51. Can you explain that cost budget item, computer supplies and peripherals.

Ms. Matsuyama: The computer replacements?

Councilmember DeCosta: Yes. I noticed you have some things like laptops, tablets, etcetera. Are those things outdated every couple of years? Is there an upgrade or sometimes it is, "Buy 10, you get one free," but those things do not last like the old ones. It is like they make it to break in two (2) years, so you must buy a new set. Where the "old school" things used to last a lifetime. Is that what you see with the technology? I swear if you go to the Home Depot, it will last three (3) to four (4) years and then it breaks, whereas the old Kenmore's would last for twenty something years. Is that what you have been seeing, and can we shop around? I would rather see us approve a higher budget and get better quality things than buy cheaper and have it replaced every couple of years.

Mr. Sherman: The equipment that we use for computers is some of the best in the industry, so we do not buy cheap equipment by any means. We buy it with the intent of making it last as long as possible. Typically, you can expect a computer to be useful for four (4) to five (5) years, perhaps, maybe a little bit different lifetime on some of the mobile computers that Fire and KPD use. It is a really harsh environment that those things work in and some have to be replaced more often. But in spite of the four (4) to five (5) industry standards, we try to extend life of our machines a little bit beyond that, so we may do an upgrade at the end of its life, we try to extend that just to get our money's worth out of it. Does that answer your question?

Councilmember DeCosta: Pretty much. Thank you.

Council Chair Rapozo: Thank you very much. We will move onto the Treasury Division.

Councilmember Kualii: On Master page 54, the top vacant position, Position No. 232, Treasurer, vacant 102 days. The salary showing is much lower than what was on the salary before, almost a 12% decrease. The status says, "Request to recruit received." What is going on with that position?

Ms. Matsuyama: The salary that you had previously was an incumbent. When she left, we dropped it back down to the minimum. The recruitment just closed on the 31st, so I am hoping I get a list in the next couple of weeks from HR. This timeline is the same for the other vacant position as well. They were recruited on the same timeline, so they both closed on March 31st. Hopefully, I get a list mid-April and then can interview. I am hoping someone is on by May 1st.

Councilmember Kualii: Okay, thank you.

Council Chair Rapozo: Are there any further questions for the Treasury Division? If not, thank you. We will move on to Motor Vehicle.

Councilmember Kualii: The first one at the top came to us on the updated Vacancy Report, it is only seventeen (17) days vacant, but it is Position No. 292, DMV Service Representative III, \$46,608, it is the normal 8.9% increase, and all we have is new vacancies, so what is happening? Will you get the person on board by July 1st?

Ms. Matsuyama: We have three (3) total vacancies in DMV. We did just lose a supervisor and that is the position you are speaking of. The plan is to recruit internally and promote someone from within to take that supervisor position, which leaves three (3) Senior Clerks that are vacant for our filling. For all those positions, we have exhausted the interview list. I do not know how many interviews we have had, dozens. That is continuous recruitment, so we keep pulling the list and trying to fill in as quickly as possible.

Councilmember Kualii: You said three (3), but the updated report said that 251 was filled.

Ms. Matsuyama: Yes, we made an offer and it got declined.

Councilmember Kualii: Made offer, declined, so not filled then?

Ms. Matsuyama: Not filled.

Councilmember Cowden: I have a follow-up on that.

Council Chair Rapozo: So does Councilmember DeCosta.

Councilmember DeCosta: Just because you made a comment on Position No. 229, you folks are promoting from within? You are going to look at the qualified applicants within your department and promote a leader from within?

Ms. Matsuyama: That is correct.

Councilmember DeCosta: Why do you not get a qualified leader outside? Why do we not get a qualified leader outside? Why would we want someone from within?

Ms. Matsuyama: Ideally, we would get everyone who has experienced and we could potentially recruit from outside, but we would not ever do that, when we have acceptable and suitable candidates.

Councilmember DeCosta: Please, tell me a little bit more. How does it benefit your department when you promote from within?

Ms. Matsuyama: It gives better morale, to know that you have the opportunity to move up and I am sure we will get into the satellite discussion, but that will create more opportunities for higher level...

Councilmember DeCosta: I am floored by that answer. That was the answer I was hoping to hear and that is the answer I think all of our departments should be hearing right now. Thank you for that.

Councilmember Cowden: Just so I understand, we are short-staffed in our location here and we are opening...so we are going to really have a challenge in getting everyone trained up, right?

Ms. Matsuyama: That is probably going to be our biggest hurdle in getting the satellite up and running.

Councilmember Cowden: And we are going to try and get CDL trainers in both or...no?

Ms. Matsuyama: No. CDL will remain centralized in Līhu'e and all the other road tests will remain centralized in Līhu'e.

Councilmember Cowden: You are not going to do road tests in Kapa'a?

Ms. Matsuyama: No.

Councilmember Cowden: How come?

Ms. Matsuyama: One, the course is designated to what it needs to be and it is just simpler to keep it here. We could look to expand those services in the future...

Councilmember Cowden: Okay, and I know we already talked about the CDL, but we are going to try to have at least one person full-time and hopefully more than one person can do the CDL.

Ms. Matsuyama: Yes, and we have one person on staff that is an examiner, too. We just hired him and so he is still getting credentialed to do the exams.

Councilmember Kagawa: I ran into some frustrated people during Spring Break. A lot of times when they have divorced parents, they complained that they call and their calls are not returned, has that improved?

Ms. Matsuyama: The voicemails have been a problem, we acknowledge that, and we have improved it and we will continue to improve it. That is something that has been a problem in recent history.

Councilmember Kagawa: Say the appointment time is 10:00 a.m., and one parent cannot make it, they just lose their time?

JEREMY LEE, Motor Vehicle & Licensing Manager: If I could clarify your question, you are talking about an appointment for a road test or appointments for general services?

Councilmember Kagawa: Yes, to take the permit. Do they have appointments to even take the permit test?

Mr. Lee: Yes, sir.

Councilmember Kagawa: In a case of divorce, sometimes there is friction. If one parent is told to come with them and the parent does not show, then the kid cannot get the permit test.

Mr. Lee: Anyone can take the permit test without the parents currently available, we have a parent affidavit, minor affidavit available, they can

sign in front of a notary and do not have to be physically present. That takes the place of both parents needing to be physically available at the time of permit. Permit can be issued after we receive...

Councilmember Kagawa: So, they can pass the test, obtain the affidavit, and come back later, and then good to go?

Mr. Lee: Correct.

Councilmember Kagawa: Just what the Chair was saying, just to see if we can get the calls answered, because when they call us, a lot of times we do not know how to...and even Chair himself tried to call and he could not get a call back.

Council Chair Rapozo: Yes.

Councilmember Kagawa: I know you have staffing problems. In the past, we always had Marlene Moises, people that have been there for years and then after that there are new faces.

Ms. Matsuyama: I know my excuses are not going to be good enough and I would agree with you that they are not, but just to put it in perspective, we have thirteen (13) positions, three (3) of them are vacant, to handle twelve (12) windows. At the DMV, what you see is not what you get. You walk in and see one hundred (100) people and you are like, "Wow, they are busy," but in addition to that what you do not see is they get mail, drop box, voicemails, emails, dealership requests, and rental car requests. They have work coming at them from so many different angles. When you are three (3) down of those twelve (12) positions, you get people like Mr. Lee working the window, the supervisors working the window, and then...

Councilmember Cowden: You must get the mayor to work the window.

Ms. Matsuyama: The Mayor works the window.

Council Chair Rapozo: Listen, the excuses are not going make me happy.
Which three (3) positions are vacant?

Ms. Matsuyama: Position No. 251, Position No. 242, and Position No. 229.

Council Chair Rapozo: Okay. What are the titles?

Councilmember Kualii: Senior Clerk, (inaudible).

Council Chair Rapozo: The two (2) Senior Clerks, what would their job be?

Ms. Matsuyama: They work the window.

Council Chair Rapozo: Okay. Who answers the phones?

Ms. Matsuyama: The same people working the window.

Council Chair Rapozo: That is my point. I see you folks asking for five (5) new positions for Kapa'a and we cannot even fill Līhu'e. We cannot provide a service in Līhu'e. I am going to be honest, I am not going to even...and I do not know about the rest, but I am not sure you have the votes for Kapa'a, but I am not going to support the funds for Kapa'a, because we are not providing the service. Councilmember Kagawa mentioned my experience—I never received a call back.

Ms. Matsuyama: Yes, and...

Council Chair Rapozo: Our website is not informative enough. We are not designing it for you and you, we are designing it for *kūpuna*, most of them do not have access to the website, so they have to call. They call and hear a lovely message, I love your voicemail, but no one calls back. The appointment is wonderful, you make the appointment, it is great, but my mother-in-law, who is 86-years-old and I do not know what she has to bring. I go to the website first and you cannot figure it out. If you look at the website, it tells you to bring all your immigration documents, even though she has a Real identification (ID). If you click on the link, somewhere in that page, it takes you to state, "if you have a real ID, that you do not have to..." but that is not readily available, so I called, and I called, and I called. Two (2) days, four (4) times, no response. Do you know who is getting the calls? Do you know who is answering the calls for those questions? This office. Our staff is picking up the calls from the constituents who cannot get through to DMV and they are putting our staff in a position where they are on the website trying to figure out...that is unacceptable. I am telling you right now, I am not supporting any new positions for a new satellite office, because we are not doing the basic service here. This obviously frustrates me, because I was there for my mother-in-law trying and I cannot get a call back. Why do we not make the information on the front page where it says, "If you are renewing a Real ID, you do not have to bring anything, unless there are changes." Just put that on the front page rather than...the average person not going find it. Now, our staff calls someone across there and they said, "We are seventeen (17) days behind in answering phone calls," that is what our staff was told, which means my appointment would have come and went, and I would never have spoken to a human from DMV. I know the mayor is here listening and I am sure he is not happy. I spoke to Sarah about it, I spoke to you about it, and so you said you made improvements, but how can you make improvements if we are not finding people to answer calls. The person at the window does not have time to answer calls. Anywhere you go there is a little desk with a human that you can talk to. Over here we have a three (3) ring rule, thanks to our County Clerk, three (3) rings. That phone will not ring a fourth time, someone will answer that call. It bounces until someone answers. I expect that from DMV. I expect that from any county agency. Do you know what our citizens are getting every year? Higher tax bills, including this year. Higher tax bills and yet their services are being reduced. I am going to call DMV

and if I do not get an answer, I am not supporting these new positions. I hope my colleagues are going to follow me, because it is not right.

Ms. Matsuyama: I would agree that it is completely unacceptable. I would say that the staffing obviously has been an issue, but I think increasing the capacity will help us. There are going to be three (3) windows at the Kapa'a satellite, we are requesting five (5) positions, so hopefully that can take the workload off. When I say that we have made improvements, I will clarify that we have not made improvements to answering the phone, because we do not answer the phone, because what happens is...

Council Chair Rapozo: I feel like I need to take a break right here.

Ms. Matsuyama: ...we have made improvements to responding to the voicemails. What we have found is that...taking a voicemail and then calling them back is more efficient than spending time with them and getting them their request on the phone. That might sound bad...

Council Chair Rapozo: It sounds bad, do you know why, because they never returned the call.

Ms. Matsuyama: That is a problem and I promise you that part will be fixed. The problem with answering the calls is...kind of what I alluded to before, we just get work from so many angles and the same people have to deal with that work. When we tell someone, "Take a half hour right now and respond to these voicemails," that is a half hour that we are pulling them away from the window, from training...

Council Chair Rapozo: So, Reiko, why do I not see a new position here for a clerk to answer phones? Why do I not see a position somewhere in here, not a window personnel, but a position "telephone answerer," or whatever you folks want to classify that. I do not see that in here. What I see is you have two (2) vacant window positions. We can have them all at the window, but they still cannot answer phones, because they are working at the window. I have seen those women work at the window, much appreciation for those people, because they work hard. I do not expect them to answer calls, I expect some human to be sitting at a desk answering the phone. Even if they cannot answer every question, if someone answered that phone and said, "Mr. Rapozo, I do not have the answer, but..." it is the basic questions, put them on a cheat sheet. It is not complicated. What I see is we are going to get better with returning phone calls. No, I want to be better by having someone answer the phones. I know I cannot tell you what to do, but I am speaking from someone who had a rough experience and had I taken my mother-in-law in, I had COVID, so I could not take her in, I had to switch the appointment, but I just can imagine if I drove her in, we get there, and they say, "Oh, you are missing something." I would have been upset. Imagine if I came from Kekaha or the North Shore. I drove in, because someone did not call me back. It is real and that needs to be fixed.

Councilmember Cowden: I am going to follow-up on that and that is an argument for Kapa'a, because I know a few years back when I had to get mine renewed, four

(4) months it took me to get my driver's license renewed, because I went in and I did not have certain documents. When you have a job that requires you every day, like a teacher, you have to drive all the way into Līhu'e to get it done, it is a problem. I am respecting what he is saying and you might have an easier time hiring for Kapa'a, if you are hiring people from north. It is a long way to come to work every day down here, I know. Have you folks started your recruitment?

Ms. Matsuyama: The idea would be to hire them here at Kapule first and then train them up. We cannot send super green people to staff three (3) windows. We would hire a senior clerk, which is on continuous recruitment. We have in the budget, short-funded the positions to nine (9) months, because we are aware of the challenges of recruiting, but in an ideal situation, they would be in on July 1st, because they would be training.

Councilmember Cowden: If they know they are going to eventually be put there, you might be able to better get people to work up there. I am one hundred percent behind what he said in having a person whose job it is to be answering the phones. Getting a real voice is a lot better than a machine.

Councilmember Carvalho: I totally support what is being discussed right now. I heard a lot of comments from people who have called the DMV and cannot get information. Need I say more, I am backing up what Council Chair Rapozo said, so whatever you have to do, but someone has to answer that phone. Someone has to answer the phone, especially in this particular operation. If it is putting in a position, calling the Information Office or something, but numerous people have called and said they cannot get the information. I know you folks are working hard, we totally support you, I am talking as a councilmember, whatever we can do to support this, because I think it is very important. You would not believe how much people need to get something done. For me, it is something that has to be done as soon as possible. I am hoping we can do what we can, whether through the budget or through some follow up on this particular discussion. Kapa'a is great, but before Kapa'a, let us take care of Līhu'e, get it done, and then let us open up the door to other opportunities which will come. Whatever we can do to help, I just wanted to say that.

Mr. Lee: Council Chair Rapozo, I just want to validate your frustration, not only for your personal experience, for your team, and the general community that you are speaking for, it is one hundred percent (100%) justified and accurate. What our vacancy report does not show was the six (6) new hires that we recently had, so during the course of the pandemic, we lost a good chunk, 50% or so of our staff, and during that time we were going through massive infrastructure changes in the way that our organization is built and how it does work. No excuse will justify the lack of responsiveness from our team, but in the midst of our inability to answer those calls, we were also attempting to rebuild the structural elements of the DMV. I, admittedly, will say that is a major miss on our end and that is something we do need to recapture. We have a timeline planned to be able to complete the work of training up our team to be able to have the capacity to build the extra time in. Previously, we were getting relative timeliness of calls and emails, because we were allowing them an extra fifteen (15) to twenty (20) minutes after their lunch time on a daily basis to be

able to do that. With the short-staffed situation and the need to hire fifty percent (50%) of our front office staff, we (inaudible) in terms of the time management and workflow. No excuse, but we will come with a solution that we are currently working on doing the backlog and becoming responsive to people's emails and calls. I apologize for your personal experience, for the team, and for the general community for our inability to follow-through with that essential service to be responsive to the community. I would love an additional position to be able to answer calls, to be able to be responsive in a timely manner or for funds and resources to have a call center to be able to do tier-one touches. I have told our team that we should at least be calling back customers even though we do not have all the details of their needs or the answer, to just let them know we received their call. That way we can say to them, we heard you, even though I am not able to complete your service, I just want to let you know that we will get back to you. We are doing what we can with the staff that we have, and I appreciate your comments.

Council Chair Rapozo: When Becky took over the Prosecutor's Office, I was working there and the former prosecutor never had a problem with voicemails. Becky took over and changed that, had IT reprogrammed the phones so it bounced...I was getting calls to the direct line, even as an Investigator sitting in my office, because that was the policy. Everyone who calls in will talk to a human. Now, I could not answer a legal question, but I was able to tell that person calling, "I received your information and I will get this to a person who can assist you." Do you know the difference between that and getting a voicemail and not getting a call back? It is a huge difference. That is all I am suggesting. I do not know if you can go to KCC and get an intern. I cannot imagine it being that much more to hire someone to answer the phones. Maybe we put the position in our budget and we hire them, and forward the calls here, then we will just tell them what we already do, but we will get paid for it. That is what is happening right now. It is not just from you folks. Every call that does not get answered across the street or in our administration or in this county, or in the state, because that state building has the same problem, comes here and our staff has to look it up on the internet. I commend our staff for doing that, but that has to stop.

Ms. Matsuyama: Yes, I agree.

Councilmember DeCosta: This is a long budget process and we heard many different problems that we have to solve. I want to add a solution. I believe Kapa'a will help, and I said this before, I am not sure if you were listening, but we only have one location, which is in Līhu'e. Everyone is coming to one central area. When you open up a satellite area, you are going to shift a percentage of clientele over to Kapa'a. I drive through the traffic to work in Kapa'a. People drive in the traffic to drive into Līhu'e. It is a nightmare. Why would people want to drive through traffic to come into Līhu'e? The Kapa'a location will help. I also believe there is a way that you can ask some of your employees who live on the east side if they would like to now work in the new satellite, so they do not have to drive to Līhu'e. I am just trying to shed light, because right now it got dark. The last thing I wanted to say is we talked about this in the Fire Department having a retired person help, maybe you folks can have *kūpuna* volunteer two (2) to three (3) hours to answer the phones or do a part-time position, getting paid a little money, because I know they can make a little bit on retirement. You do not have to make it a union position, so you folks have control over it, and you folks

can actually outsource this answering the phones. Certain time of the day between 9:00 a.m. and 2:00 p.m., you are going to have phone coverage for people who call in.

(Councilmember Kualii was noted as not present.)

Councilmember Kagawa: I would like to suggest possibly using an 89-day hire to help, because DMV is a necessity. There is such a huge volume and the abuse these folks take from the public that are taking out their frustrations at the staff, you wonder why no one wants to work there. I think we need a solution for some of these folks who abuse our workers, they should just be banned from getting a license or whatever they are asking for. If you treat our worker badly, you will not get away with it. There needs to be rules in place so they know and it does not happen. Again, one bad person can spoil it for everyone and it is happening. Looking at whatever they can, whether bringing back Marj and Marlene on an 89-day contract, while we are missing these folks, I think it should be looked at as a possible remedies to help. They have the experience, they know what it was like to crank out a number of requests, especially the spring breaks, I am open to supporting whatever, whether it be in the overtime budget.

Ms. Matsuyama: We actually asked a couple, who declined.

Councilmember Kagawa: Mr. Lee, thank you, and I know it is not easy. When it is a necessity, they are going to read it online, they are going to see what is online, but they are still going to want to know for sure, before they drive out from Kapa'a or Kekaha. It is frustrating because sometimes it is right there on the website, but there is one occasion when they do not see what is on the website, only to find out their child came home from school and this one-time where they wanted to get the license, it never worked out, because they did not follow instructions. It is frustrating for both sides and the Council is here to help, especially with these stressful necessities.

Ms. Matsuyama: Thank you.

Councilmember Carvalho: The vending machines at the stores, like Safeway, how is that going?

Ms. Matsuyama: Good when it is working.

Councilmember Carvalho: It was brought to my attention that with the closing of Ishihara Market, is there going to be another opportunity on that side of the island, the west side? To me, I have used it numerous times, it is very convenient, but I just wanted to follow up on that one.

Ms. Matsuyama: So, short-term, we are working with the vendor to see if another place...because we do not work the kiosk and it is really not our decision on where it is placed, but we can encourage. Right now, it is soon, hopefully, going to be moved to our lobby, that is short-term. We are continuing to work with the vendor to see if there is

another location on the west side that we can put it, because that would be our number one idea.

Council Chair Rapozo: Do we pay this vendor?

Ms. Matsuyama: No.

Council Chair Rapozo: How do they make their money?

Ms. Matsuyama: The processing fee is how they make their money. That is why they are really business savvy, so they are thinking, "Where is it going to be most utilized so that we can..."

Council Chair Rapozo: Do we not have any control of where they put the machine?

Ms. Matsuyama: We can encourage.

Council Chair Rapozo: We can suggest, we can ask.

Ms. Matsuyama: They have a contract with Foodland and they have a contract with Safeway. They do not have a contract with Times or Big Save.

Council Chair Rapozo: How much is the processing fee?

Ms. Matsuyama: Four dollars (\$4) plus the credit card fee.

Council Chair Rapozo: I never used it. I do it online at home on the computer, I just did mine, and you pay the credit card fee, which is 2%, and I get the thing back in the mail in less than a week. It is incredible. If I go to the kiosk, I need to pay a \$4...

Ms. Matsuyama: But you get it right there.

Council Chair Rapozo: Okay.

Councilmember DeCosta: Our Chair got a little flustered...

Council Chair Rapozo: No, that was nice, I never get mad yet.

Councilmember DeCosta: Frustrated. I got like that dealing with other departments early on in budget. When we sit here, we are the leaders. When we go to our conferences, there are counties that put much more pressure on the Administration to make it run for the community to benefit. I believe this council through the last decades have been very subdued, this might be the first council that is a little bit more "on it" to make sure our departments are being run so our community will benefit. I am amazed that you two (2) did not get upset with us, did not show any signs of "lash backs," you never lied, you just said the

truth and you admitted how you will improve, and this is “top level” management. You gave us a commitment that you folks are going to improve. I wanted to commend you on that. Thank you for not hiding behind something, coming forward and saying you can improve, and willing to improve.

Council Chair Rapozo: I think any of the old timers in the room will agree that this is probably the most mellow budget, I mean I will call it as I see it and that is what we should do. It is 12:30 p.m. Are there further questions for DMV? If not, we are going to take our lunch break.

Mr. Lee: To you folks who made comments about our website content, I want to make sure if there are ways in any part of our operation that the community feels important for us to work on or change the way we deliver information, because historically we have been pretty poor in submitting information out to the community. When I first came on three (3) years ago, revamping the website was one of the first tasks that we completed and it was done with the intent of customer service in mind. I would love for any feedback to be given to the DMV through...we have a QR code, feedback or any way you folks can call in or...not call in, I guess.

Council Chair Rapozo: Listen, aside from that situation that I had recently, my experience with DMV has been amazing, from the appointment scheduling to the timeliness when you get there. What I am frustrated about is what I believe is one of the most important things for our constituents, for them to call and talk to a human. As far as the website and IT may have left, but it is not just DMV's website that is hard to navigate, even our website is hard to navigate. If you go to the other islands' county websites, very user-friendly. Definitely, we will reach out to share. I think people should be able to get their information on the first page. If you take an online marketing course, that is what they tell you, make sure the message is on the first page where you do not have to scroll. Once you have to scroll, you lose them.

Mr. Lee: One hundred percent (100%).

Council Chair Rapozo: I do not know who does our website.

Ms. Matsuyama: We are actually revamping it right now as we speak. It is in the implementation of getting basically a whole brand new website.

Council Chair Rapozo: Yes, user-friendly—so the person knows what they have to bring for a driver license renewal can find it in the front.

Mr. Lee: We are open to the feedback. Anything that we do, we want to make sure that we are constantly growing and delivering what the customers need.

Council Chair Rapozo: It is very simple, when you think about changing something, think as if you were your *kūpuna*. We will go to lunch. We will be back at 1:30 p.m.

There being no objections, the meeting recessed at 12:30 p.m.

The meeting was called back to order at 1:31 p.m., and proceeded as follows:

Council Chair Rapozo: The meeting is called back to order and we are now in Real Property Tax Assessment.

Councilmember Kualii: Master page 64, starting at the top, Position No. 218 County Real Property Tax Tech Officer. The salary is about 2% lower. It has been vacant 318 days and the recruitment status says "No activity," so what is the status of this position?

Ms. Matsuyama: This is our Property Technical Officer. It is a high position, so the reason for the decrease in pay was we had an incumbent in there who retired. We are "temporary assignment (TA)" someone into that position, but right now we are redescribing it to be...I do not know exactly what the title is going to be, we are working with HR, but it is going to be like an Assistant Manager to Mike. What we are going to do is, we went to the union consultation, it is going to be an Assistant Manager to Mike, we are going to recruit internally, so that someone can have promotion upwards, but that is going to create another vacancy, because we are promoting internally.

Councilmember Kualii: Does the TA not create another vacancy?

Ms. Matsuyama: Yes, because it ties up two (2) positions.

Councilmember Kualii: So, the budget, whether you fill it to start on July 1st or not, the budget needs to be there to pay the person TA?

Ms. Matsuyama: Not necessarily, because they are taking up two (2) of these, right, but hopefully by July 1st, because we are going to do the recruitment in May. By June 1st or June 16th, we should be able to get it in because it is an internal, so they should be onboard by July 1st.

Councilmember Kualii: Even if there is a little bit extra, you said they should be onboard by July 1st.

Ms. Matsuyama: Yes.

Councilmember Kualii: Next position is Position No. 221 Abstracting and Text Mapping Technician II. You are anticipating it to go vacant.

Ms. Matsuyama: Today is the first day.

Councilmember Kuali'i: It also says, "No Activity," but you plan to fill it and have it start July 1st.

Ms. Matsuyama: Yes, so the PDs are in with HR already. We are going to post the range of abstractor, so hopefully we can get it in by July 1st as well. Today is the first day we are operating without her.

Councilmember Kuali'i: Position No. 274 Program Support Assistant II, the normal 8.9% increase. The recruitment status says, "No eligibles, need to recruit," are you already recruiting?

Ms. Matsuyama: Yes, so we went out once and no one qualified. We are going to have to redescribe that position down to a Senior Clerk. That is one of the tax relief technicians in the front.

Councilmember Kuali'i: Position No. 105 Real Property Appraiser V...it has been vacant 573 days, it jumped up 24% from \$55,000 to \$68,000, and the status is continuous. What is the status of this position?

Ms. Matsuyama: The reason for the increase is because it is a high level appraiser. It is listed as an Appraiser V right now, which is going to be changed in the Supplemental. We posted again the series, we went for the V, the interviewees did not respond, we went and pulled the IV, same thing; we pulled the III, same thing; we pulled the II, there is no one on the list, so now we are interviewing the I. When the Supplemental comes over, hopefully we can hire someone, but it will come over as an Appraiser I, and we are interviewing five (5) candidates in the next couple weeks.

Councilmember Kuali'i: So, in the next budget, that amount will be lower?

Ms. Matsuyama: Correct.

Councilmember Cowden: I have a follow-up. In those positions like Appraiser I, what kind of training did we give them and what would be their qualifications coming in as an Appraiser I? Do they have a real estate license?

Ms. Matsuyama: Coming in, you have to have a degree and you have to have a couple of years in some type of real estate or mapping and surveying, you still need some specialized appraising work for Appraiser I. There is an appraiser trainee that you could get for lesser qualifications, but once they are in, Mike, Steve, and their team do the training to get them familiar with the software and then whatever other training.

Councilmember Cowden: Is there an online class that people can take to be stronger appraisers. I know I have a brother who is an appraiser but he appraises real estate companies when they want to sell something. Is that a type of person who would be applying in...I am not trying to get my brother a job, by the way...but is that the kind of person who

is going to apply? They have experience appraising for the real estate market...where do we pull these people from?

MIKE HUBBARD, Real Property Tax Manager: The person you described would most likely be an Appraiser V, Appraiser IV, potentially an Appraiser VI, type of role. The Appraiser I, as Reiko mentioned, some specialized skill, a college degree, and what they would be doing is entry-level journeymen type of work to learn what we do in the office. Not necessarily evaluate real property. They would not have a book of businesses; I refer it to it as...they would not have parcels assigned to them.

Councilmember Cowden: Because it is an important position, I am hoping that when our software does a mass analysis, that we have appraisers to look at, "Well, that is out of the norm or it is in the norm," so when you are hiring someone, if you hire someone highly skilled from a different location, especially if they are in the continental United States, how easily does that translate when they do not know the difference of the neighborhoods or is that easy to overcome?

Mr. Hubbard: It will definitely take some experience and some knowledge and some familiarity with the island, so that the principals translate one hundred percent (100%), but the scope of work and just the market nuances take some time to get to know.

Councilmember Cowden: So where are we recruiting from? It seems like this has been a problem for a few years, and I am sure the private sector, from what I was just talking about, probably really happy to pull from within our staff. How do we do our recruitment?

Ms. Matsuyama: Basically, we use HR's resources and that is why we recruit for the entire series, just to see what we can get.

Councilmember Cowden: Do we go headhunt ourselves?

Ms. Matsuyama: No.

Councilmember Cowden: Again, coming from the private sector, I was a headhunter, if I saw people doing a really good job at something at a skill I needed, I would go ask. Is that something we are not allowed to do?

Ms. Matsuyama: I think we are allowed to do it. It is just not past practice.

Councilmember Cowden: Okay.

Councilmember DeCosta: Reiko, I see you have two (2) EM-5 in your budget. Is it based on years of service or seniority that one EM-5 gets quite a bit more than the other? Can you tell me how is that? Can you educate me on that?

Ms. Matsuyama: On EM-5 is an Executive Assistant to the Mayor, and so that is how we brought him in to be the Executive Assistant. It was a set compensation amount.

Councilmember DeCosta: Okay. I understand that we need that to compete with the private sector. I know that a lot of our county positions are not comparable to the private sector. Is this one way of keeping our qualified employees in the position?

Ms. Matsuyama: Yes. It is like a recruiting tool.

Councilmember DeCosta: I know Mr. Hubbard personally on his job performance and in my book, he is just as accomplished, if not, the same as anyone. How do we get him to be compensated to that level?

Ms. Matsuyama: We can always have those discussions with HR. I think, yes, Mike is amazing, and I think this Executive Assistant to the Mayor definitely provides him the resources and support that he needs, so hopefully it makes his job a little easier.

Councilmember DeCosta: Okay. Mike is not a part of the union where he is held to the same umbrella status as the union? When we were talking earlier, we were talking about it being hard to move within the union spectrum, is his position a union position?

Ms. Matsuyama: He is not in a bargaining unit, but he follows the bargaining units' agreements. He follows Bargaining Unit 13, so raises come with that.

Councilmember DeCosta: It is just a little different for me to look at an almost \$25,000 difference between...with the same status.

Ms. Matsuyama: Yes.

Council Chair Rapozo: I have a follow-up. Our staff breaks down the budgets and provides us with the increase or decrease in each line. In the salaries, and I understand some of these are the percentage or increases that are given, but on Position No. 930, and I do not know if this is a typographical error, but we are showing the increase on our form, our sheet of \$90,323.

Ms. Matsuyama: Not a typographical error. It was formally listed as an Appraiser I.

Council Chair Rapozo: Is this okay? Is this position new?

Ms. Matsuyama: It is new. He was hired August 1st.

Council Chair Rapozo: Last August.

Ms. Matsuyama: Yes.

Council Chair Rapozo: And he was not hired as an Executive Assistant to the Mayor.

Ms. Matsuyama: He was, but in the last budget it was reflected as an Appraiser I, so at a forty-thousand-dollar salary.

Councilmember DeCosta: When we hired him as an Appraiser I and paid him the lower fee or did we compensate his money from another department, another funding source?

Ms. Matsuyama: We redescribed the position from an Appraiser I to an Executive Assistant to the Mayor.

Councilmember DeCosta: And he was paid accordingly last year.

Ms. Matsuyama: Correct.

Councilmember Kualii: Was there a big reorganization of the division? Why were there title changes? Was there more redescribing of positions?

Ms. Matsuyama: We have been doing a lot of things to help Mike and his staffing. I would say one of the things we did is the abstractor series, we changed the description of those to make it better reflect so there can be upper movement. All of the changes we did were to provide our staff with more upward movement. Even some of our program support assistance went to Tax Relief Services Technicians, so they were promoted from SR-13 to SR-14, just to give them some type of ladder, something to obtain, try to keep working towards. There has not been a real reorganization per se, but a lot of the different positions have been renamed to provide that upward mobility.

Councilmember Kualii: In our variance sheet, it pretty much has eleven (11) positions, which seems like all or most of the positions with title changes and with salary increases, now those salary increases, when you put all of these positions together, it is \$163,000 and then the other regular salaries is \$80,000, making up for the \$243,000, which is like a 20% increase in the line item of salaries. If all of this...what you folks have to do was to get it working the way you needed to get, then that is worth that added investment, but it is what happened.

Ms. Matsuyama: I will stand behind our promotions because they were warranted and they do higher level work than what they are paid for, to me. Yes, I think we have three (3) or four (4) Tax Relief Technicians, we have the two (2) Abstracting, we have the Executive Assistant to the Mayor, so just those, in general, that is seven (7) that I can think off the top of my head that had redescrptions.

Councilmember Kuali'i: That explains the higher than normal increase to the regular salary items, so that is kind of like a one-time thing, it is not the regular 8.9% increase that was attributed to collective bargaining units?

Ms. Matsuyama: Yes, we pushed a lot of reallocations this year.

Councilmember Cowden: That Tax Service Technician, is that the person at the counter and deals with the distressed?

Ms. Matsuyama: That is correct.

Councilmember Cowden: Okay.

Councilmember Kagawa: Since Councilmember Bulosan is not present, I am going to ask a question for him. The Real Property tax bills for everyone, is there a way they can go on the computer and see, perhaps, what their assessment and bills was for the past ten (10) years?

Mr. Hubbard: Yes, exactly, ten (10) years.

Councilmember Kagawa: They can go online press in their Tax Map Key (TMK) and they can see...

Ms. Matsuyama: Kauaipropertytax.com has—you can look up for anyone else, you can look up by address or by parcel number, and you can see historical ten (10) years, not just their bill, but their tax classification, maps, all kinds of good stuff.

Mr. Hubbard: I think bills are twenty (20) years, assessments are ten (10) or eleven (11) years.

Councilmember Kagawa: Thank you. Perfect.

Councilmember Kuali'i: Earlier in IT there was that "wash" between dues and subscriptions and IT arrangement SBITA, is that the same thing that is happening here under Other Services and IT arrangement. This time it says IT arrangement, but it does not say SBITA. It is \$310,000 in the Other Services moving out and \$342,000 moving into the other IT arrangement. Is that the same thing happening?

Ms. Matsuyama: That is correct. We drained the 3000 Other Services account and we put it all into 3101. That being said, there are a couple new ones that are in 3101 that we added as well.

Council Chair Rapozo: What are those?

Ms. Matsuyama: The first one is called "True Row" and is at \$24,000. What True Row does is kind of like an auditing software for us, so it goes through and finds people...it goes through all this calculation and it finds people that have home exemptions that looks like maybe they should not qualify for a home exemption and then it will work backwards. It will look for those that, "hey, it looks like this person has been living here for a long time, but they do not have a home exemption." It works both ways. We have been working with our staff to follow up what kicks out from this software.

Council Chair Rapozo: And then the other one.

Ms. Matsuyama: And then Just Appraised, that is the \$29,000, that is going to help our abstractors. It takes artificial intelligence and it reads and drops in the language for the deeds, so instead of typing and hard keying data entry, they are going to be reviewing what the software spits out and it integrates directly with our camera system, so it will process title transfers more quickly.

Councilmember DeCosta: When we were talking about revamping our agriculture property tax that we did with Councilmember Evslyn last term, you mentioned that you may need another Appraiser in the agriculture division. Did you happen to put that new position in this budget, and if so, how easy is it to get someone with agriculture experience as an Appraiser out there?

Ms. Matsuyama: We did request a new position, it is more for the tax relief side, but what we did was we took two (2) of our Tax Relief Technicians from the front and we moved them to compliance in the back, compliance and analysis, so they are going to help Terry. They are going to help the PTO side, so the Property Technical side, which we are lacking as well, so they are going to serve both functions. What basically the new position would do is fill their role into the tax relief side, so again it was the progression trying to get these people up and trying to provide an avenue for promotion and for reallocation.

Councilmember DeCosta: Are we going to be okay? Because I know that was a concern, we were going to bring in more revenue if we can get that department up and running more efficiently with just Terry, so it looks like you have a grip on it, right?

Ms. Matsuyama: I think we should be okay and Terry has been working really hard to get the agricultural dedication application on LIMS, so hopefully that is something that can come forth pretty soon.

Council Chair Rapozo: Are there further questions for Real Property Assessment? If not, we will move to Collection. Are there any questions for Real Property Tax Collections?

Councilmember Cowden: Mike, is there anything you want to share with us that is important to you?

Mr. Hubbard: I am good. You folks covered it. Thank you.

Councilmember Kualifi: Just the two (2) positions, Position No. 224 Tax Clerk, vacant 287 days, salary was decreased on the vacancy report like 10%/11% and you have interviews scheduled. What happened with the variation of the salary and did we get through the interviews, and are we going to get everyone onboard by July 1st?

Ms. Matsuyama: The incumbent was a Senior Account Clerk, so the position was downgraded to an Account Clerk. We actually just made an offer, so we do not know the status of that offer. For the Senior Clerk, we are pulling the list now and scheduling interviews currently.

Councilmember Kualifi: Is that not counting the next position which is Position No. 272 Account Clerk, which is vacant?

Ms. Matsuyama: Sorry, I mixed them all up.

Councilmember Kualifi: Position No. 272 was a Tax Clerk, it is down to an Account Clerk. Position No. 224, I think it was an Account Clerk and now it is a Senior Clerk, and we are scheduling interviews right now.

Council Chair Rapozo: Is Position No. 224 not a Tax Clerk?

Ms. Matsuyama: Position No. 224 will be a Senior Clerk, so kind of the same thing we were discussing earlier where the Tax Clerk requires all this experience, basically we have to go all the way down to get a Senior Clerk in order to...

Council Chair Rapozo: That will be updated in the supplemental?

Ms. Matsuyama: Yes.

Council Chair Rapozo: It is showing as a Tax Clerk right now.

Ms. Matsuyama: Yes, it is recent changes.

Council Chair Rapozo: How long does it take to reclassify?

Ms. Matsuyama: Not long.

Council Chair Rapozo: What is not long? Some of our staff...we want to build a ladder for our staff too, and it is hard because...

Ms. Matsuyama: Okay, if you are trying to build a ladder, sometimes that is very difficult, but if you are just trying to redescribe the position...

Council Chair Rapozo: That is what I am talking about. If we wanted to redescribe a...let us not call it a ladder, let us just say we want to redescribe our positions here and it is probably an HR question, but I am just curious to know how long it takes you folks.

Ms. Matsuyama: If we know what we want...

Council Chair Rapozo: Yes.

Ms. Matsuyama: ...it will be under a week. It will be really fast. If you do not know what you want and you are trying to create something, if you are trying to be creative, than it is longer.

Council Chair Rapozo: Okay. Are there further questions for Collections?

Councilmember DeCosta: I had a question on page 71. I noticed you have a quarterly tax administrators meeting and I noticed that your budget is really small, and I am not against a small budget, but I know a lot of other departments have traveling budgets. How important is it for you folks to correspond with Maui, Hawai'i Island, and O'ahu to learn what they are doing, feeding off the right and wrong programs they are doing? I would think it is beneficial for you to have these meetings and maybe more meetings, and having your staff train...it is a way that can make us a better unit. Tell me a little bit about it.

Ms. Matsuyama: It is hugely and extremely beneficial. Mike is closer with his counterparts than any of my other division heads, they communicate all the time, maybe even daily via email. They travel and go on these quarterly meetings, they rotate islands...

Councilmember DeCosta: I had a chance to meet the Finance Director of Maui and do not get me wrong, I think you are a guru of finance, Ms. Matsuyama, but when I met your counterpart in Maui, this person is amazing and I think we can learn how they do things to better benefit our department and our people, so please let us know now we can help you do that.

Ms. Matsuyama: Yes, I mean that is a good point and for Real Property at least, we align probably the closest with Maui, and so the similarities are there.

Council Chair Rapozo: Last question, nonjudicial foreclosures, that is a new item, \$50,000 and I know we had a little chat about foreclosing on properties that are delinquent. Can you explain that program?

Ms. Matsuyama: We have not done a nonjudicial foreclosure since 2015. We are pursuing it right now to happen at the end of May, I think we have...we put actual physical yard signs on twenty-three (23) properties islandwide. It is just a way for us to stay current, if we have this every single year, which is what we should do and is what all the other islands do, have this nonjudicial foreclosure process every single year, it will keep

people more accountable for paying their property taxes. It will keep our list down. This year we had such a big list because we have not done it in so long. We also have this nonjudicial route and then we have a judicial route. The attorneys handle the judicial route and that is more for clouded title type of properties. The ones that are simpler titles, one or two people on title, those are the ones that we will pursue through the nonjudicial.

Councilmember Cowden: I usually hear the heartbreaking stories. I do not know who is on your nonjudicial foreclosure list, but can I get a copy of that, if I am able to see it. Do we have plenty of steps to help them overcome administrative understanding barriers, like some people I have spoken with, I do not know if they are on your list, but they might have had the property for generations and they are just not people who are very strong on this type of thing. I want to make sure that we are not having some thing spit things out from a computer, but something like that where it spits it out and someone who did not do their paperwork currently and will lose their land over it. I want to make sure we are doing everything we can to not take land away from people who are not good at doing administrative work.

Ms. Matsuyama: Anyone on the foreclosure list, they are over three (3) years delinquent, so it is not like they missed a payment and now they are in big trouble. They are over three (3) years and in this case, they could be a number of years because we have not pursued this in a while. I am going to turn this over to Michelle because she is the expert in the nonjudicial process.

MICHELLE L. LIZAMA, Deputy Director of Finance: Good afternoon. Yes, we are bound by County Code. There are processes in place. Like what Finance Director Matsuyama said, one payment and we are not foreclosing—three (3) years plus delinquent, we send out preliminary letters, “Look, we know you are delinquent, call our office; we can help you out if you need a payment agreement plan.” There are other alternatives where if you are on the payment agreement plan, we will not file liens, we will not pursue foreclosure. The foreclosure process is for those who have not even responded to any of our bills, who have not responded to any of our correspondence, and we go through a whole preliminary letter, final letter, notification. We actually go through a database of all current, prior owners, any addresses on record, so this past foreclosure we had to mail out 400 plus letters.

Councilmember Cowden: Do we ever give them a phone call?

Ms. Lizama: Personal phone call, we do not call every parcel that is delinquent, but we do send letters and they do call our office, we definitely...

Councilmember Cowden: If it is possible to give me a list, I will make that phone call. Especially, I know you are not giving me the phone number, but I will try, because what I have found with a handful of them, they had a medical emergency, sometimes people are just paralyzed. I can sit with them over breakfast and talk to them about it. I just want to make sure that we are not...I am not saying you folks are doing anything wrong, I just will go make that extra effort. If it is someone who bought it a long time ago and just not paying attention, I just wanted to be able to look at make sure that every effort has been made. Some

people might have so many descendants and maybe the wrong person is getting the letter. Very often the ones that are coming into my awareness is lack of administrative capacity, am I saying that nicely, they do not know how to deal with it and so they simply do not deal with it.

Ms. Lizama: I want to say there was a success story. A parcel was near foreclosure and our Housing Agency has this program, Housing Assistance Fund, and our office referred this homeowner to inquire about it, they applied, got approved, and they were paid property taxes in full, zero, within three (3) months.

Councilmember Cowden: Yay.

Council Chair Rapozo: Wow.

Councilmember Cowden: So, that is definitely not for everyone, but there might be a few that...it is just a health crisis or so many different...

Ms. Lizama: It is still available, you can see the Housing Agency.

Councilmember Cowden: Okay. I would like to have that list.

Council Chair Rapozo: You are saying three (3) years, but you are notifying, sending notices before three (3) years, obviously, right?

Ms. Lizama: Yes, absolutely.

Council Chair Rapozo: I have to ask, because it came up on a prior discussion about certified mail. Are we sending these notices certified mail to make sure that they are receiving these notices?

Ms. Lizama: Correct. We are bound by County Code that...

Council Chair Rapozo: I am talking about the ones before the three (3) years.

Ms. Lizama: No.

Council Chair Rapozo: If you do not get a tax payment from a property after a year...so we do not do certified, would that be a problem? Would we have that many?

Ms. Lizama: Budget-wise.

Council Chair Rapozo: How many do you send out?

Ms. Lizama: Thousands. At the end of the fiscal year, after the February due date.

Council Chair Rapozo: So, a thousand...

Ms. Lizama: Plus.

Council Chair Rapozo: I am trying to put a number, certified is \$6?

Ms. Lizama: \$6.

Council Chair Rapozo: Even let us say \$10. I am concerned that people do not get their mail. That is my concern. The United States Postal Service (USPS) is not the USPS of before, now a days I do not know where the mail goes. I am just trying to make it...rather than wait for three (3) years, maybe we can get them to pay before three (3) years, so they do not have to go through foreclosure. Let us make it so we know that they got the notice and that we know they have chosen not to pay, and then when we go to foreclosure, honestly, make a payment plan or sorry. It is just one of those things. You have to do what you have to do.

Councilmember Kuali'i: Reiko, you said that signs were put on twenty-three (23) properties islandwide and then when I read in your narrative, I saw this earlier, too, and I thought it was interesting, the last sentence is, "Additionally, there are dilapidated properties that could become permanent housing and/or enable a family to buy a home on Kaua'i for far below market value." Do we even know whether someone is occupying the home or not, or only until we come to a point where we put yard signs on the property.

Ms. Matsuyama: For me, it was when we put the yard signs on the property. You can tell if the properties are lived in or not.

Councilmember Kuali'i: Because it is dilapidated.

Ms. Matsuyama: Some are all overgrown...

Councilmember Kuali'i: And this yard sign piece does not happen until after the three (3) years.

Ms. Matsuyama: Yes, it is at the point where we are pulling the trigger.

Councilmember Kuali'i: Is there a way to find out sooner, maybe working with code enforcement from the Planning Department? Do you give them a list and they go and check on it earlier on in the process, because if it is a vacant, dilapidated property, it would make sense to have everything in place so that you can get that house through the process, so that someone can inhabit it.

Ms. Matsuyama: Yes, we can work with the other departments to see if there are collaboration efforts.

Council Chair Rapozo: There may be an opportunity for the County to make an offer to the owner before foreclosure and turn that into an affordable housing unit as well.

Ms. Matsuyama: Sure.

Councilmember Cowden: Yes.

Council Chair Rapozo: Without going through foreclosure.

Councilmember DeCosta: How is our Real Property Collections (RPC)? Do we have a payment plan? Do you have something that in case we find someone delinquent, we have a payment procedure plan in place?

Ms. Matsuyama: Yes, they just have to call our office and anyone who is delinquent can get on payment plans.

Councilmember DeCosta: I am talking about delinquent where they might not be able to pay outside of their revenue coming in, they cannot obviously pay a large portion do we have a plan that could be compared to the income that they have coming in versus the expenses they need to survive, plus this new delinquent payment. Obviously, if they had the money, they would have been making the payments, so they must be struggling. I am pretty sure there are local families here. I am trying to make sure we have a plan in place, in case there are people wanting to make a payment, but cannot make a large payment. What is acceptable or what is not acceptable?

Ms. Matsuyama: Most of our payment plans are a 2-year term, so you pay it back within twenty-four (24) months, so it is divided...your monthly amount that you pay would be divided by twenty-four (24). We have made exceptions in the past to allow longer durations. You sign this payment plan saying that you are going to pay those monthly amounts timely, right, so once you do not, you fall off the payment plan, then you are back on the lien list.

Councilmember DeCosta: What if that payment plan is \$300 per month and that local family just cannot do that in two (2) years, they are not going to make it all back. Could they do an extended plan if they are willing to pay a smaller amount?

Ms. Matsuyama: Like I said, we have made adjustments in the past to extend the 24-month period.

Councilmember DeCosta: That is all I wanted to know. We have a plan in place and we are willing to accommodate those who really need the help.

Ms. Matsuyama: Yes.

Council Chair Rapozo: Are there further questions for Collections?
Thank you. Purchasing.

Councilmember Kualii: Just to confirm you do not have any vacant positions.

ERNEST BARREIRA, Assistant Chief Procurement Officer: I do not.

Council Chair Rapozo: Are there any questions for the Purchasing Division? It looks like similar title changes and I am assuming it is the same process that you did with the Real Property Division.

Ms. Matsuyama: Yes. We have done some reallocations within Ernie's shop as well, for Purchasing.

Councilmember Cowden: How is it going and are you able to be recruiting more local vendors for our purchasing? A lot of times people do not have the skill here and I tell them that they need to sign up with the County and they do not seem to understand that very well. How does that go? Are most of the people that we have subcontractors, are people who would be appropriate, are they mostly from the continental United States or Honolulu or do we have many contractors that are from Kaua'i?

Mr. Barreira: Good morning. Last week we had a budgeted bid, \$800,000 that came in at \$1,600,000 and we have been having a lot of challenges with that because of the economy. You feel for the contractors, because the cost of doing business is much higher than it was in years past. In terms of what constitutes a subcontractor, because of the cost, the procurement code is based on the lowest bid prevails, so the local contractors are going to try to get local subcontractors, obviously, because to bring people in from elsewhere is going to be much more costly. It is relatively user-friendly, but for those, if you have vendors or contractors who are uncertain, we provide training and guidance all the time.

Councilmember Cowden: I know there is like a prime portion of the year, like about a month or two in the summer for people to put in their name, or is it now year round?

Mr. Barreira: It is twenty-four-seven (24/7). When a new vendor makes himself known to us, we inform them of our electronic procurement system, public purchase, and we give them instructions and guide them on how to register, so that they can receive, automatically, bids that are published. As long as their profile is correct, they will get an email notification of the bid that is published.

Councilmember Cowden: Okay, that is great, and is that new?

Mr. Barreira: We had that for about five (5) years now.

Councilmember Cowden: About five (5) years, okay. So, if someone has a skill, because people ask me how they can do it, and I just say to do it. If you can do it, then go and do it, but they would go on the website or would they call you and come in?

Mr. Barreira: If they are uncertain, we always invite a call, because all seven (7) of us are designated for that type of assistance. Of course, my second in command always reaches out in terms of those types of procurement and regulatory assistance issues that people sometimes just do not know what to do with it. The website is pretty user-friendly, I would hope all of you would agree, perhaps not, but the Division of Purchasing, it would link you directly to public purchase and instructions on how to register as a vendor and how to participate, as well as understanding that there are legal requirements and regulatory requirements that have to be met. In order to bid for a government project, you have to be compliant with all of your taxes, with four (4) basic elements, including state and federal taxation and you have to be properly licensed, especially for construction.

Councilmember Cowden: Yes, I just spent lunch down there with the road project and I think there were probably three (3) or four (4) subs in there, so, yes.

Council Chair Rapozo: Are there further questions?

Councilmember DeCosta: Hello, Ernie. Can you explain a little bit about the airfare, your per diem budget on page 74. Your per diem, your meals and hotel looks a little higher than your airfare, I was wondering that it looks a lot different on the next expenditure, it was \$5,000 versus \$1,700, where the original budget was closer in numbers. I was wondering how did that large gap occur?

Mr. Barreira: You will see that the numbers have increased because that is the sign of the times. We have a very, very small budget. Probably one of the smallest in Finance, if not, the smallest budget. We just were not able to make ends meet, in terms of sending two (2) of our Specialists each year to the National Government Institute of Procurement, for that type of exposure, so critical to keep up with procurement methodologies and requirements. That was just the nature of the beast that we are finding expenses have increased significantly that we required a bit more funds, and we made the request. We also repurposed the moneys into the proper line items, so that they were being drawn more accurately as we had to pay bills and invoices.

Councilmember DeCosta: Thank you.

Council Chair Rapozo: I know we get criticized for cutting everything, but in your postage and (inaudible) account, the budgeted item is \$80,000 but the year to date is \$115,000, did we have some outrageous shipment last year that will not happen this year?

Mr. Barreira: No, that is a carryover. At the end of the fiscal year, we want to make sure we have sufficient postage because it is a very unpredictable

variable. That postage would likely at the end of the fiscal year be placed into the blanket purchase order for our contractor to make sure that we have sufficient moneys to cover, so I believe that would show the disparity that you are making reference to.

Council Chair Rapozo: Well, you already spent \$115,000, correct?

Mr. Barreira: Yes, once we take the money from the appropriation and put it into the blanket purchase order, the money is considered encumbered, but we have not spent all of it this year. I hope we do not spend all of it.

Ms. Matsuyama: To be clear the postage is County-wide, they just do the postage operation...

Council Chair Rapozo: Yes, I am not concerned about the amount, because I figured...especially since I am asking for certified mail. I worry about the disparity that next year will come around and you are going to go over, because you are already over your budgeted amount, and I want to make sure you have enough money.

Mr. Barreira: You would know this because you were here when we first started back in 2010, the postage budget used to be \$120,000 and as the result of the electronic procurement initiatives, we were able to save \$40,000 a year and we still do that today. We still find ways to advance technologies so that we can save as much money as possible.

Council Chair Rapozo: Thank you for that. Are there further questions for Purchasing? If not, thank you very much. OED. I see you probably brought quite a support group. Like probably the most support crew that we ever had from any department.

Office of Economic Development

NALANI KA'AUWAI BRUN, Office of Economic Development Director: It is because we deep dive a lot, I cannot deep dive anything.

Council Chair Rapozo: It is intimidating.

Ms. Ka'auwai Brun: *Aloha.* I am going to give an overview on OED because a lot of times people always ask us, "What do you folks do," and it is an endless question, so we are going to go through that right now quickly. Basically, OED is a partnership office, that is what we do. We go out and work with our community to get things done. Many times, we pick our projects off actual vetted documents that are already out there. It saves us a lot of time because we do not have to go back to the community, they already said what they want and so we are the ones who pick up the plans and go, "What in here that is economic development-related that we can actually try and pull off." That is basically how we pick our plans for the year; what we think we can work on. Some of the plans, of course, the General Plan, are very important to us, the Destination Management Action plans, the Comprehensive Economic Development Strategy (CEDS) Plan, and then we also look into the

up-and-coming Kaua'i Agricultural Economic Development Plan, which is slowly coming to an end, so we are actually going to have a document probably the first draft at the end of April, and then of course the Kaua'i Climate Adaptation Plan. We are watching any and all plans that the county is working on. There is our team right there. That is basically everyone that we have and most of them are sitting back here. It is a great opportunity for us to continue to train leaders. We want leaders that are not afraid to come up, this is our council, we all work together, but it is also helpful because each of these people is expected to deep dive into their topic. We create teams, but they are expected to do deep dives, because not everyone can know everything about everything, obviously.

The way we do that is that we have little teams. Within the office, we break it out and usually three (3), sometimes more people are on a team, and keep each other accountable and also to assist whoever is the main person. For example, here is the film budget and you can see it broken down just for film, the travel, basic grants they give out, programming area, and that is 10% of OED's budget. Some of the project highlights that we are expecting for next year is a 48-hour film project, which we are hoping to help build creative industries and the people that do filming, and other types of technology-type of jobs. She is also working in the Good Jobs Hawai'i Workforce, in the area of creative industries. There is a big push by the state to do Good Jobs Hawai'i and they are pinpointing, pushing residents to get skilled up in some of these specific areas that are going to have a better chance of getting a living wage. Agriculture is 9% of our budget. There are the four (4) people that work in that area and some of the project highlights coming up is our Agricultural Economic Development Plan—we are finally going to have that in-hand and be able to have a guideline of where we want to go. We are also working on an Ag Tourism Plan. One of the big ideas was to try to get farmers every benefit that they can out of the visitor industry, which includes having them be able to bring visitors in and make some money. In order to do that what we found was that they were not ready, we could create tours, but they were not ready to have tours, so this one-year project is basically going to take some farmers and teach them how to use Ag tourism, everything from walking them the permit system, to how to set it up on property, what is legal, what is not legal, how you would time that out with other farms so that it works. That is what we are hoping to do and it should be done...we started at the beginning of the year, so within a year.

Business. We are lucky to have our new Business Specialist onboard with us. We have someone actually carrying the baton for business and he is really working hard on Business Retention and Expansion Program, so he has been out on the road. His goal in the first year has been 400 businesses he has to meet. We are at the quarter and he has already has 101, so he is keeping pace. He is out there talking to the businesses, finding out what their needs are, and basically creating a big datasheet on what the needs are out there, so we can begin to service them a little better.

Energy. Energy is 9% of the budget and these are the three (3) people that are on there. The big projects for them this year are going to be the Coconut Market Place Mobility Hub Plan, in which we are trying to change the way people are moving around this island, specifically visitors first to try to help us ease up some of the tension between residents and visitors. Also the Fast Charger Project, which is coming down from the federal government.

For Sustainability, this is one of our newer areas that we are getting to focus on because we have Ana Espanola now. She has been working really hard on completing the EPA Communitywide Brownfields Assessment. I am sure all of you know that federal grants are probably the hardest ones of all, so they will be...she had delved into that area, she is working with the community and she has been also working on other things outside of that. Everything from watching what is happening with cesspools to natural environment things, how we work on economics as far as *aloha 'āina* is concerned, so there are a bunch of things that her and her team are working on. It is a smaller budget because it is just still up and coming.

We have Workforce & Tourism. We are lucky to have Michelle Rego on staff. She basically is helping me because you know I was the tourism person and we do not have a tourism person now. She has come on board to help us with the many projects we have there. But she also covers the workforce, so she has been helping with creating the job fairs, getting them out there, get the signs up, and helping gather some of the employers to get these things done. Some of her projects for the next year are Stewardship Support because it is this year that we are going to be doing that. Community Events—we are actually going to do an RFP separate community events because they found that the renovation grants process was too difficult for them, so we are going to change that a little bit. She worked with the Kaua'i Community College (KCC) on training, uptraining, and she is also working on the Good Jobs Hawai'i with the rest of the staff.

Kaua'i Made—there is our team right there, they are fantastic, these folks know how to throw a fun event and they are coming up with an Easter event coming up. They are really concentrating on membership growth, which has been skyrocketing and retaining those people by providing more and more services. They want to bolster the marketing for all of those members.

Management is basically administration in the office. We have been working really hard on how we manage the different people and we have been using Airtable as a project tracking system, so we load all of our projects in for the year and then they set goals that happen quarterly, and then we are tracking as they go on to make sure they are on cue for completing what they need to do. That is basically off our strategic plan that we do each year. It is 27% which is a lot more. The direct grants are in this pot, that is why it is larger.

That is our budget comparison for the year. You can see there is not a lot of difference, it is almost the same. 5.7% increase is what it ended up being. There is our operations breakdown, so we have operations, programming, grants-in-aid, and then the travel. We really like to put a lot of our money into the community, so that is why our grants-in-aid are important and our operations is how we cooperate with them. External funding sources is another thing we are working hard on. We do have outside funding that comes in that we manage and we are always looking. This is one of the other areas. Besides just getting really (inaudible) how government works, how procurement works, they are also learning how to go after funding. These are all prime things that a leader needs to be able to handle to really succeed in economic development and at the county.

These are some of the highlights of the things we did over the year. One of our innovation grants is slowly trying to figure out how to get a clam business going here. We have a brand-new filming website, which is fantastic and all the film permits are now online, thank goodness. We have been doing a lot of data mining to study travel patterns so that we could do the Mobility Pilot project. That is that.

Councilmember Kualī'i: You gave the breakdown of all these categories, some as little as 9% of your budget, I think even Sustainability was 3%, but then you lump what seems like two (2) separate ones with Workforce and Tourism being 26%. Do you have the breakdown between to Workforce and Tourism?

Ms. Ka'auwai Brun: I think we can figure that out. Workforce is just one-line item and it is our KCC grant that goes to KCC.

Councilmember Kualī'i: So, it might even be lower than 3% and that is why you just stuck it in there with Tourism?

Ms. Ka'auwai Brun: It is mostly because Michelle actually handles both of those things, she is the lead in those areas.

Councilmember Kualī'i: Oh, just by staff assigned.

Ms. Ka'auwai Brun: Yes, by staff.

Councilmember Kagawa: Thank you for the presentation and thank you for the staff you assembled, I think you folks are doing a great job. Kilauea Ag Park facility, is there any funds in the current budget to build that facility where they wanted to do their sales?

Ms. Ka'auwai Brun: The new retail center?

Councilmember Kagawa: Yes.

Ms. Ka'auwai Brun: No, we do not have anything on our budget. In the past, the money that they have been asking for has basically been applying to us for innovation grants. We have not had CIP money for a long time.

Councilmember Kagawa: Are we open to perhaps funding that last piece?

Ms. Ka'auwai Brun: I do not even know how much that is. We have been working with him on getting it through legal, so making sure we have the leases correct and that is as far as we got.

Councilmember Kagawa: So, they probably need the plans and designs first.

Ms. Ka'auwai Brun: I think I have seen some of the designs, I just did not know they were short on cash.

Councilmember Kagawa: Okay, from what I heard they need significant amounts, especially now after COVID, the materials have all gone up. This ties in...we went that far already with everything, they are actually growing things. I know back when we first approved, former Councilmember Yukimura said, "No more running water," but we used county water, it is like how we make gardens at our homes, and seems to be successful. They are growing a lot of things, so kudos to them. You talked about clams and I remember my favorite was "V." Is there a possibility of working with...to see how we can expand that?

Ms. Ka'auwai Brun: There always is a possibility. Basically, it is where it grows best, so it maybe in a running stream, which is run by the Department of Land and Natural Resources (DLNR), so it is a little tricky with permitting. The clams themselves are actually in Nomilo Pond and there is someone with a lease and everything that can do it. That is the trick, getting it so it is legal and they can do the business.

Councilmember Kagawa: Thank you. Those are all North Shore projects, but I represent the entire island and not just Waimea.

Councilmember Cowden: I walk by the Ag Park probably four (4) to five (5) times a week, we just got a whole big brand-new building there and I know (inaudible) funding for the kitchen, so what building are you talking about?

Ms. Ka'auwai Brun: It is that building.

Councilmember Cowden: It is almost done.

Ms. Ka'auwai Brun: Yes. I am not sure what the finishing...we just toured it and it is beautiful. I am not sure what they are not finished with, but I am sure there is something. I will call Yoshi right away and see what is going on.

Councilmember Cowden: I will see him tomorrow, but I am curious whatever it is, is it expensive?

Ms. Ka'auwai Brun: I do not know what is happening.

Councilmember Cowden: I am thinking when it is going to open. You talked about a Fast Charger, what does that mean?

Ms. Ka'auwai Brun: It is shorter.

CHRISTINA KASER, Specialist III – Energy: Hello, everyone.

Councilmember Cowden: What is the Fast Charger? Are you talking about someone parking and charging their cars?

Ms. Kaser: Yes. There are three (3) levels to chargers at this point in time. The electric vehicle chargers, level 1, 2, and 3. Currently, all of the public chargers on Kaua'i are level 2 and this project would be bringing the first public level 3 chargers and those can go at about...I think they can get 80% charged within forty (40) minutes.

Councilmember Cowden: Okay, so that is quite a bit better. I see people will park in a free charger in a parking lot, not go into the stores, I am fine with it, but they have to sit there for two (2) or three (3) hours, get enough charge to go back to Līhu'e. This is a shorter charge. There is Ag Tourism, is that farm driven...there is no pressure for them to do it, that is like a farmer wants it.

Ms. Ka'auwai Brun: We are working with the University of Hawai'i. They went around and asked and there were five (5) who were interested and we thought it has potential to get going within the year. They had to agree to it and they are going through the training, which includes business training and support for permitting and everything else, but it is just five (5) of them at this point.

Councilmember Cowden: And part of that they are probably learning how to get along with their neighbors...

Ms. Ka'auwai Brun: Very important.

Councilmember Cowden: In the *kalo* fields in Hanalei, people are unexcited about their neighbor, considering that. There are a lot of places where neighbors are not excited about their friends making a choice like that. When we have this funding, does it go to only nonprofits or does it go to businesses?

Ms. Ka'auwai Brun: With most of our grants, they must go to nonprofits. We use the grant process which requires that.

Councilmember Cowden: Just framing what I get that is a little bit of friction is when someone has a business and they put all the energy into running their business and the county gives money to a nonprofit to compete with the private business, but there is that confusion. That might be something that is thought about a little bit, like I support the little store at the Ag Park near me and we had Kīlauea Market that opened up a block in the other direction that is doing the same thing, so then you have two (2) existing stores with a third competitor.

Council Chair Rapozo: I have others waiting, so is it a new question?

Councilmember Cowden: I will wait.

Councilmember DeCosta: Thank you to you and your team. I am glad your team is here, because they will hear firsthand my questions. I am not saying I do not agree

all of our county employees should not be paid to the best of their ability, but I am looking at your department, Economic Development Specialist III, IV, and V, do they do any supervisory responsibilities or are they just individuals that work with each other? Who is the supervisor in this department?

Ms. Ka'auwai Brun: The only supervisor is me.

Councilmember DeCosta: And you are the Director? Every one of your Economic Development Specialist make \$71,000 to \$74,000. When I look back at our DMV Operation Supervisor with the same SR-22 number, the same as your employees, I am not sure of HR work, I might have to ask Janine, but the supervisor makes \$71,594, that is the Operation DMV Supervisor pay, and yet she is a supervisor. I just wanted to know are these union positions or?

Ms. Ka'auwai Brun: No, these are exempt positions.

Councilmember DeCosta: We put the money or we set the salary for you?

Ms. Ka'auwai Brun: We look at them like a private industry would. What are their talents? What can they do and then how do they prove themselves?

Councilmember DeCosta: I am looking at your budget and I can crunch the numbers, you are under...looking at Administration, Agriculture, Business, Innovation, Energy, Film, Kaua'i Made, Sustainability, and Workforce, you do the numbers, it might be under \$500,000. You have a \$500,000 budget that is ran by...if I do the math on your payroll here, your payroll might be close to your budget.

Ms. Ka'auwai Brun: Yes, it might be a little under, yes.

Councilmember DeCosta: It is not about taking away money from our employees, I want to see all of our county employees get paid what they want to, but I am just wondering how can we do this for the other divisions that are struggling. I look at your Accountant, you have an Accountant, Economic Development Accountant.

Ms. Ka'auwai Brun: He is not here today.

Councilmember DeCosta: Certified, degree, how do you hire an Accountant?

Ms. Ka'auwai Brun: He was actually before I got back, but he came out of Wilcox as one of their accountants.

Councilmember DeCosta: He is an SR-20 making \$41,000.

Ms. Ka'auwai Brun: He has been there a long time.

Councilmember DeCosta: I am going to have to have a talk with Janine folks.

Councilmember Kualif'i: That is not the full salary, correct?

Councilmember Cowden: Yes, this is just part of that. He would get almost twice that.

Council Chair Rapozo: So, it is about high seventies.

Councilmember DeCosta: Who set the criteria on this pay scale?

Ms. Ka'auwai Brun: I do.

Councilmember DeCosta: You set the numbers of Janine folks.

Ms. Ka'auwai Brun: I work with HR, we look at the numbers.

Councilmember DeCosta: Can we call up Janine?

JANINE M.Z. RAPOZO, HR Manager III: Good afternoon.

Councilmember DeCosta: Sorry, for being the one who ask this question, but how do you justify these numbers versus the budget and the amount of work that OED has compared to other employees across the county who has larger departments and they are almost doing the same work, if not, different type of category work, but how do we do it?

Ms. Rapozo: OED is actually an agency under the Office of the Mayor, so they are not civil service employees, they are exempt. However, they must be classified so all of their positions are classified in our classification system that we talked about, and so you will see SR-20, SR-22, SR-24, so depending on the level of work they do, they will be classified at one of those levels. The difference from a civil servant is that the director can look at the salary schedule, which has different steps and decide at what level she wants to hire them at. What you are seeing is actually salary starting July 1, 2023. Right now, they are not making what you are seeing. There is going to be a bump because of collective bargaining, so they are actually a little bit less than that.

Councilmember DeCosta: No, I am not saying that they do not deserve their money. I am an economics major, so the more money you pay your employees, the more money they spend, the more money circulates. I want to be able to see what Nalani, in her division, and how can we help other divisions like DMV, who were struggling trying to hire people for positions that they do not have the ability to do what Nalani is able to do. I am just trying to clarify how can we help out our other departments to be like Nalani, so we can attract these qualified people that she has.

Ms. Rapozo: The difference with DMV is they are civil service, so there is a lot more security in their jobs. With these people, they are appointed, they are exempt. They did not go through a process of minimum qualifications, having to qualify starting at the first step. They do not have the security as a DMV Representative has. That is the difference.

Councilmember DeCosta: So, upon every Mayor change, then they possibly might not have their job?

Ms. Rapozo: Possibly.

Councilmember DeCosta: Now I understand, thank you.

Councilmember Kualii: The grants in the budget, when you went through all of your slides, it was on the management slide that you said the grants were and that is why they make...

Ms. Ka'auwai Brun: Direct grants, yes.

Councilmember Kualii: The more than 50% of that area. So, whatever grants that come out of OED is represented there, because then you said something about innovation grants.

Ms. Ka'auwai Brun: Yes.

Councilmember Kualii: Even though it is in the management area, the grants themselves go to all the different areas. You could have a grant for agriculture, energy, Kaua'i Made...

Ms. Ka'auwai Brun: Each area has innovation grants, those are not determined, they are going to go through the RFP to get put out. There are a few direct grants that we have in our budget, Tourism has one, which is why that is a little bit higher, and then we have two (2) for the YWCA in the management grants, I think those are the three (3) direct grants. Those kind of drive it up. But those are direct and already decided on.

Councilmember Kualii: So, those will show up in different places in the budget.

Ms. Ka'auwai Brun: Yes. Did you folks get the copy of this?

Councilmember Kualii: Oh, yes.

Ms. Ka'auwai Brun: That one has very specific information on each of them.

Councilmember Kualii: You mentioned innovation grant and then you said that one in particular goes to each of the areas?

Ms. Ka'auwai Brun: Yes.

Councilmember Kualii: Is there a low and a high and how do people get these applications?

Ms. Ka'auwai Brun: We will actually sit down once we have the budget settled and then talk about how much money we have for each area, and then the Specialist will sit down, we are looking at what is going on, what we want to encourage happening. For example, one year Councilmember Kagawa told us about some of the parakeet problem, and we guided some of the verbiage in the RFPs saying these are the primary things that we would like to be covered with our grants, they would get highest priority. Everyone comes in, they all get scored, not only by the team, but also by the public. It goes on a public platform called "Consider It," we advertise and the public can actually go on there and give some comments of what they see, what they like, what they do not like, how can I help, etcetera. That is how the RFP process works. We try to include everyone and we have separate pots, which we try to get filled. For example, Film has \$50,000 and they want to do a film project, this is what I am looking for as a film project, it is in the RFP, and then we score all the film projects, the top one gets the funding. She will determine if it is \$50,000 or \$25,000 or what the number is going to be.

Councilmember Kualii: Is there a minimum or maximum?

Ms. Ka'auwai Brun: Usually minimum or maximum for an area, a sector, and they vary. For Sustainability, there is only \$25,000 so it would be anywhere from whatever smallest amount is, \$10,000 to \$25,000.

Councilmember Kualii: If several nonprofit organizations applied for a sustainable grant, would you just take all the money and give it to one of them or would you...

Ms. Ka'auwai Brun: It is by score.

Councilmember Kualii: Yes, I know, but if you do not say we have a \$5,000 grant and we have five (5) of them, then what are people really going after? Are they going after your liking of their project and their ability to give them a little bit of the pot or all of the pot?

Ms. Ka'auwai Brun: Most of them try to go for whatever the top amount is, but there is a period in there because it is an exempted RFP, where we can actually go in and negotiate after-the-fact. So, once we go in, there are so many projects...this one does not quite fit, but maybe if they change this a little bit, they will fit in this little area, so then we go into negotiation with them and they try to fit themselves in there if they are interested, if not, then they pull out.

Councilmember Kualii: And it is not a whole lot of money.

Ms. Ka'auwai Brun: Typically, no. We probably do ten (10) grants a year. We used to have a lot more money because we used to have the Hawai'i Tourism Authority money, which we did massive amounts of grants, but now we are very much concentrating on solving local problems. That is really what we are trying to do, have an economic development focus.

Councilmember Kualii: Does the grant have a deadline once a year?

Ms. Ka'auwai Brun: Yes, we try to get them done within a year. The requirement is that they report every quarter; financial and written, and we try to close them out within a year. We have extended, honestly, especially because they had a lot of problems with shipping things in, so they have some type of thing they are trying to ship in, that has been a big problem. They had to adjust budgets.

Councilmember Carvalho: Just in general, OED pretty much reaches out and offers opportunities for businesses, that is the big part and the money part will benefit the community.

Ms. Ka'auwai Brun: Yes.

Councilmember Carvalho: I just wanted to share that is the bigger picture, overall. I know there are individual parts, but reaching out to the community and bringing the money. I do not see anything here, is there anything to support or attending the Hawai'i on the Hill?

Ms. Ka'auwai Brun: No, we do not have that in the budget. That is because we did the budget before we realized they were going to restart it, but yes, that is a primary one. We usually work with the chamber with that. Like you said, yes, it is all about working with the community and the good thing about it is typically we can at least double our money. For example, if we put \$500,000 into grants, we can get a \$1,000,000 worth or more. Our goal is always more than that.

Council Chair Rapozo: Hawai'i on the Hill is a good opportunity.

Councilmember Cowden: I was noticing this about the loss of locations for films, that was interested to me. Some of the key places have been bought. Are interest from the film industry shrinking?

Ms. Ka'auwai Brun: Let me call Sandy up because she just came back from the big film conference about what is going on with film.

Councilmember Cowden: Okay, tell us, how is it going?

SANDY KA'AUWAI, Specialist IV – Film Commissioner/Tourism: The film industry is slowly recovering from the pandemic. 2020 and 2021 were very difficult years for film, but 2022 actually seems a lot grimmer than it actually was. We actually did okay last year. We issued about seventy (70) permits for smaller projects, nothing you are going to read, no big film projects that you are going to read about in the paper or anything like that. It was actually a decent year. Locations, yes, we lost a lot of locations, that is what I am hearing from our location managers. They cannot get into places that they used to get into for a number of reasons, one is they are being bought up and the people who are buying them up, do not really need extra cash, so they are not willing to...despite the fact that they may pay \$25,000/\$30,000 a day, they are just not interested. They do not want people on the property, they just do not. Other reasons film has been difficult, the lack of hotel rooms. Because tourism has been booming, they cannot get any kind of decent size crew here without paying through the nose. It is all about money.

Councilmember Cowden: A few years ago, we were being pretty aggressive on trying to do training and I really enjoyed taking the film class that I did, that was amazing. It was beyond what one would ever imagine for bringing a rockstar crowd of people here to be teaching small providers. Have we throttled back on that, because people like me end up being a councilperson instead of a film maker, that was a hobby of mine. We were putting a lot of emphasis on it, what happened?

Ms. Ka'auwai Brun: We are going to continue, actually.

Ms. Ka'auwai: Our focus in 2023 is really on workforce development, rebuilding the film industry from the ground up, and that is through a couple ways, the Good Jobs Hawai'i with the state, so we are working with the Department of Business, Economic Development, and Tourism (DBEDT) on that. One of the good things about the pandemic is a lot of film makers moved here and they have been really great about offering their services to do different types of training. Our 48-hour film project, which is coming up in September, they offered to do a lot of classes for participants who might be interested.

Councilmember Cowden: I saw we had a major film maker, who was at Anaina Hou, who was teaching kids to make films.

Councilmember DeCosta: Tell me a little bit about your job responsibilities. What do you do and how do you do it? Do you reach out to these movie companies or do you wait until they reach out to us? Tell me about your position. I wanted to ask Nalani if you have a cost analysis of how much film industry money was brought in based on how we can have her position lined up to that. I want to see the cost analysis of how much money is coming into the county based on funding that position. What do you do? How do you reach out to movie industries?

Ms. Ka'auwai: Several different ways. We do have a marketing campaign going on. We advertise on social media, we are members of the location managers (inaudible) in Los Angeles (LA).

Councilmember DeCosta: Is that something where they can contact us directly, they contact your office directly and say, "I want to do a film."

Ms. Ka'auwai: Yes. So, either us or the state, which ever way.

Councilmember DeCosta: Do you have some local connection with the large landowners on the local side?

Ms. Ka'auwai: Yes.

Councilmember DeCosta: I know you mentioned some of the large lands were currently bought up, but most of the land that the film industry uses is old land, land from companies that have been there long time.

Ms. Ka'auwai: Yes.

Councilmember DeCosta: Do you feel that relationship is continuing?

Ms. Ka'auwai: Yes, definitely.

Councilmember DeCosta: Get me the number, I wanted to see how much...

Ms. Ka'auwai Brun: Sounds interesting.

Council Chair Rapozo: Thank you. Are there any other film questions?

Councilmember Kualii: We were still on the overview.

Councilmember Cowden: I have one (1) overview question. You mentioned KCC and I wondered...when I think of what OED would do, it is a lot more than what money it brings to the county, it is money that is brought to the people of the county. Your *kuleana* is to help our community have good jobs. You mentioned KCC once, but how much do you help to drive what their curriculum might go in the direction of...I have heard that their mechanics program is actually maybe folding, I was really sad to hear that because we need mechanics. When we have a need, I think the trades are a high need. How do we put some oxygen on that fire? How do we get what we need out of KCC? To me, that would be a primary job on OED. When we see a demand, how do we create that? How does OED work with KCC to funnel what we need?

Ms. Ka'auwai Brun: The grant that we provide to KCC pays for trainings, so more recently we have directed it, actually to the same place as Good Jobs Hawai'i is trying to direct it. About two (2) years ago, we said we want our training to pay for people going through any type of medical healthcare field, anyone who is going through the creative industries, because they have a creative industry lab here, and there are some other areas that we focused on with KCC. In addition to that, we actually let them use the funding

to do things like forklift training, just because someone cannot get high enough in their job because they do not have the forklift training. We have been pumping money into some of those strange trades to lift them up. It does work really well and of course Good Jobs Hawai'i has a lot of money coming down and KCC is part of that. They have a big focus on the industries that are more higher paying, so we are working with KCC and with the Good Jobs people, all the different partners to get that done.

Councilmember Cowden: What do we call Workforce Investment Board now? I was on the Workforce Investment for a while. It has a new name.

Ms. Ka'auwai Brun: It is called the Kaua'i Workforce Development Board now.

Councilmember Cowden: Okay, the same thing. When I look at all of these scholarships brought up by Mokihana and the Lions, I am pitching them constantly on my radio show, and I know it is hard to get people to even grab for that, so I feel like if we were to go, "Okay, here is a pot of money, we need a forklift driver, get \$2,000 from the Lions to pay for this," and go right into the work. I did not grow up here, I am the only one who did not, but where I did grow up, industry, education, and the funding all coupled together, so you got trained and went right into where you were going to work and that was the norm. It seems like that is lacking here. I would just like to encourage that in OED's way of doing it.

Ms. Ka'auwai Brun: The trades are very busy.

Councilmember DeCosta: How much help do we give Sandy to "hook up" with location managers across the film industry, because I believe it is location managers who put areas on the film producer part. Is she in contact with the right people and how can we support her to be in the right contact? Just by her being Sandy...if she has no outside contact, she came into the position, how many years have you been our film person?

Ms. Ka'auwai: Four (4).

Councilmember DeCosta: Have we reached out to our location managers across the film industry? I am just trying to make sure you have the resources to be successful. You know I know a little bit about the film industry, because I am talking the "flute," I am playing that music, so you know I know my information. Do you feel confident that these location managers are the ones who are going to put the film on the producer side, are you good? Okay, thank you.

Council Chair Rapozo: We have to find the movie people first. It is too expensive to come here.

Ms. Ka'auwai Brun: It is all about money.

Councilmember Kualii: You said direct grants, management grants, and innovation grants, I think I also heard you say something about, “for community events, there is a separate RFP process.” Is that a fourth type of grant?

Ms. Ka’auwai Brun: Yes, so there are innovation grants, and then there are direct grants, the direct grants just happen to be in the management and tourism pots, and then the third one, yes, we are going to reopen special events grants. We have not had that for a while, because there were no events happening during the pandemic. The Hawai’i Tourism Authority is kind of on a change, that is happening. We are realizing we need to put the basket under and catch some of these events that are really important to our community. We are going to go back to having a separate RFP for the events, that is simpler than the innovation grant, so that they can just fill out their things, let us know what they are doing, and then we will do it just like how we used to do; score and then fund.

Councilmember Kualii: On Master page 91, the line item of grant-in-aid from \$988,000 to \$1,000,000, the line item that is Economic Development for \$272,713, is that where this Special Events grants would come under and how much of that pot is for that?

Ms. Ka’auwai Brun: Special Events is going to be \$50,000.

Councilmember Kualii: Do you have it broken down by direct grants, management grants, innovation grants, and then \$50,000 for Special Events grants? I see it broken down by area.

Ms. Ka’auwai Brun: Yes, that is by area and the AS400, and if you look in the big sheet, we broke it up, but I can easily come up with a sheet that just has them all broken down.

Councilmember Kualii: On this sheet, it is basically getting it into really small pieces, I only care about the categories, types of grants, and how people get access to each of those types of grants and when.

Ms. Ka’auwai Brun: Okay.

Council Chair Rapozo: You have the grant-in-aid amounts and then you have another line item called Other Services, which agriculture is \$35,000, grant-in-aid, you have agriculture at \$100,000, what is the difference between grant-in-aid and Other Services?

Ms. Ka’auwai Brun: Other Services is what we do in-house. We are not going to give it to someone else to get the thing done, we are actually going to pull it off within OED, so we will go through the procurement process or whatever process we need to do to get the project done.

Council Chair Rapozo: So, those funds are not available for nonprofits. Sunshine Market monitor, I noticed you still have the \$35,000, are we still doing that?

Ms. Ka'auwai Brun: We still have the Kapa'a Market and the Hanapēpē Market.

Council Chair Rapozo: Do we have a monitor?

Ms. Ka'auwai Brun: We do not have a monitor. If you think it is hard to hire someone for the county, it is even harder to hire an 89-day Sunshine Market monitor.

Council Chair Rapozo: I understand.

Ms. Ka'auwai Brun: We are hopeful that we are going to get one, because we want to take that Wednesday market up a level and try to make it into an actual "Hump Day" event with more than just the farmers, and actually be able to activate the new ordinance that you passed to add more things to the market.

Council Chair Rapozo: A big spike in advertising, is there a big expectation that we are going to be doing more advertising?

Ms. Ka'auwai Brun: We are hoping to. We have so many programs going on, we just need to get the word out, so we are looking to try to push out, not just Kaua'i Made, but all the different programs that we have and use the social media contract to help us get that done. Right now, we are doing it in-house, our wonderful Michelle Rego is our queen of our social media, but it is massive in trying to get the right people, get the information to the right people, and with social media right now, we have to be able to hit the right people at the right time. We are hoping to do a small contract that will help us with all of our programing.

Council Chair Rapozo: I realize now that this is probably 7-month funding, but you are at \$23,000, and you are asking for \$160,000, that is a huge jump. Is that what...

Councilmember Kualii: \$139,000.

Council Chair Rapozo: No, I am looking at year-to-day expenditures. What you asked for last year is irrelevant to me, it is what you spent.

Ms. Ka'auwai Brun: Yes.

Council Chair Rapozo: Again, I am just trying to make a determination whether or not you folks are going to need more funding, because you have not spent that much and is it going to be on a contract like a social media contract.

Ms. Ka'auwai Brun: Yes, we have a social media contract and then we started to ramp up all of the Kaua'i Made events. That is really where we spend a lot of money getting the word out. I know that we just had one, so that might not even be in this document yet, and we have a bunch of others coming up right away. I saw it going through procurement, so I know it is happening.

Councilmember DeCosta: Tell me a little bit about your plan for the follow up advertising. When you talk about social media, I do not think you have a price on social media. I think paying the employee to work on the social media advertising, but I do not think social media charges us to display or advertise our Sunshine Markets.

Ms. Ka'auwai Brun: It is all kinds of things. We would have...you hire someone and they are good at it, they prep the whole, they know everything that you are going to do and then they come up with a plan for the whole month. These are all the things that are going to hit on these days and this is why.

Councilmember DeCosta: Are we hiring a special person to do that?

Ms. Ka'auwai Brun: That is a contract. We would go out for an RFP and take in proposals and then hire someone to do...

Councilmember DeCosta: Would one of our staff manage that contract?

Ms. Ka'auwai Brun: Yes. That would be everything from Get Around Kaua'i to Kaua'i Forward to Kaua'i Made, the film things, we have a lot of different topics we need to cover as we are trying to get the word out and advertise it, get people to our website, so they are getting the right information. That is mostly what they are going to be doing.

Councilmember DeCosta: Please tell me, I know you mentioned this, maybe I heard it wrong, when you talked about a business person, on your staff, you mentioned about something watching what happens to cesspools, did I hear that correct?

Ms. Ka'auwai Brun: It is our sustainability person.

Councilmember DeCosta: Did I hear that correct? Does that person watch what happens to our cesspools?

Ms. Ka'auwai Brun: We are watching what happens legislatively with this. We are trying to find out how they are going to change...I think the goal is 80% or 90% change out of cesspools by 2050, is the goal. We are monitoring that, trying to figure out how we can assist to get that done. A lot of them are businesses, so we are trying to figure out how to help the businesses make the transition, because that will be a big help too.

Councilmember DeCosta: The easy part is giving them the money to upgrade their cesspool to septic.

Ms. Ka'auwai Brun: We are always looking for money. That is what the person does, she is looking out, where is the money, is there some way we can assist these folks to get the money here, so they can get this done.

Councilmember DeCosta: You mentioned "she," which one is it? May I see...

Ms. Ka'auwai Brun: Ana.

Councilmember DeCosta: How sharp is she...if you are looking for money, grants, can we give her the tools, like I asked to give Sandy, the tools for her to get grants. Is she a grant writer, if not, can we put her in contact with someone who is? I want to make sure your staff has the tools to be successful. Same as your Sunshine Market person. You are going to send that person to boost Sunshine Markets in Hanapēpē, but does that person know about agriculture and Sunshine Markets and what is that person's experience? I want them to have the tools. These are the private contractors you have here. I want them to be successful because I want them to get their jobs back. Derek leaves in four (4) years, I want the next Mayor to look at these folks as being a contractor who is doing a good job and we are going to help them do a good job. Do not be afraid to ask for that type of funding, so we can help them do their jobs.

Ms. Ka'auwai Brun: Thank you. That is really a big goal for me. I am aging out and I want the next generation to come in and help us.

Councilmember DeCosta: Do you need a grant person?

Ms. Ka'auwai Brun: They are all learning to write grants now.

Councilmember DeCosta: Okay, perfect.

Ms. Ka'auwai Brun: They all have great communication abilities.

Council Chair Rapozo: Is there anyone else?

Councilmember Kagawa: The Aloun food farming is amazing, from Kaumakani to Pākalā, *mauka* to *makai*. They said because they are going to be growing so much that it may require exporting. One of the wish list items that they have is Port Allen pier taking in importing/exporting from there, and for me personally, I would rather see us use it in that fashion, support agriculture, getting us off tourism and get us more towards food sustainability, rather than being a tourist's launching pad, going to Nā Pali. I do not think that is important for us.

Ms. Ka'auwai Brun: I agree.

Councilmember Kagawa: Are we on board to maybe try to see what it will take to...

Ms. Ka'auwai Brun: Recently, a bunch of team members worked with the Kaua'i Economic Development Board to apply for a Hawai'i Regional Food Center, millions of dollars grant to try to get that over here. Part of it, they were looking at Port Allen, so people are realizing that it is a great option for westside farmers to get things out.

Councilmember Kagawa: We have Auntie Lilikoi's, we have the salt, there are a lot of potential exporters going out from the westside, and I am sure it is only going to help, especially when you are shipping tons of produce. I am onboard with anywhere I can help, I want to work together with you folks.

Council Chair Rapozo: I think we all are. When I hear OED, that is what I hear. What can we as the county, including this body here, do to make that happen and all the other farms, then they do not have to bring their produce in. I know because I have spoken to a couple people that said, "Good luck," because that is being used by the tourist industry. If we can help those farmers...in the constitution, it forces us to support agriculture more than tourist boats going out of Port Allen. I am not sure if they reached out to OED or KEDB or HTA, but I think that is where we can help by lobbying for them, talking to our delegation and saying, "This is what we need." Just food for thought.

Ms. Ka'auwai Brun: Yes.

Council Chair Rapozo: That was one thing that was brought to my attention. It is going to be an uphill battle, because again, the dollar.

Councilmember Carvalho: The Consultant Services Business Innovation, can you explain that again?

Ms. Ka'auwai Brun: That is a contractor that we have and he works closely with Nate. As we are looking at new businesses, he does not do start-ups, like Small Business Development Corporation (SBDC) does the start-up work, but for businesses that are wanting to make a jump up, so they are wanting to increase bodies, add on some new product or whatever it is, but they are going to try to expand, that is where Warren comes in. He comes in and consults with them, he helps them, he has a lot of access to different capital places out there, and he just works with them in that way to try and help them get it done.

Councilmember Carvalho: What types of businesses?

Ms. Ka'auwai Brun: Any kind of business.

Councilmember DeCosta: I want to add *mana'o* to the shipping, Councilmember Kagawa hit it on the nose. Back then when we had sugar, Port Allen was very viable, because we had tonnage going out. We lost sugar and there was no reason to have it, but now with the agricultural companies getting revamped up, I believe the conversation, I believe the company who runs Young Brother's now, maybe have one of your office personnel talk to them and see if they would be willing to come down once every two (2) weeks, to a smaller barge. If we had containers down at the harbor that we would rent

from Nāwiliwili and then have the pallets on the flat barge, and then when we get to Nāwiliwili, they would load it for us. That would be a viable thing to get our goods out and it will save a lot of the company's time to traverse the produce from the west side over to Līhu'e. To all of your local businesses, Hawai'i on the Hill, let us go. That is a good event. Bring your staff since they are all contracted by our Mayor, we are going to give them some traveling money, they coming with us now.

Councilmember Kualī'i: Do you have vacancies?

Ms. Ka'auwai Brun: No.

Councilmember Kualī'i: There are a couple of positions, Accountant, where it says 56% funding, and then partially funded by other source. What are the other sources? Is it state money?

Ms. Ka'auwai Brun: Originally it was Hawai'i Tourism Authority money and Workforce Development money, that has dried out, so currently it is ARPA funds, so he manages all the ARPA and CARES funds that came through for our office.

Councilmember Kualī'i: The ARPA will only last so long. That is an Accountant position and the one above that says, "Economic Development Specialist II" fully funded by other sources.

Ms. Ka'auwai Brun: Yes, that is funded by ARPA. She came on...the two (2) areas that we were able to cover were basically workforce and tourism recovery. That is exactly what she is working on.

Councilmember Kualī'i: Under wages and hourly pay, there is Position No. 9222 Economic Development Specialist IV. The note says...and there is nothing budgeted, but it says, "Position moved to County Attorney's," so was this a vacant position prior and how long was it vacant and what did this position do for OED before and how is that being handled now that you gave away the position?

Ms. Ka'auwai Brun: That was the Workforce person, so managing WIOA, but we do not have that anymore and we did not have a lot of people coming in for jobs, so the requirements lessened and he went onto something else and Michelle covers whatever is left of Workforce.

Councilmember Kualī'i: The Workforce Innovation and Opportunity Act (WIOA) was a big program before.

Ms. Ka'auwai Brun: It still exists.

Councilmember Kualī'i: Oh, it is with the state.

Ms. Ka'auwai Brun: Yes, just with the state and we are running under the O'ahu umbrella. We still have a seat at the table, we still go to their meetings to see what we can do, and that is how we got Good Jobs Hawai'i assigned.

Councilmember DeCosta: I asked this question with our Collection Agency in the Finance Department—how closely connected they are to the other entities across the State of Hawai'i? They said it is huge for them to meet and talk about their procedures and policies, I am wondering if you have given your team an opportunity to visit the other counties' teams. Let them cross-collaborate, find out what is working, what is not working, you can make your team that much more viable. Do we take them?

Ms. Ka'auwai Brun: Yes.

Councilmember DeCosta: Do we allow them to travel?

Ms. Ka'auwai Brun: The agriculture people are connected to the other agriculture people, they go around the different islands and meet up. Nate just came back from meeting with some of the business folks. We do it, we love our counterparts.

Councilmember DeCosta: That is what I wanted to make sure. Again, you got the tools to make your team successful.

Councilmember Kualii: Between now and when the budget comes back to us in May, will you make an addition for the line item that is Hawai'i on the Hill?

Ms. Ka'auwai Brun: I could do that or find another way to do it.

Council Chair Rapozo: I like that answer better.

Councilmember Kualii: I think it is important.

Council Chair Rapozo: Are there any further questions? If not, we will take our caption break now.

There being no objections, the meeting recessed at 3:17 p.m.

The meeting was called back to order at 3:27 p.m. and proceeded as follows:

Planning Department

Council Chair Rapozo: Thank you for being here. Can you start with an overview?

KA'ĀNIA S. HULL, Director of Planning: I have with me, Myles Hironaka, and Marie Williams of our Planning staff. We did submit the budget narrative to you folks, I know that you folks have had a fairly long day, I can go over some of those operational highlights

and operational challenges. Overall, our budget is pretty much flat, with the exception of the small increases within the 6.5% for contract negotiations as well as inflation. Aside from the 6.5%, we do have one ask, I can jump into that ask, but I do not know if you wanted me to go into our operational information.

Council Chair Rapozo: I would jump into the ask.

Councilmember Cowden: Ask first, yes.

Council Chair Rapozo: Like you said, it is a relatively flat budget. I think everyone has an idea, so yes, the challenges maybe and the asks.

Mr. Hull: The challenges that we are facing right now that we listed in our narrative is just maintaining that level of service to the public, as well as permit review in a timely and effective manner. We are definitely keeping up with it at this point. From a front counter standpoint, there are four (4) positions that generally serve the front counter and that is all of the front counter inquires, as well as all of the administrative or Class I zoning permits. These are the over-the-counter permits, everything from a 300-square foot shed to a single-family dwelling. These folks are the front lines of the Planning Department and right now we are still vacant one (1) of those positions. During COVID, one of the silver-linings that happened during COVID and having everyone telework from home is we actually found that the permit review timeliness of our front counter staff when working from home doubled. Whereas if they are reviewing one hundred (100) permits a month, that individual is now reviewing two hundred (200) permits and taking action per month. A lot of it had to do because they are not working the front counter. Without the front counter interaction, they will just focus down and hunker and bang out Class I zoning permits and zoning permits. It was very much my intention when we came back from COVID to cycle the front counter staff on a rotational basis having two (2) work the front counter and two (2) work from home rotating week by week, so that everyone is working at home a little bit and then we are taking advantages of efficiencies of having downtime, while also still being able to service the front counter. Being that we are down one (1) staff member up there, we have not been able to shift into that mode. The main supervisor for the front counter does telework one-day a week and really is the bulk of banging out permits during that one-day she is teleworking, but we are able to keep up at this point with the front counter permit review and front counter interaction. Some of that is a little bit having to do with the interest rates and the slow down in some construction activity and inability for some families to not be able to qualify for some of the mortgages, which slowed down on the permitting, which is allowed a reprieve for our staff to really just barely keep their head above water, but if interest rates start to go down, we could see those permits move up. We are cognizant of that and wanting to make sure that we are constantly responding to the front counter inquires, as well as having a timely review of the zoning and building permits.

Not so much a challenge, in fact we worked through it, but we are working with, I think you had a presentation from Del folks over at IT on the LIMS system. We have just been working and spending a lot of time with Del and his consultant to “spin up” a digitized interface for a zoning application online. Not to make it mandatory that everyone has to do

it online, but as an option, which is an option right now for building permits, that interface after spending several months with the team is pretty much 99% there. It is ready to move. We are just waiting for the final element in which the LIMS system can incorporate online payment for the entire county interface, because there is no point in us going online and having an online system if you still have to tell the applicant, "Okay, submit it online, but come into our department and pay the check." Hopefully, that happens relatively soon.

Where it says an upcoming challenge, but a good one is we are finally looking at, and I think you folks had some discussions with Jodi and Marie during the CIP portion of budget on the East Kaua'i Community Plan update. That will start up towards the end of the year. As far as the outreach beginning, they are securing the consultant right now. With the West Kaua'i Community Plan, some of you may be aware that the County of Kaua'i Planning Department acted as the prime consultant. We are going to hire a prime consultant, we have contracts of subconsultants, but our team really ran the entire plan. We felt confident doing it in-house and we were able to come out with a product. This one we really are looking for a consultant and the primary reason being that while there definitely be a land use urban planning component to the plan, there is going to have to be significant, major aspect of transportation and planning within that, which is not totally within our wheelhouse. Having a consultant with strong transportation to be able to lead that plan, we felt is prudent, so that is the final ask. This is a good challenge that we are waiting for. Are there any questions on the challenges? If not, I will go into the asks.

Council Chair Rapozo: Are there any questions on the challenges?

Councilmember Cowden: I was thankful when we did the West Kaua'i Community Development Plan that we put in Hawaiian Homes plan in there. That is such a long overdue, we cannot backwards put that in the General Plan, can we? That is done, we cannot add that to that, but I want to make sure we put that into the East Side plan. It seems that it is part of this real (inaudible) in our community. I do not know if you have watched some of our Water Department appointment and I think making sure we have Hawaiian homes in our development plans is one of the ways to get the appropriate water reservations out and the amount of capacity on the roads is certainly good on that. I guess you can do the asks and then I have a few questions on your synopsis.

Council Chair Rapozo: Councilmember Kualii.

Councilmember Kualii: My follow-up is on the East Kaua'i Community Plan, what is the geographical area? Is it east of the Wailua River? North of the Wailua River. How close to Lihu'e does it go?

MARIE WILLIAMS, Program Manager: The East Kaua'i Planning District that follows Wailua Stream, so the north bank of the river and goes all the way past Anahola area, so Anahola is included. I do believe a portion of the Moloa'a area is as well, but we might be looking at that boundary and that might be more appropriate for the North Shore Community Plan.

Councilmember Cowden: 'Aliomanu would stay in the East?

Ms. Williams: Yes, in the preplanning work we are just looking very closely at the boundary and will probably work with our Citizens Advisory Committee as well to ask them how they would define the geographic boundary too.

Councilmember Kualii: As far as including any lands from DHHL...how the bike path would come into Anahola, so there is a whole Anahola Town Center plan that has commercial and park areas and all of that.

Ms. Williams: Yes, we work very closely with DHHL. I know they are almost done with the regional plan update, so yes, whatever plan they have adopted and the community wants, we would intergrade it and support it through our planning effort.

Council Chair Rapozo: I have a question on your narrative on the highlights and it is the continued enforcement of TVRs. You mentioned that you actively monitor the world wide web, what does that mean? Is that Craigslist, Facebook?

Mr. Hull: One of the most powerful tools that we have for the engagement of the vacation rental industry's online advertisement as a whole is the MOUs we have with Airbnb and Expedia, and Expedia being the parent company of VRBO and Home Away. They send us a list once a month on all their advertisers, their TMKs, Airbnb allows us backdoor access into every single advertisement to be able to monitor those ones. That is roughly 70% to 80% of the market for Kaua'i. It is a very powerful tool, but at the end of the day, it is not all of the market. Joan Ludington who leads the TVR team basically is monitoring other websites that we do not necessarily have backdoor access into. That is Craigslist, that is Flip key, an array of smaller handful, almost niche market level of online platforms, as well as going through the various search engines and just searching, because a lot of shift in the industry is to try to attempt for vacation rental owners to gleam themselves off Airbnb and VRBO because the payments they have to make to the companies and do direct marketing to the consumer. Granted Airbnb and VRBO is so much of the market share, it is hard for them to do that, but they are attempting to do that so they try to directly advertise using the regular search engines to figure out which ones are direct advertising. I would say we started a process about six (6) months ago where we will actually fold in more than just the vacation rental staff. During COVID, we had a lot of our staff working out at the airport in monitoring who is coming in got familiar with the vacation rental process. This past year, we started a program where for about thirty (30) days we kind of just take a scorched earth policy of just looking everywhere and anywhere, so it is every single engine, I want you on TikTok, Facebook, every single platform we can find, really leaving no stone left unturned. That, we had about fifteen (15) members of our staff participate in that.

Council Chair Rapozo: What was the outcome? It says, "the department in turn takes action against any illegal operator and these websites and communicate with the platforms which of the TMKs are invalid," but what happens to these illegal operators? Do they get prosecuted? I have not heard of anyone being prosecuted.

Mr. Hull: Several years ago, we were forwarding some of these cases over to the Office of the Prosecuting Attorney. I would say that they were not necessarily prioritized and it was hard for us to fight for prioritization, too, in some of these cases when we knew some of these deputy prosecutors were like, "We have these murders here and these rapes..." But the civil fine process, we absolutely pursue civil fine process. The Hawai'i Revised Statutes (HRS) requires that we, upon first notice, can only put a violator on notice. We cannot fine upon first notice. The first time we find an operator, if they have never been noticed before, we are required by law to just notify them. We do threaten a possible fine of up to \$10,000 and I would say that the vast majority of those who get the notice do ultimately shut down. But those who do not, we pursue the civil fine and if they are willing to shut down within a day or two and they show us their cancellation policies and they remove themselves from Airbnb for which they cannot get back on, we are looking at reducing the fine. If they take some time to shut that operation down, we do look at imposing and holding that fine accountable. There are a handful that we are noticing that we shut down three (3) or four (4) years ago and now we are just finding them again.

Council Chair Rapozo: I keep hearing that we do not hardly have any, but I just saw we have fifty (50), but I do not think that is accurate. I think we have more than fifty (50) illegal TVRs on Kaua'i. That is just based on the information that gets sent to me in my personal messenger or email from people on Kaua'i, most on the North Shore. There is also vacation rentals or short-term rentals throughout the island, Kekaha, Wailua, so how many violations did we have last year? How many fines did we collect last year? Can you provide me with the TMK list, the most current one.

Mr. Hull: The one from Airbnb?

Council Chair Rapozo: Yes.

Mr. Hull: I definitely can, there are about 4,000 TMKs on it.

Council Chair Rapozo: I keep track of the complaints I get. I do not send them to you because I know you are busy.

Mr. Hull: Our enforcement program is run on a compliant basis because they cannot respond to every single violation out there. That is one exception and it is the vacation rental monitoring. Those ones are not compliant based, we are out there actively...so if you have any complaints, we would love it and for anyone watching this, you can give us the complaint and we can begin researching it. If anyone out there is aware of the actual online advertisement and just sends us the link, just based off of that link, identifying the property, we can issue a violation notice. We would love anyone reaching out to us to have that.

Council Chair Rapozo: Okay.

Mr. Hull: Mike Laureta is Chief of our Enforcement Division. Mike, how many violation notices did we issue?

MIKE LAURETA, Program Manager: Specifically, several dozen. I cannot give you the number, but I can give you the number of fines. You will never know how many NOV-1, NOV-2s that have been issued and fined.

Council Chair Rapozo: I am not sure what that is.

Mr. Hull: Notice of Violation 1 (NOV-1) is where we just noticed the property owner, you are in violation of the law by having this illegal operation, and we cannot fine them. If we issued a Notice of Violation 2 (NOV-2), that means that they did not comply with that first notice, and the second one we are in fact fining them.

Council Chair Rapozo: Okay.

Mr. Laureta: We issue the NOV-2 fine, you will never know how many we have issued unless you ask. If you ask, I can give you a list. I can tell you how much money we have collected in fines from 2013 to current.

Council Chair Rapozo: The last year. This fiscal year. I am not sure where it shows up in the budget, I am assuming it is on the revenue side.

Mr. Laureta: About \$88,000.

Council Chair Rapozo: \$88,000.

Mr. Hull: From the last fiscal year, we collected \$88,000 in fines.

Council Chair Rapozo: Not bad. When we collect the fine from one of these illegal operators, do we go back and follow-up to make sure they are not officially done?

Mr. Hull: Absolutely. I am okay saying this publicly, because I hope people that are still attempting to operate legally know what we are doing is the Airbnb gives the ability to sensor a property so they can never ever be advertised on their website again. We do not utilize that until after a year or two (2) of the investigation being closed out. If we shut someone down before, we, by design, do not ask them to get kicked off because we want to use that backdoor portal to see if they are jumping on again to go after them. Sometimes they will not use Airbnb knowing that we are monitoring it, but we will find them again on one of the smaller advertising websites and we are absolutely going after them. Those that are getting the NOV-3, there is not really any negotiation on the reduction of fines at that point.

Council Chair Rapozo: Do we work with the Real Property Tax Division so any of these people who are renting out their house, short-term rentals and maybe paying Residential, do we communicate with them?

Mr. Hull: Absolutely. All of our NOVs for an illegal vacation rental operation or an illegal homestay operation is sent to Real Property as well.

Councilmember DeCosta: Have we ever sent out an informational notice for the TVRs advertised and just so happen they are booked for that month, but they get the call from you. I told you that a lot of them are plugged into the same little group. Let us say that TVR is maxed out for the month, but you are my friend, so mine is maxed, so you can book at someone else's TVR. The person will personally call and say I have a reservation for you. Can we have information of violation informative email that can go out to every TVR people that is registered and say if you are caught booking for someone else, you are also in violation. Can we do that?

Mr. Hull: That would take an amendment to not just the vacation rental law, but the way that the violation works within the zoning is that it is a property owner that is held accountable for their violation happening on the property. For now, an individual that may own that property worked to get them the transient vacation person to stay somewhere else, then that is transactional issue, which my office has no oversight on. I believe just trying to work to get a number of policies passed on a vacation rental that needs to go to the state, but I have to defer that to the Office of the County Attorney.

Councilmember DeCosta: I am just asking. But how easy it is to actually do that. We can have more vacation rentals, TVRs than we know about. You can have a second home, not even advertise it and be in a non-visitor designation area and have it rented out by a friend, who is in the VDA and who is overbooked all the time. That is easily going on. Council Chair Rapozo said he bet there are a lot of vacation rentals going down and not being reported. How can we help to bring this to fruition? Do we need to talk to the State legislators?

Mr. Hull: Those are not advertising and utilizing word of mouth or going through backdoor channels, they are a lot harder to identify. Grant it that they are not availing themselves to a much more lucrative and larger market by keeping them off of these platforms, but do they exist? They do.

Council Chair Rapozo: They do. The best way is to make the complaint.

Mr. Hull: Yes. Some people do complain and I will explain that if they go through this website, you are going to try to book it and they are going to send them to someone else, those ones we do actually spin up sting operations, in which we have a dummy booking. We do have an individual that does "dummy" reservations and once we get the confirmation that they can reserve it, on a site that is not in the VDA, boom, we have a NOV spun up. Those are the trickiest to find and the hardest...

Council Chair Rapozo: The easiest way is to address the neighbor or send them to me, I will forward them to you.

Mr. Hull: Absolutely, we will appreciate that.

Council Chair Rapozo: It is clearly illegal and they are not being put up on these things, a lot of them... Craigslist, it is tough to monitor that.

Mr. Hull: When we do the scorched earth month, we are not just monitoring our Craigslist. We monitor that month, every Craigslist that has direct flights to Kaua'i, so that is Portland, San Francisco, Oakland, we are hitting all those Craigslist. Because they are not posted one day, it could be on the next day, so it is constantly monitoring that, that takes time.

Council Chair Rapozo: I volunteer and pretend to be the person... I will use my credit card to book and you will just reimburse me.

Councilmember Cowden: I think another area that is a problem is these vehicles that have tents on top of them. I am even seeing promotions for a camping event that sometimes has goals that are uncomfortable for me, is that nicely said? Does any of our TVR enforcement—do we have any vector for someone doing medicine journeys?

Mr. Hull: For camping cars, if you are camping on a road right-of-way or a county park illegally, my office does not have jurisdiction on that. Now, if we can identify that they are renting these vehicles from a non-commercial and non-industrial area, we can hit them and we have hit them in the past. For some of these other places where they have stays and retreats, we absolutely do hit those because we can identify the property, it is being held on the property. Some of the ones that have goals, not to be mentioned, the department has actually had to now procure a computer to utilize because the filters will not allow us to access some of these websites.

Councilmember Cowden: On page 3 (2b), increase in fringe cost, that fringe cost seems vague to me, what is fringe cost?

Mr. Hull: That is just like the insurance premiums.

Councilmember Cowden: Okay. Page 4 (4a) plantation camp form based code, I am enthusiastic to see that become somewhat of a reality. It is my sense that actually meets the desire of a need for a lot of our lower income. That is a highlight from last year. We have the overlay. I could not find the code for that. Is that going to be a new ordinance that we need to present?

Mr. Hull: The overlay is online and we can send the link to you. The overlay was adopted last year. It is in Chapter 10. It is form base code but it is also specific to the form and character to Kaumakani Camp and Kaumakani Avenue. Can you take that overlay and utilize it in other parts of the island? You could. I have to put my planner hat on and say it would not be total genuine to form base code in the sense that we spent a lot of time creating those building types based off of Kaumakani camps building type. Any of the form base code may be appropriate to look at each of the unique areas to establish building types that are similar in nature to the building types of that respective area. Having

said that though, yes, to your point about there being interests, there is a lot of interests and a lot of landowners and affordable housing developers have been knocking on our door asking to use the form based code in other projects and to that effect we are working to see how they would not necessarily use the Kaumakani Camp overlay, but how they can “spin up” a project in the same vein as well as looking at drafting a subdivision ordinance to essentially allow a plantation camp style development with in a residential area. Kaumakani Camp is a community through and through and it has got eighteen-foot-wide roads, not the forty-four foot county standard roads, it has got what would be...there are not lots on record, but would be three thousand square foot lots, which is not the five thousand square feet that our code currently requires. Our code right now prohibits plantation camp style subdivisions from happening and recognizing that this is a tried, tested, and very much used pattern of development. Reopening that back up, we do think it is appropriate, but ultimately it will be up to you folks because we need to introduce it, propose it, and then come back to you folks for your review.

Councilmember DeCosta: I am a big fan of this form-based code reactivation and have brought it to your attention a few times. There are other areas that have plantation dwellings that are still intact, I believe Kahili and Knudsen still have that going on. I believe there is a gentleman in Waimea who bought forty or seventy acres off of the parent company, Mr. Faye folks, they are relocating old plantation homes onto the property, so they are creating a plantation village. I noticed the Governor has a big push for teacher housing. Would we be able to work with these plantation style camps on the form-based code to put service-oriented position people in a home and would allow only those people to be in that zone. Medical field, teacher, firemen, police, service-oriented jobs that we need. Australia and New Zealand let no one come into their country unless they are a service-oriented person. Would you be able to anything with this form-based code with these landowners and allow them to show you their plan, possibly create...

Mr. Hull: Absolutely. The reason why some other areas have not been entertained is technically they are going to need a Land Use Commission amendment from agricultural to urban. Both Kaumakani Camp and Kaumakani Avenue had that in place already, which is why it could work immediately to get the overlay. The County of Kaua'i can do fifteen acres or lower. Anything over fifteen acres must go to the Land Use Commission and it does to the certain degree trigger all types of warning whistles for any landowner or developer. I can say there is a bill moving through the legislature right now that ups that amount beyond fifteen acres for the county itself to do, but there is very much a tie to 100% affordable housing. From a land use perspective, it is hard to restrict on professions or individuals or categories of people. Along with the Housing Agency, they are allowed to do preferential treatments and preferential analysis, whether or not we can do that within a land use context...not to say the package cannot be done, but within a zoning ordinance, I do not believe so. That is another thing I would need to defer to the Office of the County Attorney, because whenever we have asked, it has been, “You can work it through the grants, loans, programs, and subsidies,” but generally we have had our hand slapped out of...

Councilmember DeCosta: Planning Director, you know better than I do that all those four (4) professions that I mentioned: schoolteacher, medical field, police, and fire, they do not qualify for low-income housing.

Mr. Hull: Yes.

Councilmember Cowden: If the land was on state land right next to the school, like for Kōloa Elementary School, there is some state land next to that, like workforce housing the way plantation camp is, you work for the landowner, they landowner is the state, the teachers work for the state.

Mr. Hull: Correct.

Councilmember Cowden: So it seems like there should be some way to figure that one out.

Mr. Hull: Oh, no, absolutely, I was just trying to say that from a land use ordinance, it is hard to restrict it, that is why you often hear me or Marie come in and go, "Affordable by design," because we are designing one thousand one hundred (1,100) square foot houses on a three thousand square foot lot, for the most part the speculated market does not want it. I am just saying that from a land use perspective, it is a little bit hard, but from a landowner perspective, from a program perspective, preferential treatments can definitely be folded in.

Councilmember Cowden: And in this case, that would be rentals, and so those teachers who would end up in the school, I am just using your example, into the housing that is right next to the school on state land, after they mature a bit and they can afford to buy a house, well then they can live somewhere else, but in the meantime, that keeps all those houses available for the teachers. If we put that up for sale, then pretty soon it is not going to be teacher housing.

Councilmember Carvalho: I wanted to touch on the Climate Action Plan. You finished the first phase and you are moving into the second phase?

Mr. Hull: We are moving into the outreach phase. The second part of the phase was the open houses where we went around the island just getting raw input from community members' concerns about climate resiliency. We are entering very shortly in a couple of months, we will start our deep dive community workshops to look at very specific climate hazards in specific areas to look at ways in which the communities can strategize with us to mitigate those impacts.

Councilmember Carvalho: (Inaudible).

Mr. Hull: Yes, it is going to be a very robust community outreach.

Councilmember Carvalho: I noticed that you had a youth portion in there, how did that go?

Ms. Williams: It was really important to involve youth, especially the impacts of climate change will definitely be on the shoulders of our youth. There was a youth summit that we held last year with the help of OED and we had about 50 youth and how we define youth is anyone under age 25, but it was mostly middle-school students, high school students who came, and we had interactive activities. They were able to give input and share their thoughts on climate change and hazards. We also have someone who is focused on youth outreach. There has been a lot of classroom activities going to present at schools and they even developed a game to engage young children in learning about climate change. Even now, we are still thinking of ways to further involve youth as we get closer to the final plan.

Councilmember Carvalho: That is good and you continue to move forward, right?

Ms. Williams: Yes.

Mr. Hull: I will just add to that climate resiliency is important in it of itself, absolutely from the Planning perspective we put so much of our built environment in hazardous areas that are now going to be that much more impacted by the hazardous association climate change to highway runups to storm intensity and frequency. I would also like to make sure that we are in budget to draw the attention to the fact that the Climate Adaptation Plan, we found a very close ally in Reiko in that having discussions with her and her office prior to spinning to proposal up that companies like bond rating companies were beginning to come down hard on municipalities that did not have a strategic plan on how to adapt to a changing climate. This is not tied to very much of a land use side, but it is also a budget implication on it as well in our ability to qualify for bonds.

Councilmember Cowden: Were you going to give us a new ask?

Mr. Hull: Oh, no. I am ready for the ask part.

Council Chair Rapozo: It is hidden someplace in this budget.

Mr. Hull: It is a very small ask. The percentage on the line items, we are asking for an 18,000% increase on this one line item of equipment, which is because we do not have equipment. We are asking for a trailer that cost up to \$18,000. That is the only ask we really have in this budget. The trailer is primarily to be used to our outreach program, as well as our placemaking program in which we are working with communities to do things like place streets, as well as implement some of our strategic plans, long-range visions for areas, but on a quick, somewhat temporary approach to test some of these areas out. The primary function is really with Marie's shop and outreach and Marie being able to have the equipment, resources, and tools available for outreach. Whether it is for the long-range plans like the East Kaua'i Community Plan or the Climate Adaptation

Plan, or when someone like DOH knocks on our door and says, "We got \$50,000, it can be used for quick build, can you assemble something in the next two (2) weeks and get it out there." Right now, not really. We are pounding on doors asking if we can get the cones from Parks, can we get this equipment from Public Works, so just having this trailer with equipment, a lot of it could already be provided by DOH to immediately access the community.

Councilmember Cowden: Yes, \$18,000 does not sound like that much, but I remember when we did the Climate Adaptation thing in Kilauea, the wind blew and broke a brand-new television. Would it be where these people would come in, you have all your screens set up or is it more like orange cones? What goes in there?

Ms. Williams: I think both. We do not have...it would depend...there are different designs of trailers, but definitely we have a road show and this should be a much easier means of taking it on the road, but also, yes, this would allow us to do some outreach in the trailer, I am not sure, but facilitate all the different types of outreach we do.

Councilmember Cowden: Okay, so you would load it, reload it, or is this loaded?

Mr. Hull: For the most part it would be loaded. If we are able to set it up so that the trailer can be used as an event space itself, then we would unload the trailer and use that as an event space.

Councilmember Cowden: Kilauea was a good example of wind.

Council Chair Rapozo: Are there further questions for the Planning Department?

Councilmember Kualii: On page 82, the position listings, Position No. 2009 Planner IV.

Mr. Hull: This is the vacancy?

Councilmember Kualii: Planner IV, has been vacant for a long time. Under recruitment, it says continuous.

Mr. Hull: Position No. 2009. Over the past couple of years, we had about five (5) Planner vacancy positions and we have been recruiting under Planner I, II, III, and IV. Over the time, we have been able to secure two (2) planners, one in the Long-Range Division and one in the Regulatory Division. We still are working with these other two (2) planner positions filled. One is for the Open Space Commission and this one you are looking at is in the Regulatory Division. That has not been filled but we are actually anticipating filling that one come July 1st.

Councilmember Kuali'i: Planner V, Regulatory, Position No. 2008, that is dollar-funded.

Mr. Hull: Yes, when I was hired on, I negotiated with the Mayor and the Planning Commission to establish return rights and so that is just my civil service position.

Councilmember Kuali'i: Okay, Position No. 9754, Planner IV.

Mr. Hull: That is the Open Space Planner. We did get some hits on that several months ago. We did interviews, we did in fact offer the position three (3) months ago...in November, so five (5) months ago, and ultimately that candidate declined. This is the Open Space Commission, and so it is essentially a program in it of itself. The deputy director has been really holding it together with duct tape. You folks had a couple proposals come before you in the past year, which were approved. There is one that is particularly near and dear to a councilmember's heart that she is working with, but that position generally needs a higher-level planner to be able to really run it. It is the agenda, it is the commission, it is a whole program. We are coming to the realization that we just may not be able to get that person and so looking at having to downgrade the planner from a Planner IV to a Planner I, where that person will spend several years on training to lead the commission, is more than likely what we are going to have to do in the next month or two if we do not get anymore hits.

Councilmember Kuali'i: If you do not think you can fill it, then adjust the budget accordingly, especially if it is a lower level position as well.

Mr. Hull: Yes.

Councilmember DeCosta: Does this position, you cannot fill it because...and I am going to talk out loud, the qualifications, they need to do their job, your money does not reflect to hire them, correct?

Mr. Hull: I think that is one aspect.

Councilmember DeCosta: Low pay, right?

Mr. Hull: That is part of it. At that level the pay is decent. I will be honest, I saw positions that, yes, the pay is insanely low for the market. This pay is decent. It is just that what the market is reflecting right now is...the job market is hot and particularly in this industry...

Councilmember DeCosta: If you had jurisdiction over that set pay scale, you could entice the person you want?

Mr. Hull: Absolutely.

Councilmember DeCosta: I noticed in this budget, we have a few positions that I believe are not union positions, I think it falls under the Mayor's Administration and he has it in different departments. Would you benefit by having one of these positions in your department. That is all I am asking.

Mr. Hull: I could. I am just careful in reflecting that because while the person that held this position before was extremely qualified and had been in the county a fair amount of time. They worked and understood the system. I definitely believe that appointed positions do serve a purpose. In the Open Space Commission, it is a long-run program in that they get \$900,000 a year, and that is a lot of money, but in the acquisition of coastal properties, getting \$900,000 a year and sitting on it for six (6), \$6,000,000 does not go that far in acquiring say a coastal...

Councilmember DeCosta: Can I correct you real quick? Can I provide you with constructive information right now, it is not coastal acquisition, my friend. It is *mauka* to *makai*. I sat on that board in 2003, we fought A&B for *mauka* access that we never got and now they have a subdivision that some mainlanders bought, and now the parcels all connect, but there are no roads or the access people wanted. Remember, open space is *mauka* to *makai*.

Mr. Hull: Definitely.

Councilmember DeCosta: And why I made the presumption of having a Mayor Assistant under his administration gives you that ability to pay that person a little more, if you need that person. I have seen it done in different departments. Council Chair Rapozo pointed out a few of them. Let us know if you need that help.

Mr. Hull: Thank you.

Councilmember Cowden: What was the reason the person declined the job?

Mr. Hull: I know they inquired to see if we could pay for housing cost, which we could not.

Councilmember Cowden: So, that is housing, as much as anything else.

Mr. Hull: Ultimately, to Councilmember DeCosta's point, salary was an issue.

Councilmember Cowden: I understand, too, when we bring a brand-new person in and we give them more than they might be getting compared to existing planners who have worked hard and are doing a really good job, and so that demoralizes the more experienced people. In the case of Open Space, I do not want to say it is not as important as long-range planning, but it is like you are saying we might make the purpose every other year, where long-range planning is right at the jugular of what is important. I get where there are nuances and difficulty in just beefing up one salary space.

Councilmember Kualii: Looking at position types. What is the EM-5, one, two, three, and EM-3 versus all of the other SRs?

Mr. Hull: They are division chiefs.

Councilmember Kualii: The SRs are...

Mr. Hull: Civil Service employees.

Councilmember Kualii: The EMs are...

Mr. Hull: Essentially, they are the division chiefs, they are not part of an actual bargaining contract.

Councilmember Kualii: Are they civil service?

Mr. Hull: Technically, they are civil service, yes.

MYLES HIRONAKA, Program Manager: Those positions are excluded managerial.

Councilmember Kualii: Excluded. So, that is not the same as the appointees, right?

Mr. Hironaka: No, they are not the same. They are still civil service.

Councilmember Kualii: Civil service and not in the bargaining unit.

Mr. Hironaka: Yes, that is correct.

Councilmember Kualii: The last two (2) questions I have on the vacancies are...and they are federally funded positions, one not vacant that long, Land Use Permit Technician, Position No. 2001, a month and a half. It says, "Test scheduled on March 22," did that happen and is that position being filled?

Mr. Hironaka: We had a referral for one (1) candidate, so we may be looking at that person. This is a grant funded position.

Councilmember Kualii: What kind of grant is that? Federal?

Mr. Hironaka: Yes.

Councilmember Kualii: So, that is the same thing for this last position, Position No. 2017, Account Clerk.

Mr. Hironaka: Yes, that is correct.

Councilmember Kualii: The update from Position No. 328, Vacancy Report said “list established,” so where are you at with that recruitment and will the person be hired and in place by July 1st?

Mr. Hull: We did the interview, wonderful candidate, ultimately declined the offer, so we are back out.

Councilmember DeCosta: I want to make a financial observation, I did it with OED and I want to do it now. I noticed you have five (5) employees that make over \$100,000 in your office, and the sixth employee makes \$99,100. You got quite a bit of important people getting paid pretty much important money, so I only hear good things about your division, but I accept it, because that is what we do. We pay your people good salaries, they do a good job.

Mr. Hull: Absolutely.

Council Chair Rapozo: Okay. Are there any other questions for the Planning Department? We will recess until tomorrow morning at 9:00 a.m. Thank you.

There being no objections, the meeting recessed at 4:17 p.m.